

« YOU SHALL ONLY SET OUT FOR THREE MOSQUES »

A STUDY OF AN EARLY TRADITION

« You shall only set out for three mosques : The Sacred Mosque (in Mecca), my mosque (in Medina) and al-Aqṣā mosque » (in Jerusalem)¹, this well-known tradition of the Prophet licensed the pil-

¹ Literally : « The saddles (of the riding beasts) shall not be fastened (for setting out for pilgrimage) except for three mosques » ... *lā tushaddu l-riḥālu illā ilā thalāthati masājida : ilā l-masjidi l-ḥarāmi wa-masjidi hādhā wa-l-masjidi l-aqṣā*. Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal : *Musnad*, ed. Aḥmad Muḥ. Shākir, Cairo 1953, XII, 177, no. 7191, 241 no. 7248 with a version *tushaddu l-riḥālu*; and see the references given by the editor ad no. 7191; Muḥ. Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī : *al-Lu'lu' u wa-l-marjān fīmā 'ttafaqa 'alayhi l-Shaykhān*, Cairo 1949, II, 97, no. 882; 'Abd al-Razzāq : *al-Muṣannaḥ*, Ms. Murad Molla 604, ff. 39b-40a with the following *isnāds* : Ma'mar (died 153 AH) > al-Zuhri (died 124 AH) > Ibn al-Musayyab (died 94 AH) > Abū Hurayra; Ibn Jurayj (died 150 AH) > 'Amr b. Dinār (died 126 AH) > Ṭalq b. Ḥabīb (died circa 100 AH) > Ibn 'Umar; Ibn Jurayj > Naḍra b. Abī Naḍra (with the version : *lā tu'malu l-maṣīyyu*); Ibn Ḥajar : *Bulūgh al-marām min adillati l-aḥkām*, ed. Muḥ. Hāmid al-Fiqqi, Cairo 1933, p. 287, no. 1408; al-Muttaqī al-Hindī : *Kanz al-'ummāl*, Hyderabad 1965, XIII, 233, no. 1307 : *lā tushaddu riḥālu l-maṣīyyi ilā masjidin yudhkaru llāhu fihi illā...* The combined tradition contains recommendations of the Prophet in connection with the times of prayer, fasting and prohibition concerning women travelling unaccompanied; ib., p. 234, no. 1310 : *innamā yusāfaru ilā thalāthati masājida : masjidī l-Ka'bati wa-masjidi wa-masjidi Iliyā*; in an additional utterance the Prophet states that a prayer in his mosque (i.e. in Medina) is more liked by God than a thousand prayers elsewhere except in the mosque of the Ka'ba.; ib., p. 235, no. 1318; p. 170, no. 955; p. 172, no. 966; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Durr al-manthūr*, Cairo 1314 AH, IV, 161; al-Zarkashī : *I'lām al-sājid bi-aḥkām al-masājid*, ed. Muṣṭafā al-Marāghī, Cairo 1358 AH, pp. 208, 268, 288, 388; al-Subkī : *Shifā'u l-saqām fi ziyārati khayri l-anām*, Hyderabad 1952, pp. 117-124, 140; al-Wāsiṭī : *Fadā'ilu l-bayti l-muqaddas*, Ms. Acre, f. 37b-38a; al-Bayhaqī : *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, Hyderabad 1352 AH, V, 244; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḡhir*, Cairo 1330 AH, II, 200, 1.8; al-Shaukānī : *Nayl al-auṭār*, Cairo 1347 AH, VIII, 211; Ibn al-Najjār : *al-Durra al-thamīna fi ta'rīkh al-Madīna*, appended to al-Fāsi's *Shifā' al-gharām*, Cairo 1956, II, 357; al-Samhūdī : *Wafā' al-wafā bi akhbār dār al-muṣṭafā*, Cairo 1326 AH, I, 294; al-Ghazālī : *Iḥyā' ulūm al-dīn*, Cairo 1933, I, 219; Ibn Taymiyya : *Majmū'at al-rasā'il al-kubrā (fi ziyārati bayti l-maqdisi)*, Cairo 1323 AH, II, 53, 55; id. : *Tafsīr sūratī l-ikhhlāṣ*, Cairo 1323 AH, pp. 121, 124; id. : *Minhāj al-sunnati l-mabawiyya fi naqdi kalāmi l-shi'ati l-qadariyya*, ed. Muḥ. Rashād Sālim, Cairo 1964, II, 340; Muḥ. al-Dīn : *al-Uns al-jalīl bi-ta'rīkh al-Quds wa-l-Khalīl*, Cairo 1283 AH, I, 205; Aḥmad b. 'Abd al-Ḥamid al-

grimage to the mosques of Medina and Jerusalem in addition to the obligatory *hajj* and *'umra* to Mecca. A vivid controversy arose over the authenticity of this tradition which grants, as it does, an exceptional position to Medina and Jerusalem².

This *ḥadīth* is in fact a restricting one and seems to imply the prohibition of pilgrimage and visit to mosques and sacred places other than those indicated. The custom of such pilgrimage apparently had its origin at a very early period and was already in vogue in the second century. In the course of the fierce polemics concerning the permission of journey to visit the tomb of the Prophet, the minor sanctuaries and the graves of prophets and saints, this *ḥadīth* was closely studied and analyzed and became the pivot of the discussion which lasted through many centuries. The crucial point was to establish the meaning and the intention of the initial phrase of the sentence: *lā tushaddu l-riḥālu illā ilā...* «the saddles shall not be fastened (for journey) except for»... As the exception is of the kind of *al-istithnā'* *al-mufarragh* in which the general term is not expressed — the partisans

'Abbāsī: *'Umdat al-akhbār fi madīnat al-mukhtār*, ed. As'ad al-Ṭarābẓūnī, Alexandria, n.d., p. 72; al-Nuwayrī: *Nihāyat al-arab fi funūn al-adab*, Cairo 1925, I, 327; Ch. D. Matthews: *The Kit. Bā'itu-n-nufūs of Ibnu-l-Firkāh*, JPOS, XV (1935), p. 54 (id.: *Palestine-Mohammedan Holy Land*, New-Haven 1949, p. 10); Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī: *Muthīr al-gharām fi ziyārati l-Qudsi wa-l-Shām*, Ms. Damascus, Zāhiriyya, Ta'riḫ 720, p. 133; Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī: *Ithāf al-akhiṣṣā bi-faḍā'ili l-masjidi l-aqṣā*, Ms. Hebrew Univ., f. 7a; Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī: *Qūt al-qulūb*, Cairo 1932, III, 182; Taqī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Malik b. Abi l-Munā, 'Ubayd al-Ḍarīr: *Nuzhatu l-nāẓirīn*, Cairo 1308 AH, p. 98 sup.; Ibrāhīm al-Samnūdi al-Manṣūri: *Sa'adat al-dārayn fi l-radd 'alā l-firqatayn al-wahhabiyyati wa-l-muqallidati l-zāhiriyya*, Cairo 1319 AH, pp. 120-21, id.: *Nuṣratu l-imāmi l-Subkī bi-raddi l-ṣārimi l-munkī*, Cairo, n.d., Maṭba'at al-jumhūr, pp. 36, 161, 182, 191; al-Dārimī: *Sunan*, al-Madīna 1966, I, 271, no. 1428; al-Khaṭṭābī: *Ma'ālim al-sunan*, Ḥalab 1933, II, 222; al-Jarrāḥī: *Kashf al-khafā' wa-muzīl al-ilbās 'ammā 'shtahara min al-aḥādīth 'alā alsinati l-nās*, Cairo 1352 AH, II, 354, no. 3016.; al-Nasā'ī: *Sunan*, Cairo 1930, II, 37; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Khafāji: *Nasim al-Riyāḍ fi sharḥ shifā' l-qāḍi 'Iyād*, Istanbul, 1315 AH., III, 580; al-Ghayṭī: *Qiṣṣat al-isrā' wa-l-mi'rāj*, Būlāq 1295 AH, p. 18.; al-Qaṣṭallānī: *Irshād al-sārī*, Cairo 1326 AH, III, 239, 244.

² I. Goldziher: *Muhammedanische Studien*, Halle 1890, II, 35-36; S.D. Goitein: *The sanctity of Jerusalem and Palestine in early Islam, Studies in Islamic History and Institutions*, Leiden 1966, pp. 135-148; J. Fück: *Die Rolle des Traditionalismus im Islam*, ZDMG, xciii (1939), pp. 23-24; Muḥ. Zubayr Ṣiddīqi: *Hadīth Literature*, Calcutta University Press, 1961, p. xxvi; W. Caskel: *Der Felsendom und die Wallfahrt nach Jerusalem*, Köln und Opladen 1936, pp. 25-26, notes 36, 38; A.A. Duri: *al-Zuhri*, BSOAS XIX, pp. 10-11; id.: *Bahth fi nash'ati 'ilmi l-ta'riḫi 'inda l-'arab*, Beirut 1960, p. 99; Muḥ. 'Ajjāj al-Khaṭīb: *al-Sunna qabla l-tadwīn*, Cairo 1963, pp. 501-514; Muṣṭafā al-Sibā'ī: *al-Sunna wamakānatuhā fi l-tashri'i l-islamiyyi*, Cairo 1961, pp. 399-402.

of the prohibition of journeys to the grave of the Prophet and to minor sanctuaries maintained that the *ḥadīth* should be interpreted as « do not set out for *any place* except for the three mosques ». Those who approved of such pilgrimages argued that the meaning of the phrase was « do not set out for *any mosque* except for the three mosques. » As they considered the general term from which exception is made to be « mosques » they concluded that the faithful should set out — as regards mosques (for the purpose of prayer and devotion) — only for these three mosques; for other sanctuaries there is no reservation ³.

³ Al-Subkī, *op. cit.*, p. 118 seq... *Fa-lam anna ḥādḥā l-istithnā'a mufarraghun, taqdī-ruhu lā tushaddu l-riḥālu ilā masjidin illā ilā l-masājidi l-thalāthati, au lā tushaddu l-riḥālu ilā makānin illā ilā l-masājidi l-thalāthati...*, and see *ib.* p. 121... *fa-naqala imāmu l-ḥaramayni 'an shaykhihi annahu kāna yuḥfi bi-l-man'i 'an shaddi l-riḥāli ilā ghayri ḥādhihi l-masājidi. qāla: wa-rubbamā kāna yaqūlu « yukrahu », wa-rubbamā kāna yaqūlu « yuḥarramu »...*; al-Ghazālī, *op. cit.*, I, 219... *wa-qad dhahaba ba'ḍu l-'ulamā'i ilā l-istidlāli bi-ḥādḥā l-ḥadīthi fi l-man'i min al-riḥlati li-ziyāratī l-mashāhidi wa qubūri l-'ulamā'i wa-l-ḡulaḥā'i...*; *ib.*, II, 219... *wa-yadkhulu fi jumlatihī ziyāratu qubūri l-anbiyā'i 'alayhimu l-salāmu wa-ziyāratu qubūri l-ṣaḥābati wa-l-tābi'ina wa-sā'iri l-'ulamā'i..... wa-yajūzu shaddu l-riḥāli li-ḥādḥā l-gharaḍi wa-lā yamna'u min ḥādḥā qauluhu 'alayhi l-salāmu: lā tushaddu l-riḥālu... li-anna dhālika fi l-masājidi fa-innahā mutamāthilatuln ba'da ḥādhihi l-masājidi... .. wa-ammā l-biqā'u fa-lā ma'nā li-ziyāratihā siwā l-masājidi l-thalāthati wa-siwā l-thughūri li-l-ribā'i biḥā...; Aḥmad b. Ḥajar al-Haythami: *al-Jawhar al-munazzam fi ziyāratī l-qabri l-sharifi l-mu'azzam*, Cairo 1331 AH, pp. 13-14; al-'Abdari, *al-Madkhal*, Cairo, 1929, I, 256; al-Shaukāni *op. cit.*, VIII, 212: ... *wa-qad tamassaka bi-ḥādḥā l-ḥadīthi man mana'a l-safara wa-shadda l-raḥli ilā ghayriḥā min ghayri farqin bayna jamā'i l-biqā'i...; Abū Bakr al-Ṭurṭuṣhī: Kitāb al-ḥawādith wa-l-bida'*, ed. Muḥammad al-Ṭālibi, Tunis 1959, p. 98 ... *wa-lā yu'tā shay'un min al-masājidi yu'taqadu fihī l-faḍlu ba'da l-thalāthati masājida illā masjidu Qubā'a... fa-ammā siwāhu min al-masājidi fa-lam asma' 'an aḥadin annahu atāhā rākiban wa-lā mā-shiyan kamā atā Qubā'a, and see ib.*, p. 147-48 ... *thumma ra'ā (i.e. 'Umar) al-nāsa yadhhabūna madhāhibu fa-qāla: ayna yadhhabu ḥā'ulā'i, fa-qāla: yā amira l-mu'minīna, masjidun ṣallā fihī l-nabiyyu (ṣ) fa-hum yuṣallūna fihī, fa-qāla: innamā halaka man kāna qablakum bi-mithli ḥādḥā, kānū yattabi'ūna ālhāra anbiyā'ihim wa-yattakhidhūnahā masājida wa-biḡa'an...; and see the preceding tradition: Abū l-Maḥāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī: *al-Mu'taşar min al-mukhtaṣar min mushkil al-āthār*, Hyderabad 1362 AH, I, 26; Ibn Taymiyya: *Minhāj al-sunnati al-nabawiyya*, I, 336 and al-Shāṭibi: *al-ʿIṭīṣām*, Cairo, Maṭba'at al-sā'ada, n.d., I, 346; Ibn Taymiyya: *Tafsīr sūratī l-ikhlāṣ*, p. 120; *id.*: *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 55 ... *wa-law nadhara l-safara ilā qabri l-Khalīlī 'alayhi l-salāmu au qabri l-nabiyyi (ṣ) au ilā l-Ṭūri l-ladhī kallama llāhu 'alayhi Mūsā 'alayhi l-salāmu, au ilā jabali Ḥirā'a l-ladhī kāna l-nabiyyu ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallama yata'abbadu fihī wa-jā'ahu l-waḥyu fihī, au al-ghāri l-madhkūri fi l-qur'āni, au ghayri dhālika min al-maqābiri wa-l-maqāmāti wa-l-mashāhidi l-muḍāfati ilā ba'ḍi l-anbiyā'i wa-l-mashāyikhi au ilā ba'ḍi l-maghārāti, au al-jibālī — lam yajibi l-waḥū'u bi-ḥādḥā l-nadhri bi-'ittifāqi l-'immati l-arba'ati fa-inna l-safara ilā ḥādhihi l-mawāḍi'i manhiyyun 'anhu li-nahyi***

They could in fact quote a *ḥadīth* in which they could find a convincing proof of their argument : *lā tushaddu riḥālu l-maḥīyyi ilā masjidin yudhkaru llāhu fihi illā ilā thalāthati masājida...* «the saddles of the riding beasts shall not be fastened (for their journey) to a mosque in which God is invoked except to the three mosques »...⁴ Even more explicit in favour of this view is another *ḥadīth* : *lā yanbaghī li-l-muṣallī an yashudda riḥālahu ilā masjidin yabghī fihi l-ṣalāta ghayra l-masjidi l-ḥarāmi wa-l-masjidi l-aqṣā wa-masjidī hādhā.* « It is not proper that a man praying set out for a mosque in which he seeks to pray except the mosque of the Ḥarām, the mosque al-Aqṣā and my mosque ».⁵ It is evident that these traditions confirm the view that the three mosques are to be preferred in comparison with other mosques; one shall set out for these mosques to gain the benefit of prayer and devotion; but he is permitted, and it is even recommended to him, to set out for other sanctuaries which are not mosques.

The close observation of the *ḥadīth* about the three mosques is illustrated by a curious story reported by al-Wāsiṭī⁶ : Sa'īd b. 'Abd al-'Azīz used to visit the Miḥrāb Da'ūd⁷ on foot; only on his return he used to ride. When asked about it he answered : I was told that 'Abdallah b. 'Abdallah used to set out for the mosque of Qubā'⁸ riding a horse without a saddle; (this he used to do because) he considered that fastening the girth of the saddle of the horse was like fastening the saddles of the riding beasts which is mentioned (scil. as forbidden) according to the tradition : « you shall not fasten the saddles... except for three mosques »...

G. E. von Grunebaum characterizes this *ḥadīth* as an « earlier battle, long since abandoned, which the theologians fought against the cult of those minor sanctuaries »⁹. This battle was in fact an early one.

l-nabiyyi (ṣ) : lā tushaddu... etc.; al-Samnūdī al-Manṣūrī : *Sa'ādat al-dārayn*, p. 120 seq.; 'Alī Maḥfūz : *al-Idā' fi maḍārri l-ibtidā'*, Cairo, Maṭba'at al-istiḳāma, 4th ed., pp. 194-96.

⁴ Al-Samnūdī al-Manṣūrī : *Sa'ādat al-dārayn*, p. 121 sup.

⁵ *Ib.*; but see the interpretation of this *ḥadīth* given by Ibn Taymiyya in al-Qaṣṭallānī, *Irshād al-sāri* III, 240 (he forbids the journey to the grave of the Prophet on the ground of this *ḥadīth*).

⁶ Al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 47a.

⁷ On Miḥrāb Dā'ūd see Ibn. Ḥauqal : *Ṣūrat al-arḍ*, ed. J.H. Kramers, Leiden 1938, I, 171; Mujīr al-Dīn, *op. cit.*, pp. 227, 302, 366-67, 407.

⁸ See on the mosque of Qubā' : al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, II, 16-28.

⁹ G.E. von Grunebaum : *The sacred character of Islamic cities, Mélanges Taha Husain*, ed. Adburrahman Badawi, Cairo 1962, p. 27.

Mālik b. Anas records in his *Muwattaʿa*¹⁰ a story about a discussion between Abū Hurayra and Kaʿb (al-Aḥbār) concerning the question at what hour on Friday God fulfils the wishes of the faithful. This discussion took place when Abū Hurayra met Kaʿb on his pilgrimage to al-Ṭūr. In a parenthetical passage Malik reports thāt Abū Hurayra on his return was rebuked by Baṣra b. Abī Baṣra¹¹ who told him : « Had I met you before you went out (scil. to al-Ṭūr) you would not have set out; I heard the Prophet saying: the riding beasts shall be driven only to three mosques... etc. »¹². A similar tradition (in which the name of Abū Hurayra is however not mentioned) is recorded by ʿAbd al-Razzāq¹³ in his *Muṣannaḥ*¹⁴: a man who returned from a journey to al-Ṭūr was reproached and reminded of the utterance of the Prophet about the three mosques. Another tradition records a talk between ʿArfaja and Ibn ʿUmar. Ibn ʿUmar, when consulted by ʿArfaja about a journey to al-Ṭūr, answered: You shall only set out for three mosques, the mosque of Mecca, the mosque of the Prophet (i.e. Medina) and the mosque al-Aqṣā; abandon al-Ṭūr and do not go there¹⁵.

Commentators are agreed that by al-Ṭūr in these traditions Mt. Sinā is meant¹⁶. Mt. Sinā was in fact regarded as a sacred place.

¹⁰ Mālik B. Anas: *al-Muwattaʿa*, Cairo, Maṭbaʿat Dār Iḥyāʾ l-Kutub l-ʿArabiyya, n.d., I, 130-133.

¹¹ See on him Ibn Ḥajar: *al-Iṣāba*, Cairo 1323 AH, I, 167, no. 713, 714 and II, 41, no. 1845 (recorded by ʿAbd al-Razzaq as Naḍra b. Abī Naḍra; see note 1, above); al-Suyūṭī: *Isʿāf al-Mubattaʿa* p. 8 (appended to Mālik's *Muwattaʿa* with Suyūṭī's *Tanwir al-ḥawālik*, quoted in the preceding note); al-Zurqānī: *Sharḥ ʿalā Muwattaʿa* Mālik, Cairo 1936, I, 224; Abū ʿUbayd: *Gharīb al-ḥadīth*, Hyderabad 1966, III, 23, note 6.

¹² See this tradition al-Nasāʾī: *Sunan*, Cairo 1930, III, 113-116; al-Zurqānī: *Sharḥ ʿalā Muwattaʿa* Mālik, I, 222-225 (about al-Ṭūr: « *wa-huwa lladhī kullima fihī Mūsā wa-huwa lladhī ʿanā Abū Hurayra* »); Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr: *al-Istiʿāb*, ed. Muh. al-Bijāwī, Cairo, n.d., I, 184; ʿAbd al-Qādir al-Jilānī: *al-Ghunya*, Cairo 1322 AH, II, 70; and see Helga Hemgesberg: *Abū Hurayra*, Frankfurt am Main 1965, p. 105 (with references given by the author); and see al-Samnūdī: *Nuṣratu al-imām al-Subkī*, p. 1912, discussing the following comment: — *wa-li-ḥādḥā fahima l-ṣaḥābatu min nahyihī an yusāfara ilā ḡayri l-masājidi l-thalāthati anna l-safara ilā Ṭūri Sināʾa ḍākkhilum fī l-nahyi wa-in lam yakun masjidan...*; and see *ib.*, p. 192: — *al-ṣalāt fī l-Ṭūr*.

¹³ See on him Brockelmann, GAL, S. I, 333; F. Sezgin: *Geschichte des arabischen Schrifttums*, Leiden 1967, I, 99; al-Dhahabī: *Mizān al-iʿtidāl*, II, 609, no. 5044;

¹⁴ ʿAbd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b.

¹⁵ *Ib.*, f. 40a.

¹⁶ See e.g. note 12 above; but see al-Harawī: *al-Ishārāt ilā maʿrifati l-ziyārāt*, ed. Janine Sourdél-Thomine, Damas 1953, p. 21, 11. 16-17.

According to Muslim tradition the Prophet was instructed by the angel Jibril to pray there during his night journey to Jerusalem¹⁷. At the « *laylat al-qadr* » the angels will hoist their flags in four mosques : the mosque of Mecca, the mosque of the Prophet, the mosque of Jerusalem and at Tūr Sinā.¹⁸ Ibn Taymiyya stresses that the journey to Mt. Sinā is forbidden on the ground of the utterance of the Prophet about the exclusiveness of the journey to the three mosques¹⁹.

By the beginning of the second century there seems to have already been a unanimity of the Muslim community about the sanctity of these three mosques and consequently about the sanctity of these three cities; this is later reflected in the rich literature concerning the virtues of these cities.

There appear, however, to have existed earlier trends which aimed at emphasizing the sanctity of Mecca, or the sanctity of both Mecca and Medina, while minimizing that of Jerusalem. These trends are reflected in some early traditions, only partly preserved in the canonical collections of *ḥadīth*. These traditions which probably preceded the Muslim consensus regarding the *ḥadīth* of the three mosques will be viewed in the following pages.

I

A tradition recorded on the authority of 'Ā'isha, the wife of the Prophet, mentions only two mosques : the mosque of Mecca and the mosque of Medina. The Prophet said according to this tradition : « I am the seal (*khātam*) of the prophets and my mosque is the seal of the mosques of the prophets. The mosques which deserve mostly to be visited and towards which the riding beasts should be driven are the mosque of Mecca and my mosque (i.e. the mosque of Medina). The prayer in my mosque is better than a thousand prayers in any other mosque except that of Mecca »²⁰.

¹⁷ See e.g. al-Wāsiṭi, *op. cit.*, f. 49b, 1.6 and f. 60a, penult. : ... *ṣallayta bi-Tūri Sinā ḥaythu kallama llāhu Mūsā ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallama* ... ; Ibn Kathīr: *Tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-'aẓīm*, Beirut 1966, IV, 245, 1.7; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 298.

¹⁸ 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jilāni, *op. cit.*, II, 14; 'Abd al-'Azīz al-Dīrīnī : *Ṭahārat al-qulūb*, Cairo 1354 AH, 124.

¹⁹ Ibn Taymiyya : *Majmū'at al-rasā'il* II, 55, 1. 3 : — *wa-law nadhara l-safara ilā... au ilā l-Tūri ladhī kallama 'llāhu 'alayhi Mūsā 'alayhi l-salām.* »

²⁰ al-Mundhirī : *al-Targhīb wa-l-tarhīb min al-ḥadīth al-sharīf*, ed. Muḥyī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd, Cairo 1961, III, 50, no. 1732; al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, *op. cit.*, XIII, 233, no. 1306; Ibn al-Najjār, *op. cit.*, II, 357; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 259; Ahmad b. 'Abd

An almost identical tradition is reported on the authority of Ṭāwūs²¹ : « You shall set out for two mosques : the mosque of Mecca and the mosque of Medina »²². The initial phrase of this tradition is almost identical with that of the tradition about the three mosques ; mention is however made in this tradition of two mosques only, those of Mecca and Medina. A similar tradition is recorded by al-Mundhirī : « The best mosque towards which the riding beasts should be driven is the mosque of Ibrāhīm (i.e. the mosque of Mecca) and my mosque »²³.

A significant tradition reported by Ibn Jurayj sheds some light on the attitude of certain Muslim scholars of the second century towards the pilgrimage to the three mosques. Ibn Jurayj records that Ibn 'Aṭā²⁴ reported a tradition recommending the pilgrimage to the three mosques and adds : « 'Aṭā' used to exclude (the mention of) the Aqṣā, but he reverted later to counting it with them » (*kāna 'Aṭā un yunkiru l-Aqṣā thumma 'āda fa-'addahu ma'ahā*)²⁵.

It is 'Aṭā' who was asked by Ibn Jurayj : « What (is your opinion) about a man who vowed to walk from Baṣra to Jerusalem ». He answered : « You were merely ordered (to pilgrimage to) this House (i.e. the Ka'ba)²⁶. Ṭāwūs, on whose authority the tradition about the two mosques was transmitted, bade people who vowed to journey to Jerusalem to set out for Mecca²⁷.

These traditions bear evidence to the fact that among scholars

al-Ḥamīd al-'Abbāsī : *op. cit.*, p. 73 ; *Juz' Abi l-Jahm al-'Alā' b. Mūsā*, Ms. Hebrew Univ., Majmū'a, p. 43, l. 3

²¹ See on him Ibn Ḥajar : *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, V, 8 ; al-Dhahabī : *Tadhkirat al-ḥuffāz* I, 90 ; al-Damīrī : *Ḥayāt al-ḥayawān*, Cairo 1963, II, 88-90 ; Ibn Khallikān : *Wafayāt al-a'yān*, ed. A.F. Rifā'i, Cairo 1936, VI, 303-305 ; Ibn Sa'd : *Ṭabaqāt*, Beirut 1957, V, 537-42.

²² 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b : *yurḥalu ilā masjidayni, masjidī Makkata wa-masjidī l-Madīnati*.

²³ Al-Mundhirī, *op. cit.*, III, 63, no. 1775 : *Khayru mā rukibat ilayhi l-rawāḥilu masjidu Ibrāhīma (s) wa-masjidī*. Two variants are recorded : *masjidī hādihā wa-l-baytu l-ma'mūru* and *masjidī hādihā wa-l-baytu l-'atīqu* ; and see the note of al-Mundhirī, *ib.*, inf. ; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḡhīr*, II, 10 sup. ; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 259 ; Aḥmad b. Ḥajar al-Haythamī, *op. cit.*, p. 41.

²⁴ See on him : Ibn Ḥajar : *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, VII, 483-84 ; al-Dhahabī : *Tadhkirat al-ḥuffāz*, I, 98 : 'Aṭā' b. Abi Rabbāh (died 115 AH ; Ibn Jurayj transmitted his traditions) ; Ibn Sa'd : *Ṭabaqāt*, Beirut 1957, V, 467-70.

²⁵ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b.

²⁶ *Id.*, *op. cit.*, Murad Molla 606, f. 40b, inf.

²⁷ *Ib.*, f. 41b.

of Islam in the first half of the second century there was some reluctance to give full recognition of sanctity to the third mosque and to grant Jerusalem an equal position with the two holy cities of Islam, Mecca and Medina.

This reluctance is plainly brought out in a series of traditions in which the Prophet is said to have advised the faithful to refrain from the journey to Jerusalem for prayer and to perform the prayer either in Mecca or in Medina. A tradition told on the authority of Jābir b. 'Abdallah²⁸ reports: A man²⁹ approached the Prophet at the day of the conquest of Mecca and said « O Messenger of God, I vowed to pray in Jerusalem if you conquer Mecca ». The Prophet then said: « Pray here ». The man asked him another time and the Prophet gave the same answer. He asked him a third time and the Prophet said: « Then the matter is at your disposal » (*fa-sha'naka idhan*)³⁰.

A very similar tradition is recorded on the authority of Abū Sa'īd (al-Khudrī)³¹. But whereas the preceding tradition stresses the preference of Mecca, this one puts Medina to the fore. A man came to the Prophet, it is told in the story, in order to take leave from him before setting out for his journey to Jerusalem. The Prophet told him that a prayer in his mosque (i.e. in Medina) would be better than a thousand prayers in another mosque except the mosque of Mecca. Some versions of this tradition mention the name of the man, al-Arḡam, but do not record the phrase about the mosque of Mecca³².

²⁸ Jābir b. 'Abdallah (died 78 AH). See on him al-Dhahabī: *Tadhkirat al-ḥuffāz*, I, 43; Ibn Ḥajar: *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, II, 42; al-Balādhurī: *Ansāb al-ashraf*, ed. Muḥ. Ḥamīdullāh, Cairo 1959, I, 248-49; al-Dhahabī: *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā'*, ed. As'ad Ṭalas, Cairo 1962, III, 126-29.

²⁹ According to the report of 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, Murad Molla 604, f. 37b, 41a and Ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī: *Majma' al-zawā'id*, Cairo 1353 AH, IV, 192, the name of the man was al-Sharīd. About al-Sharīd see Ibn Sa'd: *Ṭabaqāt* V, 113; Ibn Ḥajar: *al-Iṣāba* III, 204, no. 3887.

³⁰ Ibn Ḥajar: *Bulūgh al-marām*, p. 287, no. 1407; Abu Dā'ūd: *Ṣaḥīḥ sunan al-muṣṭafā*, Cairo 1348 AH, II, 79 with a variant to pray two rak'a; *ib.*, inf. another variant: « if you would pray here it would be counted (*ajza'a*) as much as the prayer in Jerusalem »; al-Shaukānī, *op. cit.*, VIII, 210 with a variant: *la-qaḏā 'anka dhātika kulla ṣalātin fī bayti l-maqdisi*; al-Tibrizī: *Mishkāṭ al-maṣābiḥ*, Karachi 1350 AH, p. 298; 'Abd al-Razzāq *op. cit.*, f. 41a; al-Subkī, *op. cit.*, pp. 94-95; al-Bayhaqī, *op. cit.*, X, 82; 'Abd al-Ghanī al-Nabulsi: *Dhakhā'ir al-mawāriṭh*, Cairo 1943, I, 145, no. 1324; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, p. 134.

³¹ See his biography in Ibn Ḥajar's *Iṣāba*, III, 85, no. 2189; al-Dhahabī: *Tadhkirat al-ḥuffāz*, I, 44.

³² Al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 295; Aḥmad b. Ḥajar al-Haythamī, *op. cit.*, p. 41; al-Dhahabī: *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā'*, ed. al-Abyārī, Cairo 1957, II, 342.

To this category of traditions belongs the story told about Maymūna the wife of the Prophet. A woman became ill and vowed to perform a pilgrimage to Jerusalem if she recovered. Having recuperated and prepared provisions for her journey she came to Maymūna to take her leave. Maymūna advised her to stay at Medina, to consume her provisions there and to fulfil her vow by praying in the mosque of the Prophet (in Medina). Maymūna quoted in this connection the utterance of the Prophet that a prayer in his mosque was better than a thousand prayers in any other mosque except that of the Ka'ba³³.

A story closely resembling the preceding tradition is told on the authority of Sa'id b. al-Musayyab³⁴. The story told about 'Umar is however in favour of Mecca, not of Medina. A man came to 'Umar asking permission to travel to Jerusalem. 'Umar ordered him to prepare his provisions. But when these were prepared 'Umar bade him to perform the *'umra* instead of going to Jerusalem³⁵.

The essential reason for the resistance of a group of Muslim scholars to grant license of pilgrimage to Jerusalem is plainly reflected in another story about 'Umar told on the authority of the same Sa'id b. al-Musayyab, who transmitted the preceding story; it is recorded by the early scholar of *ḥadīth*, 'Abd al-Razzaq b. Hammām in his *Muṣannaf*. According to this story, when 'Umar was in an enclosure of camels of *ṣadaqa* two men passed by. He asked them wherefrom they came and they answered that they had come from Jerusalem. 'Umar hit them with his whip and said: «(Have you performed) a pilgrimage like the pilgrimage of the Ka'ba»? They said: «No, o Commander of the faithful, we came from such and such a territory, we passed by it (scil. Jerusalem) and prayed there.» Then 'Umar said: «Then it is so», and let them go³⁶.

³³ Al-Bayhaqī, *op. cit.*, X, 83; al-Shaukānī, *op. cit.*, VIII, 210; *Juz' Abi l-Jahm al-'Alā'* b. *Mūsā*, Ms., p. 42; Shihāb al-Din al-Maḥḍīsi, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 134.

³⁴ See on him Ibn Khallikān, *op. cit.*, VI, 136-143; Ibn Ḥajar: *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, IV, 84-88; Abū Nu'aym al-Isfahānī: *Ḥilyat al-auliya'*, Cairo 1933, II, 161-173.

³⁵ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b.

³⁶ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b: 'Abd al-Razzāq > Ma'mar b. Rāshid > 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jazarī (died 127 AH; see on him Ibn Ḥajar: *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, VI, 373-75; Ibn 'Abd al-Barr: *Tajrīd al-tamhīd*, Cairo 1350 AH, p. 107) > Ibn al-Musayyab: *Baynā 'Umaru fī na'amīn min na'ami l-ṣadaqati marra bihi rajulāni, fa-qāla: min ayna ji'tumā, qālā: min al-bayti l-muqaddasi, fa-'alāhumā qarban bi-l-dirrati wa-qālā: ḥajjun ka-ḥajji l-bayti, qālā: yā amīra l-mu'minīna, innā ji'nā min arḍi kadhā wa-kadhā fa-mararnā bihi fa-ṣallaynā fīhi, fa-qāla: kadhālika idhan, fa-tarakahumā.*

The story shows clearly that Muslim scholars feared that Jerusalem might become a place of pilgrimage like Mecca and acquire a sanctity like that of Mecca. The two sanctuaries, that of Mecca and the one of Jerusalem are mentioned jointly in the verse of al-Farazdaq :

Wa-baytāni baytu llāhi nahnu wulātuhu :
wa-baytun bi-a'lā İliyā'a musharrafu

(To us belong) two Houses : the House of God, of which we are the governors : and the revered House in the upper (part of) İliyā'a (i.e. Jerusalem)³⁷.

This verse testifies to the veneration of these two sanctuaries at the end of the seventh century. It is significant that the two sanctuaries are referred to as being on the same level³⁸. This these scholars tried to prevent. Jerusalem could only be considered as a place of devotional prayer, a holy place endowed with special merits for pilgrims to Mecca ; but it could not be awarded the rank of Mecca and it never got it.

The reluctance to perform the pilgrimage to Jerusalem found its expression in some utterances reported on the authority of the Companions of the Prophet. ('Abdallah) b. Mas'ūd is stated to have said : « If (the whole distance) between me and Jerusalem were two parasangs I would not go there³⁹.

Mālik (b. Anas) refrained from coming to Jerusalem for fear that this may become a *sunna*⁴⁰.

The justification of this attitude which tried to diminish the importance of the pilgrimage to Jerusalem is found in a remarkable saying of al-Sha'bi⁴¹ : « Muḥammad, may God bless him, was only turned

³⁷ Al-Farazdaq : *Diwān*, ed. al-Şāwī, Cairo 1936, p. 566 ; *Naqā'id Jarir wa-l-Farazdaq*, ed. Bevan, Leiden 1905, p. 571.

³⁸ Comp. another verse of al-Farazdaq, *Diwān*, p. 619, composed in the first decade of the eighth century :

wa-bi-l-masjidi l-aqṣā l-imāmu 'lladhī 'htadā : bihi min qulūbi l-mumtarīna ḡalālūhā.

³⁹ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b, inf.: 'Abd al-Razzāq> al-Thaurī> Jābir> al-Sha'bi> Shaqīq (see on him Ibn Ḥajar : *Iṣāba* III, 225, no. 3977 ; id. : *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, IV, 361)> ('Abdallah) b. Mas'ūd : *lau kāna bayni wa-bayna bayti l-maqḏisi farsakhāni mā ataytuhu.*

⁴⁰ Al-Shāṭibī, *op. cit.*, I, 347 : *wa-qaḏ kāna Mālikun yakrahu l-majī'a ilā bayti l-maqḏisi khīfata an yuttakhadha dhālika sunnatan.*

⁴¹ See on him al-Dhahabī : *Tadhkirat al-huffāz*, I, 79-88 ; Ibn 'Asākir : *Ta'rikh*, ed. Ibn Badrān, Damascus, n.d., VII, 138-155 ; Ibn Ḥajar : *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, V, 69-61.

away from Jerusalem (i.e. from his first *qibla*) because of his anger.» A gloss added to this tradition states : « he means (anger with regards to Jerusalem » ⁴².

The son of Sa'd b. Abī Waqqāṣ, 'Āmir ⁴³ and his daughter 'Ā'isha ⁴⁴ reported on the authority of their father that he would like much more to pray in the mosque of Qubā' than in Jerusalem. ⁴⁵

'Umar is also said to have stated that he preferred one prayer in the mosque of Qubā' than four prayers in Jerusalem ⁴⁶.

The superiority of the mosque of Medina over al-Aqṣā was expressed by the Prophet himself. According to a tradition reported on the authority of Abū Hurayra, the Prophet was asked whether prayer in al-Aqṣā was better than prayer in his mosque (i.e. in Medina). The Prophet answered : « A prayer in my mosque is better than four prayers in it». (i.e. in al-Aqṣā) ⁴⁷.

A peculiar tradition attributed to the Prophet recommends to journey to three mosques only, exactly as in the tradition discussed

⁴² 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 40a, sup. : 'Abd al-Razzāq > al-Thaurī > Jābir : *sami'tu l-Sha'biyya yuqsimu bi- llāhi mā rudda Muḥammadun (s) 'an bayti l-maqdisi illā 'an sukhhīhi, ya'ni 'alā bayti l-maqdisi*. See al-Thaurī : *Tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-karīm*, Rampur 1965, ed. Imtiyāz 'Alī 'Arshī, p. 12 : Sufyān > Jābir al-Ju'fī, *qāla : aqsama bi- llāhi l-Sha'biyyu : mā rudda l-nabiyyu 'alā ahli bayti l-maqdisi illā bi-sukhhīhi 'alā ahli bayti l-maqdisi*. The text of this tradition is of course blurred and has to be corrected according to the record of *al-Muṣannaḥ*. The editor of al-Thaurī's *Tafsīr* remarks that he could not find this utterance in the compilations of *tafsīr* and *ḥadīth*. — comp. Ṭabari : *Tafsīr*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥ. Shākir and Aḥmad Muḥ. Shākir, Cairo, ca. 1960, III, 173 : *qāla ba'dukum : kariha qiblata bayti l-maqdisi min ajli anna l-yahūda qālū : yattabi'u qiblatanā wa-yukhālifu dinanā...*, al-Nuwayri, *op. cit.*, I, 329 :- *wa- khtalaḥū fi l-sababi ladhī kāna 'alayhi l-ṣalātu wa-l-salāmu min ajlihi yakrahū qiblata bayti l-maqdisi wa-yahwū qiblata l-Ka'batī...*

⁴³ On him see Ibn Ḥajar : *Tahdīb al-tahdhīb*, V, 64

⁴⁴ On her see Ibn Ḥajar : *al-Iṣāba*, VIII, 141, no. 703

⁴⁵ Al-Bayhaqī, *op. cit.*, V, 249; al-Mundhirī, *op. cit.*, III, 55, no. 1748; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, II, 19; al-Ḥākim : *al-Mustadrak*, Hyderabad, III, 12; Aḥmad b. 'Abd al-Ḥamid al-'Abbāsī, *op. cit.*, p. 412 sup. (three versions); al-Qaṣṭallānī, *op. cit.*, III, 242.

⁴⁶ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 37b.

⁴⁷ Ibn 'Asākir : *Ta'riḥ madīnat Dimashq*, ed. Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn al-Munajjid, Damascus 1951, I, 163; Mujir al-Dīn, *op. cit.*, I, 206; al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 42a; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. pp. 130, 146; al-Suyūṭī : *Al-Durr al-manthūr*, IV, 161; Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 17a; Abū l-Maḥāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī, *op. cit.*, I, 24 inf.

above. This tradition, however, places the mosque of al-Khayf⁴⁸ instead al-Aqṣā as the third mosque⁴⁹.

The traditions quoted above can be taken to represent an early stratum of lore in which the opposition displayed by certain circles of Muslim scholars at the beginning of the second century to the ranking of Jerusalem on the level of Mecca and Medina is reflected. They bring out quite clearly the tendency of those who tried to subdue the excessive veneration which was forming with regard to the sanctuary of Jerusalem.

II

Against the records in which an attempt is made to diminish the position of the sanctuary of Jerusalem one can notice quite well in the traditions the existence of a trend going in the opposite direction: it aims at granting Jerusalem the rank of Medina and emphasizes the peculiar features of sanctity of the mosque, of the city and of the region of Jerusalem.

« The assignment of relative ratings of efficacy to prayer in different localities is a common method of ranking towns in terms of their holiness » stated G. von Grunebaum⁵⁰. This was indeed applied to Jerusalem in comparison to Mecca and Medina.

A significant tradition granting the mosque of Jerusalem an unusually high rank is recorded on the authority of Abū Hurayra and 'Ā'isha. « A prayer in my mosque (i.e. in Medina) — says the Prophet in this *ḥadīth* — is better than a thousand prayers in any other mosque except al-Aqṣā »⁵¹. It is evident that this tradition contradicts the well-known tradition in which the concluding phrase reads: « except (prayer in) the mosque of Mecca »⁵². The phrase « except (prayer in)

⁴⁸ See on al-Khayf: al-Bakrī: *Mu'jam mā 'sta'jam*, ed. Muṣṭafā al-Saqā, Cairo 1945, II, 526; Yāqūt: *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. Khayf; Abū l-Baqā': *al-Manāqib al-mazyadīyya*, Ms. Br. Mus., f. 93a (the grave of Muḍar in the mosque of al-Khayf).

⁴⁹ Al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 68; al-Fāsi: *Shifā' al-gharām*, I, 263 inf.; al-Dhababī: *Mizān al-'itidāl*, ed. al-Bijāwī, Cairo 1963, I, 650, no. 2495; Ibn Ḍahīra: *al-Jāmi' al-laṭīf fī faḍli Makkata wa-ahliahā wa-binā' i l-bayti l-sharif*, Cairo 1921, p. 334.

⁵⁰ G.E. von Grunebaum, *op. cit.*, p. 31.

⁵¹ al-Mundhirī, *op. cit.*, III, 53, no. 1740: *Ṣalātun fī masjidi khayrun min alfi ṣalātīn fīmā siwāhu min al-masājidi illā l-masjidi l-aqṣā*; *al-Samhūdī*: *op. cit.*, I, 296 sup.

⁵² Al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 296; al-Suyūṭī: *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaghīr*, II, 47; 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 37b; al-Mundhirī, *op. cit.*, III, 50, no. 1731; Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal: *al-Musnad* III, no. 1605, VII, no. 4838, 5153, 5155, 5358, VIII, no. 5778, XII, no. 7252; Muḥ.

the mosque of Mecca» was in this *ḥadīth* replaced by the phrase «except (prayer in) al-Aqṣā ».

Another tradition reported on the authority of Ibn 'Abbās links the *ḥadīth* about the three mosques with the utterance of the Prophet about the value of the prayer in these mosques granting al-Aqṣā preference over the mosque of Medina. «A prayer in the mosque of Mecca (*al-masjid al-ḥarām*) — says the Prophet — is worth a hundred thousand prayers, a prayer in my mosque (i.e. in Medina) is worth a thousand prayers, and a prayer in al-Aqṣā is worth ten thousand prayers»⁵³. This tradition occurs with greater exaggeration in *Muthār al-gharām*⁵⁴: The Prophet states that a prayer in the mosque of Mecca is worth a hundred thousand prayers, a prayer in the mosque of Medina a thousand prayers and a prayer in Jerusalem twenty thousand prayers.

More restrained are two traditions recorded by Ibn Majāh. One of them states that the Prophet when asked about the mosque of Jerusalem recommended to come to Jerusalem, the land of the Resurrection and the place of assembly for the Final Judgement⁵⁵ and to pray there, as a prayer performed in it is worth a thousand prayers

Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī, *op. cit.*, II, 97, no. 881; Abū Yūsuf al-Anṣārī: *al-Āthār*, ed. Abū l-Wafā, Cairo 1355 AH, p. 65, no. 320; Ibn al-Najjār, *op. cit.*, II, 357; Ibn Ḥāhira, *op. cit.*, p. 193; al-Fāsi, *op. cit.*, I, 79-81; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, 115-119, Ibn Taymiyya: *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 54, inf.; Aḥmad b. 'Abd al-Ḥamīd al-'Abbāsī, *op. cit.*, p. 72-73; Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, *op. cit.*, III, 182; Ibn 'Abd al-Barr: *Tajrīd al-tamhīd*, p. 99, no. 305; al-Dārimī, *op. cit.*, I, 270, no. 1425; al-Rabī' b. Ḥabīb: *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḥīḥ*, Cairo 1349 AH, I, 52; Abū l-Maḥāsīn al-Ḥanafī, *op. cit.*, I, 24; al-Nawawī: *al-Idāh fi l-manāsik*, Cairo 1298 AH, p. 65; al-Jarrāhī, *op. cit.*, II, 27, no. 1605; Muḥ. b. al-Fattāl: *Rauḍat al-wā'iẓīn*, al-Najaf 1966, p. 408; al-Qaṣṭallānī, *op. cit.*, III, 240 inf.; etc...

⁵³ Ch. D. Matthews: *The Kit. Bā'itū-n-nufūs*, JPOS, XV (1935), p. 54; idem: *Palestine*, p. 4.

⁵⁴ Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maḥḍisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 129 with the following *isnād*: Hishām b. Sulaymān (see on him al-Dhahabī: *Mizān al-i'tidāl* IV, 299) > Ibn Jurayj > 'Aṭā' > Ibn 'Abbās > the Prophet. The *ḥadīth* is evaluated as weak (*wāhīn*).

⁵⁵ For *arḍu l-maḥshar wa-l-manshar* see al-Rabā'i: *Faḍā'il al-Shām wa-Dimashq*, ed. Ṣalāh al-Dīn al-Munajjid, Damascus 1950, p. 15, no. 25; and see ib., the introduction of Munajjid, p. 10, note 2; and see ib., Appendix 1, p. 85, ed. no. 25; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maḥḍisī, *op. cit.*, pp. 12, 143; and see 'Abd al-Wahhāb al-Sha'rānī: *Mukhtaṣar tadhkīrat al-Qurṭubī*, Cairo 1935, p. 43; al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 51b-53b, 57b; and see H. Busse, *Der Islam und die biblischen Kultstätten*, Der Islam, 1966, p. 124; Asad b. Mūsā: *Kit. al-Zuhd*, ed. Rudolf Leszynsky, Kirchhain 1909 (*Mohammedanische Traditionen über das jüngste Gericht*) pp. XXI, 46, 49-50; Ibn Kathīr, *op. cit.*, VI, 411; al-Suyūṭī: *al-Durr al-manthūr* VI, 110; Ch. D. Matthews: *Palestine*, p. 120.

elsewhere ⁵⁶. The second tradition records the utterance of the Prophet assigning to the prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem the value of fifty thousand prayers, to the prayer in the mosque of Medina fifty thousand prayers and to the prayer in the mosque of Mecca a hundred thousand prayers ⁵⁷.

In another tradition, reported on the authority of Ibn 'Abbās, the Prophet assigned to a prayer in the mosque of Mecca the value of a hundred thousand prayers, to a prayer in the mosque of Medina fifty thousand prayers and to a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem twenty thousand prayers ⁵⁸. In another tradition reported as well on the authority of Ibn 'Abbās the value of a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem is considerably reduced. The Prophet — according to this tradition — assigned to a prayer in the mosque of Medina the value of hundred thousand prayers, to a prayer in the mosque of Mecca a hundred thousand prayers and to a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem a thousand prayers ⁵⁹. Another tradition reported on the authority of Abū l-Dardā' states that the Prophet assigned to a prayer in the mosque of Mecca the value of a hundred thousand prayers, to a prayer in the mosque of Medina the value of a thousand prayers and to a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem the value of five hundred prayers ⁶⁰. Ibn Taymiyya records as the number of prayers

⁵⁶ Ibn Mājah : *Sunan al-Muṣṭafā*, Cairo 1349 AH, I, 429 (Abū l-Ḥasan Muḥ. b. 'Abd al-Hādī remarks in his comment *ib.*, that the Prophet was probably asked whether the prayer was permitted in the mosque of Jerusalem after the *Qibla* was diverted from it. He also remarks that only prayers in mosques other than those of Mecca and Medina are meant, as a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem is like a prayer in Medina); al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 289; al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 41b; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 295; Ibn Bābūya : *Thawāb al-a'māl*, Tehran 1375 AH, p. 30; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 128; Abū l-Mahāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī, *op. cit.*, I, 25.

⁵⁷ Ibn Mājah, *op. cit.*, I, 431; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 287, 118; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 219; al-Tibrizī : *Mishkāt al-maṣābih*, p. 72.

⁵⁸ Ch. D. Matthews : *Kit. Bā'itu-n-nufūs*, *ib.*, p. 60 (*Palestine*, p. 11).

⁵⁹ Al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 118 (quoted from al-Ṭabarānī's *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*); al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 299 (quoted from al-Zarkashī); Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, *op. cit.*, III, 182.

⁶⁰ Al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, II, 39; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 298 (quoted from al-Ṭabarānī); al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 117 (quoted from al-Bazzār's *Musnad*); al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, *op. cit.*, XIII, 168, no. 938 (on the authority of Jābir), no. 939, 941 (on the authority of Abū l-Dardā'); Ch. D. Matthews : *Palestine*, p. 10; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms., p. 128; Abū l-Mahāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī, *op. cit.*, I, 25, 1.3; al-Jarrāhī, *op. cit.*, II, 27, no. 1605; al-Qaṣṭallānī, *op. cit.*, III, 241.

corresponding to a prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem five hundred or fifty ⁶¹.

It is evident that the traditions which assign values to prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem are contradictory and mutually exclusive. They have to be seen against the background of a controversy concerning the weight to be accorded to prayer in the mosques of Mecca and Medina. These two cities contended for a long time for the superiority of their sanctuaries ⁶² and their merits ⁶³. Quite early traditions reflecting this controversy are recorded in 'Abd al-Razzāq's *Muṣannaf*. When asked by a man whether to journey to Medina 'Aṭā' answered :

⁶¹ Ibn Taymiyya : *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 54 inf.

⁶² See for instance al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 296 (*wa-dhahaba ba'dhum ilā anna l-ṣalāta fī masjidi l-Madīnati aḡḡalu min al-ṣalāti fī masjidi Makkata bi-mi'ati ṣalātin*); and see *ib. pp.* 297-300 the discussion about the value of the prayer in Medina in comparison with the prayer in Mecca; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, pp. 186-190; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Khafājī, *op. cit.*, III, 583.

⁶³ See for instance al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, II, 31; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 34, 52; The Prophet was created from the clay of Medina as reported in the tradition that a man is buried in the earth from which he is created. A contradictory tradition was recorded by al-Zubayr b. Bakkār. According to this tradition the Prophet was created from the clay of the Ka'ba. See al-Shaukānī, *op. cit.*, V, 25; Ibn Ḍahira, *op. cit.*, p. 18; and see G. E. von Grunebaum : *Muhammadan Festivals*, New York 1951, p. 20. Ibn Ḍajar al-Haythamī : *al-Ni'ma al-kubrā 'alā l-'ālam bi -marūlid Sayyid banī Ādam*, Ms. (in my possession) f. 7a. Al-Sha'bi disliked to stay in Mecca because the Prophet departed from Mecca; he considered Mecca « *dār a'rābiyya* » (al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 35; for the expression « *dār a'rābiyya* » see Abū l-Maḡāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḍanafī, *op. cit.*, II, 203, l. 8); and see al-Khaṭīb al-Baḡdādī : *Taqyid al-'ilm*, ed. Yūsuf al-'Ushsh, Damascus 1949, p. 72 : Marwān b. al-Ḍakam mentioned in his speech the merits of Mecca, its sanctity and the merits of its people. Rāfi' b. Khudayj reminded him of the sanctity of Medina, the merits of its people and mentioned the fact that it was declared as *ḥaram* by the Prophet and that the declaration was kept in Medina, written on a *khawlānī* skin. Marwān answered : « I heard something about it. » (*qaḡ samī'tu ba'da dhālika*); al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, II, 34; Aḡmad b. 'Abd al-Ḍamid al-'Abbāsī, *op. cit.*, p. 58 :... *wayastadillūna bihi 'alā aḡḡaliyyati hādhihi l-baldati 'alā sā'iri l-buldāni muṭlaqan, Makkata wa-ghayrihā*...; and see *ib.*, p. 61 about the doubled blessing of the Prophet granted Medina compared with the blessing of Abraham for Mecca; and see al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 26 : *al-Madīnatu khayrun min Makkata*; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḡhīr*, II, 184; al-Fāsī, *op. cit.*, I, 79 seq.; al-Samhūdī, *op. cit.*, I, 24-26; Aḡmad b. 'Abd al-Ḍamid al-'Abbāsī, *op. cit.*, p. 69 (*muslimu l-Madīnati khayrun min muslimi Makkata*); al-Fāsī, *op. cit.*, pp. 77-79; al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, I, 257 (— *wa-qaḡ taqaddama annahu 'alayhi l-ṣalātu wa-l-salāmu aḡḡalu min al-Ka'bati wa-ghayrihā*...); and see *ib.*, II, 38; about the partisans of the superiority of Medina and those of Mecca see al-Shaukānī, *op. cit.*, V, 24; Taḡī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Malik b. Abī l-Munā, *op. cit.*, p. 97; al-Zurḡānī : *Sharḡ al-Mawāhib al-ladunnīya*, Cairo 1329 AH, VIII, 322; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Khafājī, *op. cit.*, III, 584-587.

« to circumambulate the Ka'ba seven times is better than your journey to Medina »⁶⁴. Al-Thaurī is said to have answered when asked about a journey to Medina : « do not do it » (*lā taf'al*)⁶⁵. 'Aṭā' reported that he heard 'Abdallah b. al-Zubayr stating in his speech on the *minbar* (scil. of Mecca) : « a prayer in the mosque of Mecca is better than a hundred prayers in any other of the mosques. » « It seems to me — added 'Aṭā' — that he intended the mosque of Medina »⁶⁶. Qatāda said it plainly : « A prayer in the mosque of Mecca is better than a hundred prayers in the mosque of Medina »⁶⁷. An identical utterance on the authority of 'Abdallah b. al-Zubayr is reported by Abū l-'Āliya⁶⁸.

These traditions, some of which are early ones, shed some light on the rivalry between Mecca and Medina⁶⁹. The idea of the sanctity of Jerusalem grew and developed within the framework of this contest.

III

As against the tendency of restriction and limitation one can notice the opposite one, which aims to extend the number of holy mosques by the addition of one or two mosques to the three mosques, about the pilgrimage to which a consensus of the Muslim community had been reached. « The most distinguished mosques are : the mosque of Mecca, then the mosque of the Prophet (i.e. Medina), then the mosque of Jerusalem, then — it has been said — the mosque of al-Kūfa because of the consent of the Companions of the Prophet about it; and people said : the mosque of Damascus »⁷⁰.

The mosque of Damascus was ranked with the three mosques and the relative value of prayers in it was fixed in a saying attributed

⁶⁴ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b : 'Abd al-Razzāq qāla akhbarānī abī qāla gultu li-l-Muthannā : innī urīdu an ātiya l-Madīnata ; qāla : lā taf'al ; sami'tu 'Aṭā'an qāla — wa-sa'alahū rajulun — fa-qāla lahu : tawāḥun sab'an bi-l-bayti khayrun min safarika ilā l-Madīnati.

⁶⁵ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 39b.

⁶⁶ *Ib.*, f. 37b.

⁶⁷ *Ib.*, f. 38a.

⁶⁸ *Ib.*, f. 38a.

⁶⁹ For the sanctity of Medina see G. E. von Grunebaum : *The sacred character of Islamic cities*, p. 31.

⁷⁰ Yūsuf b. 'Abd al-Hādi : *Thimār al-maqāṣid fī dhikri l-masājīd*, ed. As'ad Ṭālas, Beirut 1943, p. 183.

to Sufyān al-Thaurī. When asked by a man about the value of a prayer in Mecca Sufyān answered: «the value of a prayer in Mecca is of a hundred thousand prayers, in the mosque of the Prophet fifty thousand prayers, in the mosque of Jerusalem forty thousand prayers and in the mosque of Damascus thirty thousand prayers»⁷¹. The equality of the mosque of Damascus with the mosque of Jerusalem is stressed in a story of a conversation between Wāthila b. al-Asqa'⁷² and Ka'b al-Aḥbār⁷³. Wāthila intended to set out for Jerusalem, but Ka'b showed him a spot in the mosque of Damascus in which the prayer has the same value as the prayer in the mosque of Jerusalem⁷⁴.

Shī'ite tradition put the mosque of al-Kūfa in the rank of the three mosques; Ḥudhayfa b. al-Yamān stated that it was the fourth mosque after Mecca, Medina and Jerusalem⁷⁵. The mosque of al-Kūfa is said to have been — like the mosques of Jerusalem and Mecca — the mosque of Adam⁷⁶ the place of prayer of prophets⁷⁷ and the place where the Prophet (Muḥammad) prayed⁷⁸ at the night of his

⁷¹ Al-Raba'i, *op. cit.*, p. 36, no. 64 and p. 86 (ad no. 64); Ch. D. Matthews: *The Kit. Bā'itū-n-nufūs*, JPOS, XV, p. 61; Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 17b.; al-Manīnī: *al-I'lām bi-ḥaqā'iq al-Shām*, ed. Aḥmad Sāmīḥ al-Khālīdī, Jerusalem, n.d., pp. 84-85.

⁷² See on him Ibn Ḥajar: *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, XI, 101; idem, *al-Iṣāba* VI, 310, no. 9088; al-Dhahabī: *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā'* III, 257-59.

⁷³ See S. D. Goitein, *op. cit.*, p. 144; and see on Ka'b; I. Wolfensohn: *Ka'b al-Aḥbār und seine Stellung im Ḥadīṭ und in der islamischen Legendenliteratur*, Gelnhausen, 1933.

⁷⁴ Al-Raba'i, *op. cit.*, p. 37, no. 65.

⁷⁵ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār al-anwār*, lithogr. ed., XXII, 88; al-Burāqī: *Ta'rikh al-Kūfa*, al-Najaf, 1960, p. 36.

⁷⁶ See al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 53b (the grave of Adam); Ch. D. Matthews: *Palestine*, pp. 32-33; Ibn Ḥazira, *op. cit.*, p. 143 (the prayer of Adam in Mecca); and see G. E. von Grunebaum; *Muhammadan Festivals*, p. 20 («Adam is said to be buried in Mecca»).

⁷⁷ See for instance Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, ff. 15b, 7b,8b; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maḥḍī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 125 seq.; and see about the graves of seventy prophets in the Ka'ba and graves of the prophets in Jerusalem, al-Suyūṭī: *al-Durr al-manthūr* I, 136; about the prayer of seventy prophets in the mosque of al-Khayf (see above note 48) see Ibn Ḥazira, *op. cit.*, p. 334 etc.

⁷⁸ About the prayer of the Prophet in Jerusalem see e.g. Ibn Hishām: *al-Sīra al-nabawiyya*, ed. al-Saqā, al-Abyārī, Shalabī, Cairo 1936, II, 38, 39; Ibn Sayyid al-Nās: *'Uyūn al-athar*, Cairo 1356 AH, I, 141, 144; Ibn Kathīr: *op. cit.*, IV, 241, 245; but see the tradition stating that the Prophet did not pray in Jerusalem *ib. pp.* 254-255; and see this tradition discussed Abū l-Maḥāsīn Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḥanafī, *op. cit.*, II, 176-177.

Isrā' ⁷⁹. The value of a thousand prayers was assigned to a prayer in the mosque of al-Kūfa ⁸⁰.

Some of the Shī'ī traditions bring out a rivalry which existed between al-Kūfa and Jerusalem. A man came to 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib — says one of these traditions — when he was in the mosque of al-Kūfa to take his leave; the man was about to set out for Jerusalem. 'Alī bade him to sell his mount, to consume his provisions and to pray in the mosque of al-Kūfa, as the obliging prayer performed there has the value of a pilgrimage (to Mecca) and the voluntary prayer has the value of an 'umra ⁸¹.

Ja'far al-Ṣādiq (Abū 'Abdallah) was asked by a man about mosques of merits. Ja'far mentioned the mosques of Mecca and Medina. The man asked about the Aqṣā mosque and Ja'far answered: « that is in heaven, there the Prophet was carried at night » (*ilayhi usriya rasūlu llāhi*). The man said: « people say *bayt al-maqdis* » (Jerusalem - K) Ja'far said: « al-Kūfa is better than that » ⁸².

A peculiar utterance attributed to 'Alī runs as follows: « You shall set out only for three mosques: the mosque of Mecca, the mosque of Medina and the mosque of al-Kūfa » ⁸³. In this tradition, styled exactly like the discussed tradition about the three mosques, the mosque of Jerusalem was replaced by the mosque of al-Kūfa. To 'Alī is attributed the following utterance as well: « Four are the palaces of Paradise in this world: the mosque of Mecca, the mosque of Medina, the mosque of Jerusalem and the mosque of al-Kūfa » ⁸⁴.

A mosque ranked with the three mosques was the mosque of al-Janad in al-Yaman. To the Prophet was attributed an utterance

⁷⁹ Al-Barqī: *al-Maḥāsin*, al-Najaf 1964, p. 43, no. 86 (Kit. *Thawāb al-a'māl*); al-Burāqī, *op. cit.*, p. 49; al-Majlisī, *op. cit.*, XXII, 85 inf., 89, 90 (lithograph. ed.); Muḥ. Mahdī al-Mūsāwī; *Tuḥfat al-sājid fī aḥkām al-masājid*, Baghdād 1376 AH, p. 447; Muḥ. b. al-Fattāl, *op. cit.*, p. 410.

⁸⁰ Ibn Bābūya, *op. cit.*, p. 30; al-Burāqī, *op. cit.*, pp. 31, 32, 49, 50.

⁸¹ Yāqūt: *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. al-Kūfa; al-Majlisī, *op. cit.*, XXII, 90 (lithogr. ed.).

⁸² Al-Burāqī, *op. cit.*, p. 29 (quoted from *Tafsīr al-'Ayyāshī*).

⁸³ *Ib.*, p. 48.

⁸⁴ Abū Ja'far Muḥ. b. al-Ḥasan al-Ṭūsī: *al-Amālī*, Najaf 1964, I, 379; comp. the ḥadīth attributed to the Prophet about the four cities of Paradise in this world: Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem and Damascus, al-Suyūṭī: *al-La'ālī al-maṣnū'a fī l-aḥādīth al-mawḍū'a*, Cairo, al-Maktaba al-Tijāriya, n.d., I, 459-60; al-Jarrāhī, *op. cit.*, I, 450, no. 1466; al-Raba'ī, *op. cit.*, pp. 28-29; and see *ib.*, p. 28 the utterance of Ka'b about five cities of Paradise: Ḥimṣ, Damascus, Jerusalem, Bayt Jibrin and Zafār in al-Yaman; and comp. Muḥ. b. al-Fattāl, *op. cit.*, p. 409.

bading to set out for the mosques of Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem and al-Janad ⁸⁵.

* * *

Tradition emphasized the common features of sanctity of these mosques, stressed the special graces bestowed on them or on each of them and pointed out the close relations between these sanctuaries. « The earth was water — reads a tradition attributed to 'Alī — God sent a wind which wiped away the water and on the earth appeared a foam, which He divided into four pieces; of one of these pieces He created Mecca, from the other He created Medina, from the third one He created Jerusalem and from the fourth He created al-Kūfa ⁸⁶. At the Day of Resurrection the Ka'ba will be carried to the Rock in Jerusalem ⁸⁷. The mount Qāsiyūn granted his shadow to the mountain of Jerusalem and was granted the grace of God ⁸⁸. The Ka'ba was built from the stones of five mountains : Lubnān, Ṭūr Zayta, al-Jūdī, Ṭūr Sīnā and Ḥirā' ⁸⁹. From the splits of Mt. Sīnā, which splitted at the day when God spoke to Moses, three mountains in Mecca arose (Ḥirā', Thabīr, Thaur) and three in Medina (Uḥud,

⁸⁵ Ch. D. Matthews : *Palestine*, p. 4, inf. and p. 140, note 13.

⁸⁶ Al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 38a, inf.; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Durr al-manthūr*, IV, 158 (quoted from al-Wāsiṭī); Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 70; and see about the building of the mosque of Mecca and the mosque of Jerusalem *ib.*, pp. 53-57; and see the discussion about this subject Ibn Zāhira, *op. cit.*, p. 20 and Taqī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Malik b. Abi l-Munā, *op. cit.*, p. 96 and the commentary of al-Suyūṭī on the *Sunan* of al-Nasā'ī, Cairo 1930, III, 2; al-Nawawī, *op. cit.*, p. 72; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, pp. 29-31.

⁸⁷ Al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 45a. 58a; al-Nuwayrī, *op. cit.*, I, 335; Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 15b; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms., p. 143; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 136 inf.; (but see *ib.*, I, 137 sup. : the Ka'ba will be brought to the grave of the Prophet, *scil.* in Medina —; the Ka'ba promises to intercede for people who visited her, asking the Prophet to intercede for people who did not visit her). About the intercession of the mosque of al-Kūfa for the people praying in this mosque see al-Majlisī, *op. cit.*, XXII, 86 (lithogr. ed.).

⁸⁸ Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 52; al-Rabā'ī, *op. cit.*, p. 38; al-Manīnī, *op. cit.*, p. 106.

⁸⁹ 'Abd al-Razzāq, *op. cit.*, f. 34a, sup.; al-Suyūṭī : *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 130, 133, 134; al-Azraqī : *Akhbār Makka*, Mecca 1352 AH, I, 18, 26; al-Fāsi, *op. cit.*, I, 93; al-Bakrī : *Mu'jam mā 'sta'jam*, s.v. al-Jūdī; Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 17; and see H. Busse : *Der Islam und die biblischen Kultstätten*, « Der Islam », 1966, p. 121; Yāqūt : *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. Thabīr; and see G. E. von Grunebaum : *Muhammadan Festivals*, p. 19 sup.

Wariqān, Raḍwā) ⁹⁰. The mountain of al-Khalil (Hebron), Lubnān, al-Ṭūr and al-Jūdī will on the Day of Resurrection be brought to Jerusalem, set at her corners and God will put his throne upon them to judge the people of Paradise and those of the Hell ⁹¹. Al-Ṭā'if was originally a place in Palestine — says a tradition attributed to Ibn 'Abbās; it was removed by God and placed in the spot of al-Ṭā'if of today ⁹². Three angels are entrusted with the guard of the three mosques: one is entrusted with the mosque of Mecca, one with that of Medina and one with al-Aqṣā ⁹³.

The shared sanctity of the mosques gave rise to traditions which talk of the merits of performing devotions distributed between them. To the Prophet is attributed the following utterance: «Whoever goes on pilgrimage or on a pious visit from al-Aqṣā to the mosque of Mecca — the faults he has committed and those he may later commit will be covered for him and he shall be granted Paradise» ⁹⁴. On the authority of Ibn 'Abbās the following saying is related: «Whoever makes pilgrimage and prays in the mosques of Medina and al-Aqṣā in the same year, he shall be absolved from his faults as he was on the day his mother bore him» ⁹⁵. A group of people — Ibn al-Firkāḥ reports, quoting from the book of Ibn al-Murajjā — used to stay in 'Abbādān ⁹⁶ during the month of Ramaḍān, then they

⁹⁰ Aḥmad b. 'Abd al-Ḥamid al-'Abbāsī, *op. cit.*, p. 135; al-Majlisī, *op. cit.*, Tehran 1358 AH, XIII, 224; and see *ib.*, p. 217, no. 9.

⁹¹ Asad b. Mūsā, *op. cit.*, p. XXI; Ch. D. Matthews: *Palestine*, p. 120.

⁹² Yāqūt: *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. al-Ṭā'if; Ibn al-Mujāwir: *Descriptio Arabiae Meridionalis*, ed. O. Löfgren, Leiden 1951, I, 22.

⁹³ Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 16b; al-Suyūṭī: *al-La'ālī al-maṣnū'a*, I, 92.

⁹⁴ Al-Bayhaqī, *op. cit.*, V, 30; Ch. D. Matthews: *Palestine*, p. 13; Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, *op. cit.*, IV, 103; al-Nuwayrī, *op. cit.*, I, 339; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 289; al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, *op. cit.*, XIII, 250, no. 1380; *ib.*, V, 2, no. 19; *ib.* p. 5, no. 47, 48; comp. *ib.* XIII, 264, no. 1460: the pilgrimage started from 'Umān (for Mecca) is better than two pilgrimages from any other place.

⁹⁵ Shihāb al-Dīn al-Maḥdisī, *op. cit.*, Ms. p. 126; Ch. D. Matthews; *Palestine*, p. 12; *idem*, JPOS, XV, 61; al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 296.

⁹⁶ See on 'Abbādān Yāqūt: *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. 'Abbādān... *fīhi qaumun mun-qaṭi'ūna, 'alayhim waḥfun fī tilka l-jazīrati yu'ṭauna ba'dahu wa-aktharu mawāddihim min al-nudhūr... wa-yaqṣidukum al-mujāwirūna fī l-mawāsīmī li-l-ziyārati, wa-yurwā fī faḍā'ilihā aḥādīthū ghayru thābitatin...*; Muḥ. Ṭāhir b. 'Alī al-Hindī: *Tadhkirat al-mauḍū'āt*, Cairo 1343 AH, p. 120: ... two gates open in this world for Paradise are 'Abbādān and Qazwīn; the first place which believed in Muḥammad was 'Abbādān...; and see Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī, *op. cit.*, IV, 103.

would go to Mecca on pilgrimage and come to Jerusalem for prayer ⁹⁷. «Whoever performs the pilgrimage to the Ka'ba and does not visit me (i.e. the grave of the Prophet in Medina) treats me harshly» — says a tradition attributed to the Prophet, told on the authority of Ibn 'Umar ⁹⁸. A tradition recorded on the authority of 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd (or 'Abdallah b. 'Umar) contains all the three sanctuaries. The Prophet said: «He who performs the pilgrimage to Mecca and visits my grave (in Medina) and goes forth to fight (in a holy war — *ghazā ghazwatan*) and prays for me in Jerusalem — God will not ask him about what he (failed to perform of the prescriptions) imposed on him» ⁹⁹. A *ḥadīth* attributed to the Prophet states: «He who visits me (i.e. the grave of the Prophet in Medina) and visits the grave of my father (i.e. my ancestor) Ibrāhīm (i.e. in Hebron) within one year — shall enter Paradise» ¹⁰⁰. Al-Zarkashī considers the *ḥadīth* as forged and mentions an opinion that it was transmitted only after the conquest of Jerusalem by Ṣalāḥ al-Dīn in 583 AH.

IV

With the general admission by the scholars of the *ḥadīth* about the three mosques the old controversy about the position of Jerusalem fell into oblivion. Traditions aiming at minimizing of the importance of Jerusalem were not recorded in the canonical collections of *ḥadīth*. The main concern of the scholars of Islam came to be to fight objectionable practices of *bid'a* in connection with the pilgrimage to Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem and other sanctuaries.

According to prescriptions visitors should perform the circumambulation of the Rock in the direction opposite to that prescribed for the circumambulation of the Ka'ba. The Rock should be circumambulated being on the right of the visitor ¹⁰¹ The *ṭawāf* around

⁹⁷ Ch. D. Matthews: *Palestine*, p. 12.

⁹⁸ al-Subkī, *op. cit.*, pp. 27-29; Muḥ. Ṭāhir al-Hindī, *op. cit.*, p. 76, I. 3.

⁹⁹ Al-Subkī, *op. cit.*, p. 34; Muḥ. Ṭāhir al-Hindī, *op. cit.*, p. 73; al-Samnūdi: *Nuṣratu l-imāmi l-Subkī*, p. 163.

¹⁰⁰ al-Zarkashī, *op. cit.*, p. 296; al-Jarrāḥī, *op. cit.*, II, 251, no. 2490; al-Nawawī, *op. cit.*, p. 84; Abū Shāma: *al-Bā'ith 'alā inkār al-bida' wa-l-ḥawādīth*, ed. Muḥ. Fu'ād Miṅqāra, Cairo 1955, p. 72.

¹⁰¹ Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 21b; J. W. Hirschberg: *The sources of Moslem traditions concerning Jerusalem*, Rocznik Orientalistyczny, XVII, (1951-52), p. 317; R. Kriss - H. Kriss-Heinrich: *Volks Glaube im Bereiche des Islams* Wiesbaden 1960, I, 144.

the Rock is a *bid'a* ¹⁰². Similarly the *ṭawāf* around the grave of the Prophet was forbidden ¹⁰³. The visitor in the Dome of the Rock has to put his hand on the Rock, but it is forbidden to kiss the Rock ¹⁰⁴. It is as well forbidden to kiss the grave of the Prophet ¹⁰⁵. It is forbidden to pray behind the Rock towards Mecca in order to combine the *qibla* of the Rock and the *qibla* of Mecca ¹⁰⁶. It is forbidden to kiss the stones of the building or to kiss the stones of the Cave, as only one stone in the world is recommended to touch and to kiss: the stone of the Ka'ba. Forbidden is as well to imitate the *ḥajj* ¹⁰⁷.

Al-'Abdarī reports about a curious instance of *bid'a* performed by the visitors of the sanctuary of Jerusalem: people, men and women alike, come to a place called « the navel of the earth », expose their navels and press them towards this spot, exhibiting in this fashion their naked bodies ¹⁰⁸.

About similar customs in Mecca reports al-Nawawī: « some wicked deceivers claimed that a place in the wall surrounding the Ka'ba, opposite the door of the Ka'ba, was « *al-'urwa al-wuthqā* ». Those people led them fraudently to believe that whoever touched it was in possession of the '*urwa al-wuthqā*. As the spot was a high one the people would climb on the back of each other in order to touch it and it would come about that women ascended on the backs of men, thus mixing together and touching each other. Another *bid'a* was the custom of the touching of the 'navel of the earth': a nail in the mosque of Mecca was claimed to be « the navel of the earth » and common people would swarm to this spot, uncovering their navels and pressing them towards the « navel of the earth » ¹⁰⁹.

Al-Ṭurtūshī tells about the celebration of the « Day of 'Arafa » in the mosque of Jerusalem. People from Jerusalem and neighbouring

¹⁰² Al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, IV, 243.

¹⁰³ Al-Nawawī, *op. cit.*, p. 81.

¹⁰⁴ Shams al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 21b.

¹⁰⁵ Al-Nawawī, *op. cit.*, p. 81; but see a contradictory opinion Shihāb al-Dīn al-Khafājī, *op. cit.*, III, 577 inf. *wa-lā yamassahu bi-shay'in min jasadīhi fa-lā yuqabbilhu, fa-yukrahu massuhu wa-taqbiluhu wa-ilsāqu ṣadrihi li-annahu tarku adabīn; wa-kadhā kullu qarīhin yukrahu fihi dhālika; wa-hādha amrun ghayru mujma'in 'alayhi, wa-li-dhā qāla Aḥmadu wa-l-Ṭabariyyu: lā ba'sa bi-taqbīlihi wa- tūzāmihi.*

¹⁰⁶ Al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, IV, 243.

¹⁰⁷ L. A. Mayer: *A sequel to Muḥīr ad-Dīn's Chronicle*, JPOS 1931, pp. 9-10 (=93-94)

¹⁰⁸ Al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, IV, 243 inf.

¹⁰⁹ Al-Nawawī, *op. cit.*, p. 66; Abū Shāma, *op. cit.*, p. 71.

villages stood in prayer facing Mecca, raising their voices in the *du'ā*, just as if they were attending the *wuqūf* of 'Arafa. The common belief was that the performance of four *wuqūfs* in Jerusalem was equivalent to the pilgrimage to Mecca ¹¹⁰.

A *bid'a* innovation started in al-Aqṣā in 448 AH. It was introduced by a man from Nablus called Abū l-Ḥamrā'. He prayed the *ṣalāt al-raghā'ib* in the mosque, people joined him and it became a practice, almost a *sunna* ¹¹¹.

Another *bid'a* reported about was the prayer of *rajab* (*ṣalāt rajab*) introduced in the mosque of Jerusalem in 480 AH ¹¹².

Muslim scholars condemned severely the *bid'a* of songs and dances performed in al-Khalil (Hebron) after the afternoon-prayer and called « *navbat al-Khalil* » ¹¹³. Ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī reports about « shameful actions », *qabā'ih*, committed during the *ṭawāf* of the Ka'ba, the kissing of the Black Stone and during the maulid-festivals in Mecca ¹¹⁴.

But the persevering struggle of the orthodox scholars against these innovations failed. *Bid'as* and beliefs about miraculous properties of sanctuaries and graves spread nevertheless widely among the common people.

Ibn Taymiyya waged in vain his campaign against the sanctity of the Rock in Jerusalem, trying to prove that only Jews and some Christians adored the Rock (*wa-kadhālika l-ṣakhratu, innamā yu'azzimuhā l-Yahūdu wa-ba'du l-Naṣārā*); none of the Companions of the Prophet or the *Tābi'ūn* had adored the Rock ¹¹⁵. Muslim tradition claimed that God ascended the Heaven from the Rock ¹¹⁶ and that it was God's dwelling for forty years ¹¹⁷. This was strongly refuted

¹¹⁰ Abū Bakr al-Ṭurtūshī, *op. cit.*, 116-17 (quoted by Abū Shāma, *op. cit.*, p. 22); and see S. D. Goitein, *op. cit.*, p. 137 (about *ta'rif*); Ibn Taymiyya. *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 57: ... *au an yusāfiru ilayhā li-yu'arriḥa bihā 'ashiyyata 'Arafa...*

¹¹¹ Abū Bakr al-Ṭurtūshī, *op. cit.*, p. 121 (quoted by abū Shāma, *op. cit.*, p. 24).

¹¹² Al-Ṭurtūshī, *op. cit.*, p. 122.

¹¹³ Al-'Abdarī, *op. cit.*, IV, 245-46; and see the passage against the pilgrimage to al-Khalil in Ibn Taymiyya's *Minhāj al-sunna* I, 335-36.

¹¹⁴ Ibn Ḥajar al-Haythamī: *al-Ni'ma al-Kubrā*, f. 3a-3b.

¹¹⁵ Ibn Taymiyya: *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 58 (quoted in Jamāl al-Dīn al-Qāsimī: *Iṣlāḥ al-masājid min al-bida'i wa-l-'awā'id*, Cairo 1341 AH, pp. 214-17).

¹¹⁶ Al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 51a-b; al-Nuwayrī, *op. cit.*, I, 336-37 (quoting al-Wāsiṭī); and see al-Majlisī, *op. cit.* VIII, 574 (lithogr. ed.).

¹¹⁷ 'Ubāda b. al-Ṣāmit swore: *lā, wa-lladhī kānat ṣakhratu bayti l-maqdisi lahu maqāman arba'ina sanatan*, when arguing about something with 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd, al-Wāsiṭī, *op. cit.*, f. 51a.

by Shī'ī¹¹⁸ and Ibādī traditions alike¹¹⁹, but this refutation seems to have had no effect.

Ibn Taymiyya tried to explain that there was no *ḥaram* in Jerusalem or in Khalil and that there did only exist three *ḥarams*: the *ḥaram* of Mecca, the *ḥaram* of Medina and the *ḥaram* of Wajj (recognized only by some Muslim scholars)¹²⁰. This attempt was also set at nought; the sanctuary of Jerusalem is called till the present day *al-Ḥaram al-Sharīf* and that of al-Khalil is called *al-Ḥaram al-Ibrāhīmī*.

Thus it seems that the tradition about the three mosques, a very early one itself and one whose aim was to exclude the claims for pilgrimage to other shrines, was only granted general recognition following a period of internal struggle at the beginning of the second century. During that period the status of Jerusalem was disputed by certain orthodox circles while other sanctuaries vied for acceptance as places of pilgrimage.

The tradition about the three mosques was granted the consensus of the orthodox scholars, while at the same time elements of popular belief left their indelible mark on the rituals of pilgrimage to these sanctuaries.

Jerusalem,
The Hebrew University,
Institute of Asian and African Studies.

¹¹⁸ See Warrām b. Abī Firās al-Mālikī al-Ashtari: *Tanbih al-Khawātir*, al-Najaf 1964, pp. 260-61.

¹¹⁹ Al-Rabī' b. Ḥabīb: *al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḥīḥ*, III, 39.

¹²⁰ Ibn Taymiyya: *Majmū'at al-rasā'il*, II, 60.