

SANCTITY JOINT AND DIVIDED: ON HOLY PLACES IN THE ISLAMIC TRADITION

M.J. Kister

For Professor P. Shinar, with esteem and friendship.

At the end of the first century of the *hijra* there was an almost unanimous consensus of the Muslim community as to the three distinguished mosques which were recommended as sanctuaries to be visited by the believers. It is noteworthy that the consent of the Muslim orthodox scholars to grant validity to the famous utterance of the Prophet: "You shall set out only for the three mosques . . ." ¹ was reached after a period of discussion among the scholars of Muslim law, after a close scrutiny of the tradition of the Prophet, and after the approval of the orthodox

¹ *Ḍiyā' al-Dīn Muḥammad b. 'Abd al-Wāḥid al-Maqdisī, Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis*, ed. Muḥammad Muṭṭī al-Ḥāfiẓ (Damascus, 1404/1983), 39-44, nos. 1-7. See the different versions of the tradition. Muḥammad Naṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī (= al-Albānī), *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-ṣaḥīḥa* (Beirut, 1405/1985), II, 732-34, no. 997. Al-Ḥasan b. Muḥammad al-Saghānī, *Mabāriq al-azhār fī sharḥi mashāriqi l-anwār (sharḥu bni mālik)* (Ankara, 1328), I, 219. Al-Fākihī, *Ta'rīkh Makka*, MS Leiden Or. 463, fols. 352a-54b. Abū Ṭālib Muḥammad b. Muḥammad b. Ibrāhīm, *al-Ghaylāniyyāt, [al-muntaqā]*, MS Hebrew University, Ar. 8*, 273, p. 7 inf. = MS Br. Mus. Or. 3059, fol. 3a. Muḥibb al-Dīn al-Ṭabarī, *al-Qirā li-qāṣidi ummi l-qurā*, ed. Muṣṭafā l-Saqqā (Cairo, 1390/1970), 655-56. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ḥamīd ilā zawā'id bni ḥibbān*, ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Razzāq Ḥamza (Cairo, n.d.), 256-57, nos. 1035-42. Al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, ed. Ḥamdī 'Abd al-Majīd al-Silafī (n.p., 1404/1983), II, 276-77, nos. 2158-61. Al-Mundhirī, *al-Tarḥīb wa-l-tarḥīb*, ed. Muḥammad Muḥyī l-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd (Cairo, 1380/1961), III, 51-54, nos. 1734, 1737, 1739. And see esp. no. 1740: *ṣalātun fī masjidī khayrun min alfi ṣalātin fīmā siwāhu min al-masājidi illā l-masjida l-aqṣā*. But the tradition recorded in al-Kattānī, *Nazm al-mutanāthir min al-ḥadīthi l-mutawātir* (Cairo, 1983), 78, no. 58: *ṣalātun fī masjidī ḥadḥā khayrun min alfi ṣalātin fīmā siwāhu min al-masājidi illā l-masjida l-ḥarāma*. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, ed. Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-'Umarī (Beirut, 1401/1981), II, 294-95. See the different versions. Al-Suyūṭī, *Jam'u l-jawāmi'* (Cairo, 1978), I, 893. See the different versions. Idem, *Fākihāt al-ṣayf wa-anīs al-ḍayf*, ed. Muḥammad Ibrāhīm Salīm (Cairo, 1408/1988), 215. 'Abdallāh b. Muḥammad b. Abī Shayba [= Ibn Abī Shayba], *al-Muṣannaf fī l-aḥādīthi wa-l-āthār*, ed. 'Abd al-Khālīq al-Afghānī, [reprint] (n.p., n.d.), II, 374 inf.-375 sup. Al-Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr [= al-Jāmi' li-aḥkāmī l-qur'ān]*, ed. Muṣṭafā l-Saqqā (Cairo, 1387/1967), XIX, 21. Al-Musharraf b. Murajjā, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis wa-l-khalīl*, MS Tübingen 27, fol. 32a inf.-32b. This work has now been published in Ofer Livne-Kafri, ed., *Faḍā'il Bayt al-Maqdis wa al-Khalīl wa al-Shām* by Abū al-Ma'ālī al-Musharraf b. al-Murajjā b. Ibrāhīm al-Maqdisī (Shefaram, Israel: al-Mashriq Press, 1995). See also M.J. Kister, "You shall only set out for three mosques: A Study of an Early Tradition." *Le Muséon* 82(1969), 173-96.

heads of the community. Weighing cautiously the opinions of the scholars in the different regions of the Muslim empire, the influential religious leaders, after hesitations and doubts, gradually consented to extend the tradition recommending to set out *only* to the sanctuary of the Ka'ba² so as to include the mosque of the Prophet in Medina.³

There seems to have been a strong tendency among orthodox scholars to discourage believers from journeys to sanctuaries honored and revered before Islam where they would perform ritual practices. Tradition says that the Aus and Khazraj used to pray in the direction of Jerusalem two years before the *hijra* of the Prophet⁴ and it is plausible that they intended to continue to set out to Jerusalem after they had embraced Islam. The opposition to journeys to sanctuaries other than those in Mecca and Medina, journeys undertaken on the authority of certain early traditions, is manifest in reports on the authority of the Prophet, in which he dissuaded believers from carrying out their oath to set out to Jerusalem, and convinced them to perform the planned ritual in the mosque of Medina.⁵

Finally, after the consolidation of Umayyad power and the growth of the influence of Syria, the utterance concerning the three mosques quoted above gained almost unanimous approval. As in the case of the former tradition limiting the recommended journey to two mosques (Mecca and Medina), orthodox scholars tried to dissuade the believers from journeys to sanctuaries other than these three mosques. This can be seen in the widely circulated tradition in which the Companions are enjoined not to journey to the mount of Sinai and to perform their ritual practices in the three recommended mosques.⁶ The believers however persisted in their veneration of Ṭūr Sīnā: commentaries of the Qur'ān report many stories

² Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 375, ll. 2-3: 'an 'abdi llāhi bni abī l-hudhayl qāla: lā tashuddū l-riḥāla illā ilā l-bayti l-'atīq.

³ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ẓam'ān*, 252, no. 1023: *inna khayra mā rukibat ilayhi l-rawāḥilu masjidi ḥadhā wa-l-baytu l-'atīq*. 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī b. Balabān al-Fārisī, *al-Iḥsān bi-tartībī ṣaḥīḥi bni ḥibbān*, ed. Kamāl Yūsuf al-Ḥūt (Beirut, 1407/1987), III, 70, no. 1614. Al-Mundhirī, *al-Targhib wa-l-tarḥīb*, ed. Muḥammad Muḥyī l-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd (Cairo, 1379/1960), III, 63, no. 1775.

⁴ Maḥmūd Ibrāhīm, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis fī makhṭūṭāt 'arabiyya qadīma* (al-Kuwayt, 1406/1985), 365, l. 3.

⁵ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ẓam'ān*, 256, no. 1035. Al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, VII, 320, no. 7258. Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl min aḥādīthi l-rasūl* [s], ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid al-Faqī (Cairo, 1374/1955), XII, 183, nos. 9092-95.

⁶ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ẓam'ān*, 252-53, no. 1024. Al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, II, 276, no. 2157. Al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-muwatṭa'* (Cairo, 1381/1961), I, 329-30, 332. Al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, *Talkhīṣu l-mutashābih fī l-rasm wa-ḥimāyatu mā ashkala minhu 'an bawādirī l-taṣḥīfī wa-l-wahm*, ed. Sukayna al-Shihābī (Damascus, 1985), II, 866-67, no. 1422. Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 274 ult.-275 l. 1: *sa'altu 'umara: ātī l-ṭūra? qāla: da'i l-ṭūra wa-lā ta'tihā, wa-qāla: lā tashuddū l-riḥāla illā ilā thalāthati masājida*. Ḍiḡā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis*, 41. Al-Albānī, *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-ṣaḥīḥa*, II, 733.

about miracles that occurred on Ṭūr Sīnā when the Torah was given to Moses and describe how the mountain split out of awe for God. It was on this occasion that sections of Ṭūr Sīnā reached Mecca, Medina and other places; thus the mountains of Uḥud, Thabīr, Hīrā', Warqān and Thaur in the Ḥijāz are splinters of Ṭūr Sīnā.⁷ The traditions speaking of how splinters of Ṭūr Sīnā reached Mecca and Medina and how they eventually served as the material out of which the sanctuaries in these cities were built illustrate the idea of the transfer of sanctity and demonstrate its distribution among other holy places. The persistence of the reverence of al-Ṭūr in the popular belief of pious circles is expressed in a question directed to Ibn Ḥajar al-Haytamī (d. 974 H.), whether Uḥud is said to be more holy than Mount Sīnā.⁸

Šūfis seem to have continued to journey to Mount Sīnā; al-Junayd is said to have journeyed with a group of Šūfis to Ṭūr Sīnā, climbed up the mountain, prayed there, invoked God and a *qawwāl* chanted such a moving song that the Šūfis who were present could not tell whether they were in heaven or on earth. A Christian monk who was on the mountain was so much impressed by the ritual that convinced by the arguments of the group of Šūfis, converted to Islam.⁹

Al-Ṭūr is counted among the three places of asylum: Damascus will serve as a refuge for the believers in the period of the bloody wars (*malāḥim*), Jerusalem will shelter them in the period of the false Messiah (*dajjāl*), al-Ṭūr will be their refuge in the time of Yājūj and Mājūj.¹⁰

The status of a sanctuary was often enhanced by assigning it an additional name referring to a biblical personality or to a holy place already existing in the pre-Islamic period, or by giving it a second name borrowed from a celebrated Muslim sanctuary. The name of Medina, for example, is said to have been *al-Makkatāni*¹¹ or *al-Masjid al-aqṣā*.¹² Mecca, says a tradition, was called *Šahyūn*;¹³ this name of course refers

⁷ See al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr fī l-tafsīr bi-l-ma'thūr* (Cairo, 1314 [reprint Tehran]), III, 119. Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār al-anwār* (Tehran, 1386), XIII, 217, 224, LX, 223, no. 56.

⁸ Ibn Ḥajar al-Haytamī, *al-Fatāwā l-ḥadīthiyya* (Cairo, 1390/1970), 187.

⁹ Ibn al-ʿArabī, *al-Waṣāyā* (Beirut, n.d.), 282–83.

¹⁰ Al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, I, 744 sup.

¹¹ Muḥammad b. Yūsuf al-Šālihī l-Šāmī, *Subulu l-hudā wa-l-rashād fī sirati khayri l-'ibād* [= *al-Sīra al-shāmiyya*], ed. ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz ʿAbd al-Ḥaqq Ḥilmī (Cairo, 1395/1975), III, 424, no. 85.

¹² Al-Samhūdī, *Wafā'u l-wafā bi-akḥbārī dāri l-muṣṭafā*, ed. Muḥammad Muḥyī l-Dīn ʿAbd al-Ḥamīd (Cairo, 1374/1975), I, 23, no. 77. Al-Šālihī, *al-Sīra al-shāmiyya*, III, 424, no. 78.

¹³ Alī b. Burhān al-Dīn al-Ḥalabī, *Insānu l-ʿuyūn fī sirati l-amīni l-ma'mūn* [= *al-Sīra al-halabiyya*] (Cairo, 1382/1962), I, 240 inf. Alī b. Rabban al-Tabarī, *al-Dīn wa-l-daula*, ed. ʿAlī Nuwayhid (Beirut, 1393/1973), 140 sup. And see Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ḥidāyat al-ḥayārā*, 71: *inna llāha subḥānahu aẓhara min šahyūn ikhlālān*

to the celebrated spot mentioned in the Psalms. Another locality identified with Mecca was Fārān; it was the place which God provided as lodging for Hājar and her son Ismā'īl.¹⁴ The mountains of Mecca are said to have been named Fārān.¹⁵

An additional name attached to Mecca was Kūthā, the name of Arāham's birthplace.¹⁶

Damascus gained a prominent position among the cities frequented by the believers very early on in Islamic times, becoming in effect the fourth holy sanctuary.

The status of Damascus and of *al-Shām* was established in the opinion of the Muslim community through several predictions and utterances extolling *al-Shām* attributed to the Prophet. He is said to have urged the believers to join the fighting forces during the conquest of *al-Shām*, stressed the qualities of the people of *Shām* and the virtues of the various localities in *Shām*, and called upon the believers to settle in *Shām*, which, according to the definition of the period, included the area of Syria, Jordan and Filasṭīn.¹⁷

Some commentators of the Qur'ān stated that the *rabwa* mentioned in the Qur'ān (Sūra 28, 50) refers to the Ghūṭa of Damascus.¹⁸

Other commentators ascribed the word *rabwa* to the locality Ramla in *Shām*, or more precisely in Filasṭīn.¹⁹ The virtues of this locality were further enhanced by stories concerning prophets who were persecuted and who tried to find refuge in Ramla. Such was the case of the prophet Ṣāliḥ, who sojourned for some time in Ramla;²⁰ the story of the seventy prophets who were driven out of Jerusalem in the period following the

maḥmūdān refers to Muḥammad; al-Kāzarūnī, *Sīra*, fol. 19a, ll. 5-6.

¹⁴ Al-Qurṭubī, *al-I'lām bi-mā fī dīnī l-naṣārā minā l-fasādi wa-l- auhām*, ed. Aḥmad Ḥijāzī al-Saqqā, 265: *wa-lā khtilāfa anna fārāna makkatu wa-qad qāla fī l-taurāti: inna llāha askana hājara wa-bnahā ismā'īla fārāna:* and see 274. Yāqūt, *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. Fārān. Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Jawāb al-ṣaḥiḥ li-man baddala dīna l-masīḥ*, iii, 300-1, 304-6, 312, 326, 331.

¹⁵ Yāqūt, *Mu'jam*, s.v. Fārān: *qūla: huwa ismun li-jibālī makka . . . wa-fī l-taurāti: jā'a llāhu min sīnā'a wa-ashraqa min sā'ir wa-sta'lana min fārāna; majī'uhu min sīnā'a taklīmuhu li-mūsā 'alayhi l-salām; wa-ishraquhu min sā'ira, wa-hiya jibālu filasṭīna, huwa inzāluhu l-injīla 'alā 'isā 'alayhi l-salām; wa-stī'lānuhu min jibālī fārāna inzāluhu l-qur'āna 'alā muḥammadīn, ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam. qālū: wa-fārān jibālu makkata.*

¹⁶ Al-'Aynī, *'Umdat al-qārī, sharḥ ṣaḥiḥ al-bukhārī* (Cairo, [reprint Beirut]), IX, 214 inf.; Yāqūt, *Mu'jam*, s.v. Kūthā.

¹⁷ See 'Izz al-Dīn Abū Muḥammad 'Abd al-'Azīz b. 'Abd al-Salām al-Sulamī, *Targhib ahlī l-islām fī suknā l-shām*, ed. Muḥammad Shakūr al-Mayādīnī, al-Zarqā' (1407/1987).

¹⁸ Muqāṭil b. Sulaymān, *Tafsīr*, MS Ahmet III, 74/2, fol. 30b. 'Izz al-Dīn, *Targhib ahlī l-islām*, 39. Abū Ḥafṣ 'Umar b. Muḥammad b. al-Khiḍr al-Mausilī, *Kitāb al-wasīla* (Hyderabad, 1399/1979), V/1, 187 inf.-188 sup.

¹⁹ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, ed. Diyā' al-Dīn al-'Umarī (Beirut, 1401/1981), II, 299. Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār al-anwār*, LX, 202.

²⁰ Anonymous, *History of the Prophets* [Arabic], MS Br. Mus. Or. 1510, fol. 38a.

death of Luqmān, were stricken by hunger and died on one day provide another instance; their graves are in Ramla.²¹ Luqmān is said to be buried between the mosque of Ramla and its market²² although another tradition says that he is buried near Tiberias.²³

The high position of Ramla is reflected in a tradition recorded on the authority of Ka'b al-Aḥbār: On the Day of Resurrection Ramla will argue, interceding on behalf of the people buried in its cemetery, complaining of their being punished even though they are buried in Ramla.²⁴

The problem of the graves of prophets is noteworthy. The number of graves of prophets and saints in a given city serves as a measure of its status and position on the map of holy places as drawn by the Muslim community.²⁵ This concept was deduced from the interpretation of a verse allegedly recorded in the Torah, saying that *Shām* is God's treasury on earth and in it is God's treasury of His servants; the "treasury of His servants" was said to mean the graves of the prophets: Ibrāhīm, Ishāq and Ya'qūb.²⁶

The stories of Ramla, a town founded in the period of the Umayyads, may serve as a good example for the sanctification of places which did not exist in the early period. Stories about their sanctity became current in the period following their foundation or their conquest.

The Prophet is said to have prayed on his nocturnal journey, the *isrā'*, on the spot on which the mosque of Damascus was later built.²⁷ This event endowed the area of the mosque with its sanctity. We may gain some notion of the beliefs and tenets of the people of Syria concerning the sanctity of the mosque of Damascus from a report about a dispute between two believers as to the value of a prayer in the Damascus mosque and as to the merits of pious deeds and ritual practices in Syria. The famous scholar Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728 H.) was asked his opinion as to

²¹ Ibid., fol. 133b, ult. Al-Māzandarānī, *Manāqib salmān* (n.p., 1285 [lithograph]), 17.

²² Anonymous, *History of the Prophets*, [Arabic], MS Br. Mus. Or. 1510, fol. 133b inf.

²³ Al-Māzandarānī, *Manāqib salmān*, 17.

²⁴ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, II, 299.

²⁵ Al-Fākihī, *Ta'rīkh Makka*, MS Leiden, Or. 463, fol. 357a: *dhikru mauḍi'i qubūr 'adhārā banāti ismā'il 'alayhi l-salām min masjidi l-ḥarām . . .*; but see al-kalbī 'an abī ṣāliḥ 'anī bni 'abbāsīn [r] qāla: *fī l-masjidi l-ḥarāmī qabrāni laysa fīhi ghayruhumā: qabru ismā'ila wa-shu'aybin*. Al-Fāṣī, *Shifā'u l-gharām bi-akhbārī l-baladi l-ḥarā* (Beirut, [reprint], n.d.), I, 199. Ibn al-Faqīh al-Hamadhānī, *Kitāb al-buldān*, ed. M.J. De Goeje (Leiden, 1885), 17: *wa-qāla 'alayhi l-salāmu inna qabra hūda wa-shu'aybin wa-ṣāliḥīn fīmā bayna zamzama wa-l-maqāmi wa-inna fī l-ka'bati qabra thalāthi mi'ati nabiyyin wa-mā bayna l-rukni l-yamānī ilā l-rukni l-aswadi qabru sab'ina nabiyyan*.

²⁶ Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, III, 112 sup.: Ka'b: *maktūbun fī l-taurāti: inna l-shāma kanzu llāhi 'azza wa-jalla min arḍihi, bihā kanzu llāhi min 'ibādihī, ya'nī bihā qubūra l-anbiyā'i: ibrahīma wa-ishāqa wa-ya'qūba . . .*

²⁷ Abū Ḥafṣ 'Umar al-Mausilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 188.

whether one prayer in the mosque of the Umayyads in Damascus equals ninety prayers [elsewhere], whether it is true that three hundred prophets are buried in this mosque, that a believer who passes a night sleeping in Syria gets the same reward as a believer who passes a night in vigilance in 'Irāq, that a believer who observes a voluntary fast in 'Irāq is like a believer who does not observe such a fast in Syria, and whether God, in blessing the two places, placed seventy parts of the blessing in Syria and only one part in 'Irāq. Ibn Taymiyya denied the tradition about the special value of prayer in the mosque of the Umayyads in Damascus; he did however uphold the view that God is much better praised in this mosque than in any other. He denied the tradition about the three hundred prophets buried in the Damascus mosque and about special rewards for the performance of ritual practices in Syria; but he confirmed that the Prophet praised Syria and set store by the pious deeds of the people of Syria.²⁸ In another of his writings Ibn Taymiyya took exception to the practice of "falsifying" tombs, i.e., falsely ascribing graves to eminent Islamic personages.²⁹

The famous scholar of *ḥadīth* 'Abd al-'Azīz al-Kattānī³⁰ made plain his opinion about the graves of prophets: none of the graves is certified except the tomb of the Prophet. Others maintained that the grave of Abraham was also assured. The early author Ibn Sa'd counted as certain the graves of Ismā'īl under the spout of the Ka'ba, the grave of Hūd in Yemen, as well as the grave of the Prophet.³¹

Ibn Taymiyya records as spurious the tomb of Ubayy b. Ka'b in Damascus (he died in Medina), the tombs of Umm Ḥabība and Umm Salama and the tombs of other wives of the Prophet outside Damascus. It is however probable that there is a tomb of the *ṣaḥābiyya* Umm Salama bint Yazīd b. al-Sakan, who indeed died in Syria. It is probable too that the tomb of Bilāl, (the Prophet's *mu'adhdhin*), is situated at the *bāb al-ṣaghīr* in Damascus.³²

Of special interest are the data given by Ibn Taymiyya as to the tombs of caliphs and governors allegedly buried in Damascus. The tomb of Hūd in the mosque of Damascus is not genuine; Hūd was sent as prophet in the Yemen and performed the pilgrimage to Mecca; he did not go to Syria. This tomb is in fact that of the pious Mu'āwiya b. Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya, who was Caliph for a short time and died without appointing an heir. The tomb of Khālīd (obviously b. Walīd) in Ḥimṣ is

²⁸ Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Fatāwā l-kubrā*, ed. Ḥasanayn Muḥammad Makhlūf (Beirut, 1386/1966, [reprint]), I, 371, no. 226.

²⁹ Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'u l-ṣirāṭi l-mustaqīm mukhālāfatū aṣḥābi l-jahīm*, ed. Muḥammad Ḥamid al-Fiḳī (Cairo, 1369), 316–20.

³⁰ Called al-Katabī in the text, see al-Dhahabī, *Tadhkirat al-ḥuffāz* (Hyderabad, 1376/1957), III, 1170, no. 1024.

³¹ Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Fatāwā l-kubrā*, IV, 449.

³² *Ibid.*

said to be that of Khālīd b. Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya, the brother of Mu'āwiya b. Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya mentioned above. 'Alī's tomb is in the government hall (*qaṣr al-imāra*) in Kūfa (not in Najaf), Mu'āwiya was buried in the government hall in Damascus and 'Amr (b. al-'Āṣ) was buried in the government hall in Egypt; they were buried there out of fear that the Khawārij would exhume their graves.³³ Another author, Ibn Junghul (d. 951 H.), identifies some of these spurious tombs.³⁴

We find traditions greatly exaggerating the value of prayers in Damascus; one such tradition says that a prayer in the mosque of Damascus is worth thirty thousand prayers performed in another mosque.³⁵

Damascus was included in the list of the four cities of Paradise on earth, the others being Mecca, Medina, and Jerusalem.³⁶ A peculiar list of the cities of Paradise is recorded on the authority of Ka'b al-Aḥbār; it includes Jerusalem, Ḥimṣ, Damascus, Bayt Jibrīn and Ṣafār in Yemen.³⁷ A different tradition, said to have been transmitted by Yamanī historians, records Damascus, Marw, and Ṣan'ā'.³⁸ A Shī'ī source records another list of Paradise cities: Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem, and "a city between Sayḥān and Jayḥān called al-Manṣūra and guarded by angels, which is in fact Maṣīṣa."³⁹

The particular flavor of traditions dedicated to the praises of Syria and Damascus is reflected in a tradition ascribed to the Companion 'Abdallāh b. Maṣ'ūd: when God created the world He divided Good

³³ Ibid., 450–451.

³⁴ Ibn Junghul, *Ta'rikh*, MS Br. Library, Or. 5912/1, fol. 36b (the tomb of Hūd in the mosque of Damascus is the tomb of Mu'āwiya; and see *ibid.* on the tombs of 'Amr b. al-'Āṣ and 'Alī).

³⁵ Al-Ṣaffūrī, *Nuzhat al-majālis wa-muntakhab al-nafā'is* (Beirut, n.d.), 341 inf.

³⁶ Muḥammad b. Ṭūlūn al-Ṣāliḥī, *al-Qalā'id al-jawhariyya fi ta'rikhi l-ṣāliḥiyya*, ed. Muḥammad Aḥmad Dahmān (Damascus, 1401/1981), II, 513. Ismā'īl Muḥammad al-'Ajlūnī l-Jarrāḥī [= al-Jarrāḥī], *Kashf al-khafā' wa-muzīlu l-ilbās 'ammā shtahara min al-aḥādīthi 'alā alsinati l-nās* (Beirut, 1351), I, 450 sup., no. 1466. 'Alī b. Muḥammad b. 'Arāq al-Kinānī [= Ibn 'Arāq], *Tanzīhu l-sharī'ati l-marfū'a 'anī l-aḥādīthi l-shanī'ati l-mawḍū'a*, ed. 'Abd al-Wahhāb 'Abd al-Laṭīf and 'Abdallāh Muḥammad al-Ṣadiq (Beirut, 1399/1979), II, 48, no. 7. Al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-idāl fi naqdī l-rijāl*, ed. 'Alī Muḥammad al-Bijāwī (Cairo, 1382/1963), IV, 346, no. 9400. Ibn al-Jauzī, *Kitābu l-mawḍū'āt*, ed. 'Abd al-Rahmān 'Uthmān, al-Madīna al-munawwara (1386/1966), II, 51. Al-Shaukānī, *al-Fawā'id al-majmū'a fi l-aḥādīthi l-mawḍū'a*, ed. 'Abd al-Rahmān b. Yaḥyā l-Mu'allamī l-Yamānī (Beirut, 1392), 428, no. 1229, and see the editor's comments.

³⁷ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rikh*, II, 304. Al-Shaukānī, *al-Fawā'id al-majmū'a*, 428, no. 1229, and see al-Fasawī, *ibid.*, the cities of Hell: Qusṭanṭīniyya, al-Ṭuwāna, Anṭākiyya, Tadmur and Ṣan'ā' in Yemen; al-Shaukānī however stresses that by Ṣan'ā' of Hell the city Ṣan'ā' in Rūm is meant.

³⁸ Al-Shaukānī, *al-Fawā'id al-majmū'a*, p. 428, no. 1230.

³⁹ Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl al-Naysābūrī, *Raḍātu l-wa'izīn*, ed. Muḥammad Mahdī l-Sayyid Ḥasan al-Kharsān (Najaf, 1386/1966), 409: *arba'u madā'in min al-janna: makkatu wa-l-madīnatu wa-baytu l-maqdis wa-madīnatun bayna sayḥān wa-jayḥān yuqālu lahā manṣūra wa-hiya maṣīṣa mahfūzatun bi-l-malā'ikati*.

(*al-khayr*) into ten parts; nine-tenths He placed in Syria, and one part in the rest of the world. Similarly God divided Evil (*al-sharr*) into ten parts: one part He placed in Syria, and nine parts in the rest of the world.⁴⁰

The location of the bad things of the rest of the world were located deduced from a tradition about a conversation 'Umar held with Ka'b al-Aḥbār when they established the place of the mosque of Jerusalem. 'Umar was invited on that occasion by the people of 'Irāq to visit them in the same way as he visited the people of Jerusalem, but was swayed by Ka'b to refuse the invitation; Ka'b argued that 'Irāq contained the rebellious *jinn*, that Hārūt and Mārūt taught people witchcraft in 'Irāq and that 'Irāq harbored nine tenths of the world's evil (*sharr*); the people of 'Irāq, in addition, were affected by an incurable disease: they were too wealthy.⁴¹ Needless to say, this is a manifest Syrian anti-'Irāqī tradition.

It is only to be expected that there should be a widely circulated prophetic tradition forbidding the performing of prayers in the "Land of Bābil," because the land of Bābil is cursed.⁴²

The people of *Shām*, says an utterance ascribed to the Prophet, will continue to fight their enemies for a just cause until the last of them will fight the Dajjāl.⁴³ The Prophet predicted that *Shām* would be conquered and summoned the believers to move to the conquered territories, as *Shām* was the best of the lands and its people would be the chosen

⁴⁰ Al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, IX, 198, no. 8881. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id wa-manba' al-fawā'id* (Beirut, 1967), X, 60. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa*, II, 295.

⁴¹ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl fī sunan al-aqwāl wa-l-af'āl* (Hyderabad, 1390/1970), XVII, 120, no. 376.

⁴² Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Iqtidā'*, 81. Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 377: 'Alī: ... mā kuntu uṣallī bi-ardīn khusīfa bihā thalātha marrātin. And see ib.: 'an 'aliyyin annahu kariha l-ṣalāta fī l-khusūf. And see ib.: anna 'aliyyan marra bi-jānibin min bābil falam yuṣallī bihā. Al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, IV, 189. Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 96. L 'A, s.v. bbl. Al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā* (Hyderabad, 1346), II, 451: 'Alī inna ḥabībī ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam nahānī an uṣallīya fī l-maqburati wa-nahānī an uṣallīya fī ardī bābila fa-innahā mal'ūnatun. Mubārak b. Muḥammad Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl min aḥādīthi l-rasūl* [s], ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid al-Fiqrī (Cairo, 1370/1951), VI, 314, no. 3673. 'Abdallāh b. Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, *Masā'ilu l-imām aḥmad b. ḥanbal*, ed. 'Alī b. Sulaymān al-Muḥannā (al-Madīna al-munawwara, 1406/1986), I, 228–29, no. 309 and see the references of the editor.

⁴³ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, X, 60–61 sup. Abū 'Alī Ḥanbal b. Ishāq al-Shaybānī, *Kitāb al-ḥaṣṣa* [al-juz' al-rābi'], MS Zāhiriyya, majmū'a 38/4, fol. 46b. Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisānu l-mizān* (Hyderabad, 1331 [reprint]), VI, 223, no. 785: 'an abī ḥurayrata marfū'an: lā tazālū 'iṣābatun min ummatī yuqātilūna 'alā abwābi dīmarī wa-mā ḥaulahā wa-'alā abwābi bayti l-maqdisi wa-mā ḥaulahā lā yaḍurruhum khidhlānu man khadhlahum ṣābirīna 'alā l-ḥaqqi ilā an taqūma l-sā'atu. Al-Bukhārī, *al-Ta'rīkh al-kabīr* (Hyderabad, 1384/1964), IV, 248, no. 2691 [II, 2 of the MS]. Ḍiyyā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il bayt al-maqdis*, 72–3. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, II, 297–98.

among the believers.⁴⁴ The Prophet said that no good could be expected among the believers if the people of *al-Shām* were corrupted.⁴⁵ According to another version the Prophet stated that there would be no good in his community if the people of *al-Shām* perished: ‘*ani l-nabiyyi, ṣallā llāhu ‘alayhi wa-sallam, qāla: idhā halaka ahlu l-shāmi fa-lā khayra fī ummatī*.’⁴⁶ During the bloody war with Syria no less a person than ‘Alī prohibited cursing its people because among them were the saintly *abdāl*.⁴⁷

An eminent holy place in Syria, the mountain of Qāsiyūn, was ordered by God to give up its shade and blessing in favor of the mountain of Jerusalem (*jabal bayt al-maqdis*). As a reward God will order to erect on this mountain a House in which He will be worshipped for forty years after the devastation (*kharāb*) of the world.⁴⁸ It is evident that this tradition gives us an instance of the idea current in popular Islamic tradition about the mutual dependence and coordination of sanctuaries in the Muslim world. This belief is clearly reflected in the stories of the holy places and their virtues. The mountain of Qāsiyūn is also the place where Jesus and his mother found refuge when they escaped the persecution of the Jews; on this mountain the son of Ādam killed his brother, and on the slopes of this mountain Abraham was born.⁴⁹ This is an innovative tradition about the birthplace of Abraham. The traditions mentioned above are often denied; the story saying that Abraham was born on this spot is firmly rejected.⁵⁰

The cave in this mountain was famous for the efficacy of prayers and invocations; the prophet Ilyās sought refuge in this place; Ibrāhīm, Mūsā, ‘Isā and Ayyūb prayed and made invocations in this cave;⁵¹ the place was known as the *mustaghāth al-anbiyā’* and is, in connection with this virtue, linked with the story of the Prophet. When the Prophet faced a plot of the unbelievers against him in Mecca and suffered from their persecution, he wished to set out to this cave in order to invoke God to damn them; Jibrīl however persuaded him to seek refuge from his people in one of the caves of Mecca.⁵²

⁴⁴ Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma‘ al-zawā’id*, X, 58–59.

⁴⁵ Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, III, 112–13. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma‘rifa wa-l-ta’rikh*, II, 295–96.

⁴⁶ Nu‘aym b. Ḥammād, *Kitāb al-ḥitan*, MS Br. Mus. Or. 9449, fol. 61b.

⁴⁷ Al-Mazandarānī, *Manāqib Salmān*, 17. Nu‘aym b. Ḥammād, *Kitāb al-ḥitan*, fol. 62a. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma‘rifa wa-l-ta’rikh*, II, 305 inf.

⁴⁸ Ibn Ṭūlūn, *al-Qalā’id al-jauhariyya*, I, 88.

⁴⁹ Ibn Ṭūlūn, *al-Qalā’id al-jauhariyya*, I, 89. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-‘ummāl*, XVII, 121, no. 378.

⁵⁰ Ibn Ṭūlūn, *al-Qalā’id al-jauhariyya*, I, 90 sup.; see the different versions about the place in which Abraham was born.

⁵¹ Muḥammad Naṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī, *Takhrīj aḥādīth faḍā’ili l-shām wa-dimashq*, 43, no. 19.

⁵² Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-‘ummāl*, XVII, 121, no. 378. Ibn Ṭūlūn, *al-Qalā’id*

The stories about the virtues of holy places stress, as mentioned above, the coordination of sanctuaries with each other, a fact that increases the efficacy of the ritual practices. Thus anyone who begins a pilgrimage to Mecca, or an *‘umra*, from the mosque of al-Aqṣā, God will forgive him the sins he committed in the past.⁵³

The Prophet stated that a pilgrimage performed from ‘Umān has the value of two pilgrimages.⁵⁴ He who visits both the tomb of the Prophet in Medina and the tomb of Abraham in Hebron in the same year will enter Paradise.⁵⁵

In a later period of Islam, in the stormy times of revolts in the Muslim empire, during which the journey to Mecca and Medina was impeded or even made impossible, Hebron became a substitute for Medina. According to a tradition ascribed to the Jewish convert Ka‘b al-Aḥbār, a believer who is impeded from visiting the tomb of the Prophet in Medina should visit the tomb of Abraham in Hebron.⁵⁶

Another Jewish convert, ‘Abdallāh b. Salām, is said to have stated that a visit to the grave of Abraham and a prayer performed at the tomb is “pilgrimage of the poor.”⁵⁷ The Prophet predicted that Hebron would become a place of refuge. Unfortunately a certain Companion of the Prophet, one of the leaders of the revolt against ‘Uthmān, who sought refuge in Hebron at the time of Mu‘āwiya, was caught there by a man of Mu‘āwiya’s forces. He asked for his life, arguing that he was one of the “People of the Tree” (i.e., the Companions who swore allegiance to the Prophet at Ḥudaybiyya, *aṣḥāb al-shajara*); the rude soldier responded, however, that there were plenty of trees in Hebron and killed him.⁵⁸ The

al-jauhariyya, I, 93–95. Al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 188. Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī, *Takhrīj aḥādīth* . . . , 45–46, no. 21.

⁵³ Al-‘Aqūlī, *‘Arf al-ṭib min akhbārī makkata wa-madīnati l-habīb*, MS Leiden Or. 493, fol. 79a inf. Al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i’tidāl*, III, 483, no. 7236. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-zam‘ān*, 251–52, no. 1021. Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī, *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-da‘ifa wa-l-mawḍū‘a* (Beirut, 1405/1985), I, 248, no. 211; and see the comments of al-Albānī. Diyā‘u l-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā’il bayti l-maqdis*, 88, no. 59; and see *ibid.* 89–90, nos. 60–62. Al-Wāsiṭī, *Faḍā’ilu l-bayti l-muqaddas*, ed. I. Hasson (Jerusalem, 1979), 58–59, nos. 91–92; and see the references of the editor. Al-Bayhaqī, *al-Jāmi‘ li-shu‘abi l-imān*, ed. ‘Abd al-‘Alīyy ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd Ḥamīd (Bombay, 1409/1988), VII, 578–79, no. 3737; and see the references of the editor.

⁵⁴ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-ummāl*, XIII, 264, no. 1460. Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī, *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-da‘ifa* . . . , I, 249, no. 213.

⁵⁵ Ibn Taymiyya, *Majmū‘atu l-rasā’il l-kubrā* (Beirut, 1392/1972), II, 356: *al-risāla fī l-kalām ‘alā l-quṣṣāṣ*; the tradition is marked by Ibn Taymiyya as *ḥadīth kadhib mawḍū‘*.

⁵⁶ Anonymous, *History of the Prophets* [Arabic], MS Br. Mus. Or. 1510, fol. 54b. Al-Khuwārizmī, *Mukhtaṣar ithārati l-targhib wa-l-tashwīq ilā l-masājidi l-thalāthati wa-ilā l-bayti l-atīq*, MS Br. Mus. Or. 4584, fols. 21b, 27b.

⁵⁷ Anonymous, *History of the Prophets*, MS Br. Mus. Or. 1510, fol. 55a.

⁵⁸ Ibn al-Athīr, *Uṣd al-ghāba fī ma‘rifati l-ṣaḥāba* (Cairo, 1280 [repr. Tehran]), III, 310 sup.; and see *ibid.* the prediction of the Prophet: *sa-yakhruju nāsun min ummatī yuqṭalūna bi-jabali l-khaṭīl*.

Prophet stated that the mountain of Hebron was sacred and was revealed by God to the prophets of the Banū Isrāʾīl in olden times as a place of refuge to which they might escape in a period of sedition (*fitna*) in order to preserve their belief (*dīnuhum*).⁵⁹ Jesus, when he passed by Hebron, is said to have asked God to bestow on that town the following graces: he asked to turn the mountain of Hebron into a secure asylum for every frightened person (*khāʾif*), to make the people of the mountain secure from wild beasts, and to remain fertile when all other places would be affected by drought.⁶⁰

A miraculous story links the building of the tomb of Abraham in Hebron with the person of Sulaymān. Sulaymān was ordered in a dream to build a tomb on the grave of God's Friend, Abraham, in order that he may be known by it. The dream repeated itself three times during three nights; but Sulaymān did not know the place. He asked God about it and was guided by Him to the required spot, from which light rises to heaven. When Sulaymān got up in the morning he saw the place, put a mark on it and the *jinn* built the tomb for him at this spot. One can see how huge the stones of the tomb are: ten men or more cannot carry a single stone. When the tomb was about to be finished Sulaymān left the tomb through its top part; the building was then closed from all sides and none could enter it. The visitors to the tomb could perform the ritual practices of the *ziyāra* from outside the building only. When the Crusaders captured the city they opened a door in the building and turned it into a church; they made drawings of the graves of the ancestors inside the building assigning them individually to Abraham, Ishāq, Yaʿqūb etc. Things went on unchanged in this manner until the time of the author.⁶¹

A tradition ascribed to Ibn ʿAbbās reports how God sanctified the place of the grave of Abraham. When God decided that Abraham was to die He announced this to the world. The hilly plain of Ḥibrā stood humbly up in the Presence of God and He addressed Ḥibrā: "You are my chosen one, you are my holy one, you are my sanctuary (*anti baytu maqdisi*), in you I placed the treasury of my knowledge, upon you I shall let down my mercy and my blessings, and to you I shall gather my servants (on the Day of Resurrection). Therefore blessed is the man who puts his forehead on you (i.e., on the tomb erected upon you), prostrating himself in front of Me; I shall let him drink from the Presence of my

⁵⁹ Nuʿaym b. Ḥammād, *Kitāb al-ḥitan*, MS Br. Mus., fol. 65b: *qāla rasūlu llāhi: jabalu l-khalīlī jabalun muqaddasun wa-inna l-fitnata lammā zaharat fī banī isrāʾīla auḥā llāhu taʾālā ilā anbiyāʾihim an yafirru bi-dīnihim ilā jabali l-khalīlī*. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-ummāl*, XIII, 260, no. 1429 (from Nuʿaym's *Fitan*); and see this tradition *ibid.*, XIII, 247, no. 1370.

⁶⁰ Nuʿaym b. Ḥammād, *Kitāb al-ḥitan*, fol. 65a.

⁶¹ Al-ʿAbdarī [= Ibn al-Ḥājj], *al-Madkhal* (Beirut, 1972), IV, 258.

Holiness, and shall grant him security from the horrors of the Day of Resurrection and shall lodge him in Paradise by my Mercy. Therefore blessed are you, blessed are you, blessed are you, I shall bury my Friend (Abraham) in you.”⁶²

According to Abū Bakr Aḥmad b. ‘Amr b. Jābir, scholars of the Prophetic tradition (*ahl al-‘ilm al-sharīf*) have unanimously endorsed the validity of the location of the graves of Abraham, Ishāq, and Ya‘qūb, and their wives. Any believer who goes against this is a man of evil innovations, one who embraces deviations or who is in error: *mā yaṭ‘anu fī dhālika illā rajulun min ahli l-bida‘i wa-l-zayghī wa-l-ḍalālātī, na‘ūdhu bi-llāhi min dhālika*.⁶³

The texts of the invocations and prayers said at the tomb were prescribed in great detail and the order of the visit, including the visit to the tombs of the patriarchs and their wives, was carefully planned. After visiting the tombs of the patriarchs and their wives, the believers were urged to go down to the grave of Joseph (*yūsuf* [!]) in the valley (*al-wādī* [!]) and make an invocation there. Believers who visited the tomb in the past claimed that their prayers, invocations, and supplications were answered.⁶⁴

Ibn al-Ḥājj warns visitors to the grave not to attend the vicious innovative practices of the people of Hebron who dance and sing in groups after the afternoon prayer (*ṣalāt al-‘aṣr*). He recommends that believers refrain from taking part in the afternoon performances, when drums and trumpets are beaten; such a performance they call *naubat al-khalīl*. Another reprehensible innovation is the distribution of lentils which they call *al-‘adas al-ibrāhīmī*. Ibn al-Ḥājj points out that the designation *al-‘adas al-ibrāhīmī* is incorrect, as Abraham did not entertain his guests with lentils.⁶⁵

It was once again Ibn Taymiyya, that stalwart opponent of the tomb worship, who was adamant in denying the legendary stories about the building of the tomb. These stories he branded as unfounded inventions. He also rejected the tradition that Jibrīl bade the Prophet pray at the grave of his ancestor Abraham during his nocturnal journey, and perform a prayer at the birthplace of his brother Jesus. People of knowledge unanimously considered these traditions invented lies. Bayt Laḥm was a church of the Christians, and there was no merit in visiting it by Muslims, whether it was the birthplace of Jesus or not. None of the

⁶² Al-Khuwārizmī, *Mukhtaṣar ithārat al-targhib*, MS fol. 28b. Bahā’ al-Dīn Ibn ‘Asākir, *Risāla fī faḍā’il bayti l-maqdis*, MS Hebrew University, fol. 13a–b.

⁶³ Bahā’ al-Dīn Ibn ‘Asākir, *Risāla fī faḍā’il bayti l-maqdis*, MS fol. 14a. Al-Khuwārizmī, *Mukhtaṣar ithārat al-targhib*, MS fol. 14a.

⁶⁴ Bahā’ al-Dīn Ibn ‘Asākir, *Risāla fī faḍā’il bayti l-maqdis*, MS fol. 13b–14a. Al-Khuwārizmī, *Mukhtaṣar ithārat al-targhib*, MS fol. 40b.

⁶⁵ Al-‘Abdarī, *al-Madkhal*, IV, 259.

Companions nor any of the successors of the Companions, the *tābi'ūn*, went to pray or make invocations at the grave, or even to visit it. The believers had come more than once with 'Umar to *al-Shām*, and some of the Companions settled there but none of them had practiced things of this kind, and no mosque had been built on the grave at all. Only when the Christians captured Syria because of the impious *rāfiḍa* (Shī'ī extremists) who ruled Egypt, and gained control of the coastal territories and other localities, did they cut through Abraham's sepulchral chamber and set up a door over the tomb. It was the Christians who turned it into a place of worship, not the ancestors of the believers or pious Muslims.⁶⁶

Places and localities are rewarded according to their sympathy and help for sanctuaries and saintly believers afflicted by distress; vicious places and sinful groups are accordingly punished. According to a report of Ka'b (al-Aḥbār), Qusṭanṭīniyya rejoiced at the devastation of Jerusalem (*kharāb bayt al-maqdis*); God reproached the vicious city and predicted that He would severely punish the sinful city.⁶⁷ In contrast to Qusṭanṭīniyya, the attitude of Kaskar was sympathetic: when Bukhtanaṣṣar destroyed Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*) all the places on earth wept; but Kaskar surpassed all other places in weeping. As a reward, God promised that a mosque would be built there, where there would be abundant supplications and invocations to which God would respond favorably. People explained the prediction as a reference to the mosque of Wāsiṭ.⁶⁸

Even birds are rewarded or punished according to their feelings towards the ruined sanctuaries dear to the hearts of the believers: the Prophet forbade killing swallows (*al-khaṭātīf*) because they wept for the destruction of the temple of Jerusalem.⁶⁹

Sometime there is an evident political tendency in this kind of traditions. Shī'ī stories concerning the role of Baṣra belong to this category: Heaven and Earth are said to have wept when Ḥusayn was killed. The only ones who did not weep were Baṣra, Damascus and the family of al-Ḥakam b. al-'Āṣ.⁷⁰

⁶⁶ Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā' al-ṣirāt*, 319, 331, 438–39; see e.g. 438: *wa-fīhi mā huwa mina l-mauḏū'āti l-mukhtaliqāt mithlu mā yarwīhi ba'ḍuhum fīhi*: "anna l-nabiyya ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam qāla lahu jibrīl: hādihā qabru abika ibrahīma, inzil fa-ṣalli fīhi, wa-hādihā baytu laḥmin maulidu akhika 'isā, inzil fa-ṣalli fīhi." And see 439: *wa-baytu laḥmin kanīsatun min kanā'isi l-naṣārā, laysa fī ityānīhā faḍīlatun 'inda l-muslimīna, sawā'an kāna maulida 'isā au lam yakun . . .*

⁶⁷ Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. al-Ḥusayn al-Naqqāsh, *Shifā'u l-ṣudūr al-muhadhdhab fī tafsīri l-qur'ān*, MS Chester Beatty 3389, fol. 40a sup. Ibn al-Faḥīh al-Hamadhānī, *Kitāb al-buldān*, ed. M.J. De Goeje (Leiden, 1885), 146. Abū Nu'aym al-Iṣfahānī, *Ḥilyat al-auliya'* (Beirut, 1387/1967), VI, 45.

⁶⁸ Baḥshal, *Ta'rīkh wāsiṭ*, ed. Kurkīs 'Awwād (Baghdad, 1387/1967), 35.

⁶⁹ Al-Daylamī, *Firdaus al-akhbār*, MS Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 187b sup.

⁷⁰ Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār al-anwār*, LX, 205; but 211: *bakā 'alayhi jamī'u mā khalaqa*

The *imām* Ja'far b. Muḥammad recorded sixteen groups of people hostile to the Shī'ī belief and the Shī'ī community, among them the people of Sijistān, Rayy, Maṣīl, and Baghdād.⁷¹ 'Alī enumerated the vices of Baṣra, to which he added a forceful curse on the city.⁷² Ḥudhayfa is stated to have said that the people of Baṣra would not open the gate of righteousness [*bāb al-hudā*] or leave the gate of error. The flood had been removed from all the places on earth except Baṣra.⁷³ To 'Abdallah [b. 'Amr] is attributed the saying that the footprints of Iblīs are extant in Baṣra, but that he hatched his eggs in Egypt.⁷⁴ The Prophet is said to have prohibited the believers to enter the city of Baṣra itself, warning them from earthquakes; he recommended however that they should visit the suburbs of Baṣra.⁷⁵

As against the Shī'ī descriptions of the vices of Baṣra and the predictions about its gloomy fate there are however traditions in praise of the city. The Prophet is said to have stated: "I know a place named al-Baṣra; it is a locality most direct in the position of the *qibla*, it has the greatest number of mosques and callers for prayer (*mu'adhdhinūn*) and it will be better protected from distress than other places."⁷⁶

It is evident that these contradictory utterances reflect of the political struggles of the early Islamic period.

The assignment of varying degrees of sanctity to various sanctuaries brought about competition between them, in contrast to the idea of coordination between them. This is seen clearly in the literature of the *fadā'il*. The rivalry was often prompted by political struggles in the Muslim empire, by ethnic rivalry and by the contests between the religious factions. In a very early period of Islam the sanctity of Damascus was confronted with that of al-Kūfa. 'Alī marked al-Kūfa as the treasure of belief, the convincing argument of Islam, the sword of God and His spear; God will aid the victory of the believers in the easternmost as well as in the westernmost parts of the earth through the people of Kūfa as

llāhu illā thalāthata ashyā'a: al-baṣra wa-dimashq wa-ālu 'uthmāna.

⁷¹ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 206, no. 5.

⁷² Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 204; and see the lengthy speech of 'Alī and his curse of Baṣra: *ibid.* 224, 226.

⁷³ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XI, 207, no. 973.

⁷⁴ Yaḥyā b. Ma'īn, *Ta'rikh*, ed. Aḥmad Muḥammad Nūr Yūsuf (Mecca, 1399/1979), II, 323, no. 3541.

⁷⁵ Ibn 'Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī'a*, II, 51, no. 15. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, XIII, 264, no. 1457. Al-Shaukānī, *al-Fawā'id al-majmū'a*, 434, no. 1241.

⁷⁶ Al-Daylamī, *Firdaus*, MS Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 90a: *sa-yuṣību ahla l-kūfati balā'un shadīd wa-sā'ira l-amṣāri illā ahla l-baṣrati fa-innahā aqwamuhā qiblatan. . .* Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *al-Maṭālibu l-'āliya*, IV, 163, no. 4240; Abū Dharr transmits an utterance of the Prophet: *fa-ammā ahlu l-baṣrati fa-aqwamu l-amṣāri qiblatan wa-aktharuhu mu'adhdhinan, yadfa'u llāhu 'anhum mā yakrahūna*. Abū Nu'aym, *Ḥilya*, VI, 349. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, XIII, 264, nos. 1458–59. Ibn 'Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī'a*, II, 58, no. 33.

He did through the people of the Hijāz.⁷⁷

The Companion 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd reported the following utterance of the Prophet: when the Prophet was engaged in his *isrā'* to the lowest heaven (*al-samā' al-dunyā*), Jibrīl showed him the mosque of Kūfa. The Prophet asked about the place and Jibrīl explained that it was a blessed mosque, containing an abundance of good (*kathīru l-khayri*) and possessing great blessing (*'azīmu l-baraka*). God chose it for His people and it will intercede for them on the Day of Resurrection.⁷⁸

According to another utterance of the Prophet, Jibrīl showed him the place of the mosque of Kūfa during his *mi'rāj* to Heaven (*lammā u'rīja bī ilā l-samā'*), and explained that that was the mosque of his ancestor Ādam; he enjoined him to go down and pray two *rak'as* there; the Prophet went down and performed the two *rak'as* there.⁷⁹ Needless to say, the story of Kūfa as a "station" for the Prophet's prayer during his nocturnal journey corresponds to the pro-Syrian story of the station of the Prophet's prayer in Damascus.⁸⁰ We find indeed an authoritative utterance of the *imām* Abū Ja'far (al-Bāqir) stating that the four distinguished mosques are the mosque in Mecca (*al-masjid al-ḥarām*), the mosque of the Prophet, the mosque of Jerusalem and the mosque of Kūfa. A prescribed prayer (*al-farīda*) in them has the value of a pilgrimage; a supererogatory prayer (*al-nāfila*) has the value of an *'umra* "the minor *hajj*."⁸¹

'Alī, according to one story, told a believer who was about to set out for a pilgrimage to Jerusalem, to sell his camel, to consume his provisions, and to pray in the mosque of Kūfa. 'Alī's recommendation is formulated in the same way as Prophet recommendation to perform the prayers in the mosque of Medina instead of making the journey to Jerusalem.⁸²

The mosque of Kūfa is one of the four distinguished mosques; a *rak'a* in this mosque has the value of ten *rak'as* in any other mosque; the blessing (*al-baraka*) of the mosque extends for twelve miles; in the corner of the mosque there burned the oven of the flood; Abraham prayed at the fifth column of the mosque; a thousand prophets and a thousand "trustees" (*waṣī*) prayed there. The mosque harbors the rod of Moses and the gourd-plant (*yaqṭīn*). Ya'ūq and Yaghūth (two idols worshipped in ancient times) perished there; the mosque is the *Fārūq* (that which

⁷⁷ Yāqūt, *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. al-Kūfa.

⁷⁸ Abū 'Abdallah Muḥammad b. 'Alī b. al-Ḥasan al-'Alawī al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa wa-faḍlu ahlīhā*, MS Zāhiriyya, majāmi' 93, fol. 282b. Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl al-Naysābūrī, *Raudat al-wā'izīn*, 336-37.

⁷⁹ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, MS fol. 283b.

⁸⁰ See above, note 28.

⁸¹ See Ibn Bābūyah, *Man lā yaḥḍuruḥu l-faqīh*, ed. Ḥasan al-Mūsawī l-Kharsān (Beirut, 1401/1981), I, 148, no. 683 (and the four mosques chosen by God: Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem and Kūfa; al-Majlisī, *Biḥār*, LX, 204, ult.-205).

⁸² See above, note 5.

distinguishes between right and wrong); from the mosque there is a path to the mountain of Ahwāz. In this mosque is the Nūḥ's place of prayer (*muṣallā*). From this mosque there will be gathered seventy thousand of the believers who will enter Paradise without being interrogated or judged (*laysa 'alayhim ḥisāb*). Its center rests in one of the gardens of Paradise, it contains three of the wells of Paradise which remove the filth and purify the believers. If the people would know the virtue of the mosque they would come crawling towards it.⁸³

Some of the commentators of the Qur'ān used their freedom to interpret the word *rabwa* (Sūra 23:50) as denoting Kūfa, and the word *ma'īn* as denoting the Euphrates.⁸⁴ It is evident that this is a Shī'ī interpretation of the words of the Qur'ān which was meant to confront the Umayyad, pro-Syrian interpretation mentioned above.⁸⁵

Since ancient times the Jews used the outskirts of Kūfa as a burial ground for their dead; they believed that seventy thousand dead would be raised from this cemetery on the Day of Resurrection and would enter Paradise without being subjected to questioning and judgment. When 'Alī heard this opinion from the Ra's Jālūt he countered that the seventy thousand to be raised on the Day of Resurrection and introduced to Paradise would be believing Muslims. 'Alī asserted that the grave just outside al-Kūfa was that of Yahūdha b. Ya'qūb, as well as the grave of Hūd.⁸⁶ 'Alī bought the territory between Najaf and al-Ḥīra as far as al-Kūfa from the *dihqāns* and paid forty thousand dirhams for it. The purpose of the transaction was to enable the believers to rise on the Day of Resurrection from land belonging to 'Alī.⁸⁷ A similar transaction was carried out in ancient times by Ibrāhīm: he acquired these very lands from the people of Bāniqiyā, paying a hundred sheep (*ghanam*); Bāniqiyā in Aramaic means a hundred sheep. He consecrated the place whose sanctity was revealed to him and named it al-Qādisiyya. This territory thus became the point from which Ibrāhīm set out for his *hijra*.⁸⁸

At the end of time, during the unjust wars (*fitan*), when the *mahdī* will be sent, the happiest people will be the people of Kūfa.⁸⁹ Never will a tyrant (*jabbār*) set out to annihilate it without being afflicted by God with a mortal blow.⁹⁰

⁸³ Yāqūt, *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. al-Kūfa. Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl, *Rauḍat al-wa'izīn*, 410 inf.

⁸⁴ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, MS fols. 289a-b. Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār*, LX, 202. Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl, *Rauḍat al-wa'izīn*, 408.

⁸⁵ See above at notes 19-20.

⁸⁶ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, MS fols. 286b, 287a-b, 288a.

⁸⁷ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, MS fol. 286a.

⁸⁸ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, fols. 284b.-85a.

⁸⁹ Ibn Bābūyah al-Qummī, *Man lā yaḥḍuruḥu l-faqīh*, I, 150 inf. (the *mahdī* will pray in the mosque of Kūfa). Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, fol. 283a.

⁹⁰ Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, fol. 283b. Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār al-anwār*, LX, 211, no. 18.

Ibrāhīm is said to have intended to utter an invocation against the people of 'Irāq; but God forbade him to do so because He had placed among the people of 'Irāq the treasures of His knowledge and located mercy in their hearts.⁹¹

In a significant tradition attributed to Ja'far al-Šādiq he is said to have defined the values of the three distinguished mosques and counted the rewards for ritual practices performed in them: Mecca, Medina, and Kūfa are the *ḥaram* of God, of the Prophet and of 'Alī; one prayer in Mecca has the value of a hundred thousand prayers elsewhere, and one dirham given there as charity (*ṣadaqa*) has the value of a hundred thousand dirhams. In Medina one prayer has the value of ten thousand prayers and one dirham has the value of ten thousand dirhams. In Kūfa one prayer has the value of a thousand prayers, but the value of one dirham given as charity is not mentioned.⁹² The sanctity of the *ḥaram* of Kūfa is here explicitly and authoritatively confirmed as a distinguished third sanctuary approved of by God, the Prophet and 'Alī; Jerusalem is not mentioned at all, but is replaced by Kūfa.⁹³

A concise utterance by 'Alī records clearly the tradition of the three distinguished mosques: the believers shall set out only to the three mosques of Mecca, Medina, and Kūfa (... *wa-qāla amūru l-mu'minīn 'alayhi l-salāmu: lā tushaddu l-riḥālu illā ilā thalāthati masājida: al-masjidi l-ḥarāmi, wa-masjidi rasūli llāhi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallama, wa-masjidi l-kūfati*).⁹⁴

Kūfa is the only place which expressed loyalty to 'Alī's authority and upheld the legitimacy of 'Alī's inheritance, the *wilāya*.⁹⁵

Kūfa's loyalty to 'Alī's authority (*wilāya*) was the reason why it was put on the cosmic map of virtues of the various distinguished places. This was reported in a Shī'ī tradition recorded on the authority of the Companion Anas b. Mālik (usually marked as a hypocrite, *munāfiq*, who denied the rights of 'Alī). When 'Alī came to the Prophet he embraced him and kissed him between his eyes; then the Prophet told him that God proposed the Heavens to accept the *wilāya* of 'Alī. The seventh Heaven preceded them and God therefore adorned this Heaven by establishing His Throne in it. Then the fourth Heaven outstripped the others and God embellished it by locating in it the *bayt al-ma'mūr* (the

⁹¹ Al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, I, 218.

⁹² Ibn Bābūyah, *Man lā yaḥḍuruḥu l-faqīh*, I, 147, no. 679. Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl, *Raudat al-wā'izīn*, 410.

⁹³ Al-Burāqī, *Ta'rīkh al-kūfa*, ed. Muḥammad Šādiq Āl Baḥr al-'ulūm (Najaf, 1379/1960), 32: '*ani l-madā'inī qāla: samī'tu abā 'abdi llāhi ('alayhi l-salāmu) yaqūlu: makkatu ḥaramu llāhi, wa-l-madīnatu ḥaramu muḥammadīn rasūli llāhi wa-l-kūfatu ḥaramu 'aliyyi bni abī ṭālibin ('alayhi l-salāmu); inna 'aliyyan ḥarrama mina l-kūfati mā ḥarrama ibrahīmu min makkata wa-mā ḥarrama muḥammadun mina l-madīna*.

⁹⁴ Ibn Bābūyah, *Man lā yaḥḍuruḥu*, I, 150, no. 695.

⁹⁵ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 209.

heavenly Ka'ba). Then the lowest Heaven followed and God rewarded it by adorning it with stars. Then God offered 'Alī's *wilāya* to the lands of the Earth: Mecca came forth first and God adorned it with the Ka'ba. It was followed by Medina, which God beautified by the presence of the Prophet. Medina was in turn followed by Kūfa and God adorned it by the person of 'Alī. Finally Qumm arrived and God embellished it by the Arabs and opened the doors of Paradise.⁹⁶ Kūfa is thus the chosen, perfect place of belief in Heaven and on earth, the perfect location of the true religion which champions the *wilāya* of 'Alī. Qumm follows it in this belief; Shī'ī compendia accord it a great many virtues and qualities.⁹⁷

As mentioned above, the sanctity of the holy places is enhanced by their mutual cooperation. Abū Qubays sheltered the Black Stone during the Flood; when Abraham came to Mecca in order to build the Ka'ba, Abū Qubays announced that it sheltered the Black Stone.⁹⁸ Ṭā'if was part of the Holy Land transferred by God to Ḥijāz; it performed the circumambulation of the Ka'ba seven times and remained in the region of Ḥijāz named al-Ṭā'if.⁹⁹ Qumm was originally part of Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*) and was moved to its place during the Flood.¹⁰⁰ Such is the case of the mosque of Kūfa as well: in due time the Black Stone will be moved by God to the mosque of Kūfa.¹⁰¹ This will certainly be the perfection of the sanctity of this holy place.

A nice example of intricate sanctity, combined from a variety of elements of veneration for the ancestors and Shī'ī *imāms* is shown by a story concerning the visit, *mazār*, of the grave of 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib. An adherent of the Shī'a came to the *imām* Abū 'Abdallah and informed him that he intended to set out to the *ghariyy* in order to visit the grave of 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib. The *imām* remarked that he was in fact going to visit the bones of Ādam, the body (*badan*) of Nūḥ and the

⁹⁶ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 212, no. 21.

⁹⁷ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 213–218.

⁹⁸ Abū l-Baqā' Muḥammad Bahā'u l-Dīn b. al-Ḍiyā' al-Makkī al-Ḥanafī al-Qurashī al-'Umari al-'Adawī, *Aḥwāl makkata wa-l-madīna*, MS Br. Mus. Or. 11865, fol. 138a. Al-Kalā'ī, *al-Iktifā' fī maghāzī rasūli llāhi wa-l-thalāthati l-khulafā'*, ed. Muṣṭafā 'Abd al-Wāḥid (Cairo, 1387/1968), I, 59–60. Abū Bakr al-Bakrī b. Muḥammad Shaṭā al-Dimyāṭī, *I'ānātu l-ṭālibīn 'alā ḥallī alfāzi l-faṭḥi l-mubīn* (Cairo, 1319 [repr. Beirut]), II, 275 inf. Al-Azraqī, *Akhbār makkata*, ed. Rushdī l-Ṣāliḥ Maḥās (Beirut-Makka al-mukarrama, 1399/1979), I, 65. Sulaymān b. Dāwūd al-Saqṣīnī, *Zahrāt al-riyāḍ wa-nuzhat al-qulūb al-mirād*, MS Hebrew Univ., Coll. Yahudah Ar. 571, 222 inf. [Abū Qubays was a mountain from the mountains of Khurāsān; it was moved to Mecca and sheltered the Black Stone].

⁹⁹ Al-Mazandarānī, *Manāqib salmān*, p. 17. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, X, 53–54. Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 124 inf.

¹⁰⁰ Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, LX, 213, no. 24.

¹⁰¹ Muḥammad b. al-Fattāl, *Rauḍat al-wā'izīn*, 337. Al-Ḥasanī, *Faḍlu l-kūfa*, MS fol. 287b. Al-Majlisī, *Bihār*, XXII, 86 inf.

corpse (*jism*) of 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib. The believer asked how it was possible that the bones of Ādam are in Kūfa since he descended in Sarandīb and people believe that his bones are placed in the mosque of Mecca (*baytu llāhi l-ḥarām*). The *imām* replied that God ordered Nūḥ in the ark to go around the Ka'ba seven times, which he did. Afterwards he went into the water, which reached up to his knees, and pulled out a coffin which contained the bones of Ādam. He carried the coffin in the ark and it went round the Ka'ba several times. He continued the journey in the ark until he arrived at the gate of Kūfa, in the middle of which was the mosque. God ordered the water to be swallowed by the earth (*ibla'ī mā'aki*) and the mosque became dry. The people who accompanied Nūḥ dispersed; Nūḥ took the coffin and buried it in the *ghariyy*. This was part of the mountain on which God addressed Moses, on which He consecrated Jesus, on which He took Abraham to Himself as Friend (*khalīl*), and on which He took Muḥammad to Himself as His Dear One (*ḥabīb*); God turned the place into an abode of the prophets. The *amīr al-mu'minīn*, 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib is buried next to his two noble ancestors, Ādam and Nūḥ. "Therefore while visiting al-Najaf you are visiting the bones of Ādam, the body of Nūḥ, the corpse of 'Alī b. Abī Ṭālib; you are visiting the ancestors, Muḥammad the Seal of the prophets and 'Alī the Lord of the Trustees (*sayyid al-waṣiyyīn*). The gates of Heaven will be opened for the invocations of the visitor; act thus and be not heedless of that which is good" (*fa-lā takun 'ani l-khayri nawwāman*).¹⁰²

The status of Medina in comparison with Mecca was secondary, in the opinion of the orthodox community. According to an utterance recorded on the authority of 'Ā'isha, God created Mecca and encompassed it by angels a thousand years before He created anything on Earth; then He attached Medina to it and eventually paired Medina with Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*); then a thousand years later He created the Earth with one stroke (*khalqan wāḥidan*).¹⁰³

According to some utterances ascribed to the Prophet Medina will be singled out in the fateful period of the false messiahs, the *dajjāl*. The *dajjāl* will be barred from entering the city, which will be guarded by angels.¹⁰⁴ According to another tradition Mecca and Medina will share this privilege: the *dajjāl* will enter every locality but Mecca and Medina.¹⁰⁵

¹⁰² Al-Majlisī, *Biḥār*, C, 258. Ghiyāth al-Dīn 'Abd al-Karīm b. Tāwūs, *Farḥat al-gharī fī ta'yīn qabri amīri l-mu'minīn 'alī b. abī ṭālib 'alayhi l-salām* (Najaf, 1368), 59–60.

¹⁰³ Al-Daylamī, *Firdaus al-akhbār*, MS Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 77a, penult. Diyā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis*, p. 49, no. 14.

¹⁰⁴ Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, V, 318, no. 2940; 369, no. 3016; 390, no. 3051; 402, no. 3073.

¹⁰⁵ Al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, X, 244 sup. Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Muḥallā*, VII, 281.

Another version, however, records two other places: the Ka'ba and Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*).¹⁰⁶ A third version extends the number of places from which the *dajjāl* will be barred: Mecca, Medina, Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*), and al-Ṭūr.¹⁰⁷

Tradition pointed out the virtues of Medina: it was the place of the *hijra* of the Prophet, the center from which he propagated his religion, the place where he died and in which he was buried.

The sincere sympathy of the Prophet and his affection for Medina is manifest in his declaration of Medina as a *ḥaram*; he acted as counterpart to Abraham: just as Abraham proclaimed Mecca as a *ḥaram*, so did the Prophet with Medina.¹⁰⁸

A peculiar tradition, obviously anti-Shī'ite, contains a denial attributed to 'Alī, in which he declares that there is no privilege granted him by the Prophet which he is supposed to keep in the sheath of his sword; in the sheath of his sword, 'Alī says, he only keeps the document of *tahrīm al-madīna*.¹⁰⁹

It is indeed these virtues and qualities, which gained wide circulation among the Muslim community, that stimulated the rivalry between these two highly revered localities. Against the background of ethnic differences, diverse economic interests, and social and political contests, the disputes as to the relative merits attached to these localities grew more vociferous.

In his thorough going study, *Matériaux pour l'étude du conflit de préséance entre la Mekke et Medine*,¹¹⁰ A. Arazi provides a detailed and

¹⁰⁶ *Umdat al-qārī*, X, 244 sup. Comp. Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis*, p. 60, no. 34.

¹⁰⁷ Al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, X, 244 sup. Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il*, 62-63, no. 36. And comp. al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' l-jawāmi'*, I, 744: ... *ma'qilu l-muslimīna mina l-malāḥim dimashq wa-ma'qiluhum mina l-dajjālī baytu l-maqdis wa-ma'qiluhum min yājūj wa-mājūj al-ṭur*.

¹⁰⁸ Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 121-122. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, III, 301-302. Al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, X, 227-231. Al-'Abdarī, *al-Madkhal*, II, 39. Al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, V, 196-201. Amīn Maḥmūd Khaṭṭāb, *Faṭḥu l-maliki l-ma'būd, takmilatu l-manḥali l-'adhbi l-maurūd, sharḥ sunan abī dāwūd* (Cairo, 1394/1974), II, 239-49. Al-Sinjārī, *Manā'ihu l-karam bi-akhbāri makkata wa-l-ḥaram*, MS Leiden Or. 7018, fol. 7a inf. (but comp. *ibid.*, fol. 7b sup.: *thumma qāla* (ay rasūlu llāhi, ṣ.), *inna makkata ḥarrahā llāhu wa-lam yuḥarrimhā l-nāsu fa-lā yaḥillu li-mri' in yu'minu bi-llāhi wa-l-yaumi l-ākhirī an yasfika bihā daman*. And see Abū Ya'lā, *al-Aḥkām al-sultāniyya*, ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid al-Fiḳī (Cairo, 1386/1966), 192. Al-Mundhirī, *al-Targhib wa-l-tarhib*, III, 62, no. 1771.

¹⁰⁹ Muḥammad b. 'Āṣim al-Thaqafī al-Iṣfahānī, *Juz'*, ed. Muḥid Khālīd 'Ayyid, (Riyāḍ, 1409), 125-26, no. 42; and see the editor's references. Ibrāhīm b. Ṭahmān, *Mashyakha*, ed. Muḥammad Ṭāhir Mālik (Damascus, 1403/1983), 104-107, no. 51: *fa-qāla* [i.e., 'Alī]: *mā 'ahida ilayya rasūlu llāhi 'ahdan lam ya'had hu ilā l-nāsi, ghayra anna fī qirābi sayfī ṣaḥīḥatan, fa-idhā fīhā: inna ibrahīma ḥarrahā makkata wa-anā uḥarrimu l-madīnata, wa-innahā ḥarrahā mā bayna ḥarrahāyihā*, and see the editor's abundant references there.

¹¹⁰ *JSAI*, 5 (1984), 177-235.

richly documented scrutiny of the ideological rivalry between Mecca and Medina.

Traditions touching upon the fundamental events of the life of the Prophet often conflict. Such is the case of the *hijra*, a crucial issue in the life and career of the Prophet. According to a widely circulated report the Prophet was deeply grieved when he was compelled to escape from Mecca, persecuted as he was by his Qurashī enemies. When in the Ḥazawwara (the former market of Mecca) on his way to Medina, the Prophet is said to have uttered a moving declaration of sympathy for Mecca. He expressed his love for the city and said that had he not been forced to leave he would gladly remain in Mecca.¹¹¹ This is, of course, a pro-Meccan tradition.

A pro-Medinan tradition records the following utterance of the Prophet when on the *hijra*: "O God, Thou evicted me from the plot of land most dear to me; therefore put me up in the spot most beloved to Thee."¹¹² The Prophet's wish was fulfilled and he alighted in Medina; this was indeed the spot dear to God.

Medina's favored position is emphasized when the dissemination of the precepts of the nascent Islamic religion is discussed. The Prophet is said to have stated that cities and localities were conquered for Islam by the force of the sword; but Medina was conquered by the force of the Qur'ān.¹¹³ Muslim lawyers asserted that Mecca was conquered by sword; they considered however that imposing *kharāj* on Mecca was implausible.¹¹⁴ Muslim lawyers who attempted to mitigate the dispute pointed out that the majority of Medinan people who brought about the conversion of various localities to Islam, including Mecca, were former

¹¹¹ Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Muḥallā*, VII, 289. Ibn Taymiyya, *ʿIlm al-ḥadīth*, ed. Mūsā Muḥammad ʿAlī (Beirut, 1405/1984), 361. Yāqūt, *Muʿjam al-buldān*, s.v. ḥazwara. Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ḥamʿān*, 254, no. 1026. Al-Sinjārī, *Manāʾih al-kara*, MS fol. 9a. Al-Shaukānī, *Nayl al-aṭār* (Cairo, 1372/1953), V, 32a-39. Al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-mawāhib al-laduniyya*, VIII, 322. Ibn Abī Ḥātim, *ʿIlal al-ḥadīth* (Cairo, 1343), I, 282, no. 836.

¹¹² Al-Albānī, *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-ḍaʿīfa wa-l-mawḍūʿa* (al-Riyāḍ, 1408/1987), III, 639-40, no. 1445. Albānī marks the tradition as *maḍḍūʿ*, a forged one. Ibn Taymiyya, *Majmūʿat al-rasāʾil al-kubrā*, II, 356. Ibn Taymiyya marks the tradition as *bāṭil*; see *ibid.*, for his arguments. Al-Shaukānī, *Nayl al-aṭār*, V, 34; and see the discussion of the subject in *ibid.* Al-Qayrawānī, *Kitāb al-jāmiʿ*, 139.

¹¹³ Al-ʿAbdarī, *al-Madkhal*, II, 35 inf. Abū l-Ḥasan ʿAlī b. ʿUmar b. Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan al-Sukkārī, *Juzʿ*, MS al-Zāhiriyya, *majmūʿa* 18, fol. 248b. ʿAbdallāh b. Abī Zayd al-Qayrawānī, *Kitābu l-jāmiʿ fī l-sunan wa-l-ādāb wa-l-maghāzī wa-l-taʾrīkh*, ed. Muḥammad Abū l-Ajfan and ʿUthmān Biṭṭīkh (Beirut-Tunis, 1402/1982), 138: *wa-ʾuftutiḥat al-qurʾā bi-l-sayf ḥattā makkatu, wa-ʾuftutiḥat al-madīnatu bi-l-qurʾāni*; and see *ibid.* note 3. Ibn al-Jauzī, *al-Mawḍūʿāt*, II, 216-17. Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal marks the tradition as *munkar*. Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Muḥallā*, VII, 286. Ibn Ḥajar, *al-Maʾālibu l-ʿāliya*, I, 369, no. 1246.

¹¹⁴ Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām ahli l-dhimma*, I, 126 ult.-127.

Meccans.¹¹⁵

Medina was considered more honorable and dignified than Mecca, which was flooded by streams of pilgrims from all areas of the Muslim empire. This can be seen from a story about 'Umar, who was informed of a man who had the intention of giving the oath of allegiance after the death of 'Umar to a certain person. 'Umar had the idea of standing up in Mecca and warning the believers against people who were about to rob the *umma* of their rights (viz. by deciding about 'Umar's successor). He was however dissuaded from delivering his warning in Mecca because of the mob that used to attend his council, and he made up his mind to convey his admonition in Medina, the abode of the *hijra* and of the *sunna*.¹¹⁶

A place to which special honor was accorded was the grave of the Prophet in Medina. Several traditions emphasized the qualities of this revered spot, linking the veneration of the grave with that of the Prophet himself. The place in which he was buried was chosen by the Prophet himself. Scholars argued that God does not cause a prophet to die except in a place he likes.¹¹⁷ This assumption was corroborated by a tradition saying that prophets should be buried in the place where they die; but both traditions are countered by others according to which it is undesirable to bury people in their abode, as a grave turns the house into a cemetery in which prayer is disagreeable. Needless to say, the burial of the Prophet in this place is considered a special distinction.¹¹⁸

The grave itself was closely connected with the Prophet from the beginning of his existence. The Prophet is said to have been created from the dust of the grave in which he was buried. God sent Jibrīl to bring him a handful of white clay out of the heart of the earth and its light in order to create Muḥammad. Jibrīl set out with seventy thousand angels and took a handful of earth from the place of the Prophet's grave, which was then white and pure. It was kneaded with the nectar of paradise (*mā'u l-tasnīm*), with the wine of Paradise (*al-rahīq*) and with water from the well of Paradise (*salsabīl*). Then it was plunged into the water of the rivers of Paradise and was carried towards the earth and the sea; the angels learned to know the quality of Muḥammad before they knew the virtues of Ādam.¹¹⁹ A well known utterance states that the Prophet was buried in the clay from which he was created (*dufina bi-l-ṭīnati llatī khuliqa minha*); the tradition is provided with several utterances which

¹¹⁵ Al-Shaukānī, *Nayl al-auṭār*, V, 34.

¹¹⁶ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rikh*, I, 351.

¹¹⁷ Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍu l-qadīr*, V, 459, no. 7956. Al-'Abdarī, *al-Madkhal*, II, 39 inf. Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 45, no. 45.

¹¹⁸ Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍu l-qadīr*, V, 459, no. 7956; and see the comments of al-Munāwī.

¹¹⁹ Al-Saqṣīnī, *Zahrat al-riyāḍ*, MS Hebrew Univ., Coll. Yahudah 571, 8, 11 sup., ll. 1-3. Al-'Abdarī, *al-Madkhal*, II, 32. 'Alī b. Burhān al-Dīn, *al-Sīra al-ḥalabiyya*, I, 163.

extol the idea that the dust of the grave should be the dust from which the person is born.¹²⁰ According to a tradition there is a special angel called *malak al-arḥām*, who is entrusted with the burial of the dead in their proper graves.¹²¹

It is not surprising to find a parallel tradition according to which the clay of which the Prophet was created was Meccan, but it was blended with clay from Medina.¹²²

The extreme veneration of the tomb of the Prophet is shown by the opinion of a group of zealots who claimed that a visit to the grave of the Prophet is more meritorious than a pilgrimage to Mecca and a visit to the Ka'ba.¹²³ The pilgrimage to Mecca was linked with a visit to the grave of the Prophet; the Prophet is reported to have said that he who performs the *ḥajj* without visiting his grave treats him harshly indeed.¹²⁴

The grave of the Prophet was considered to surpass in its virtue the sanctity of the Ka'ba:

*wa-in' aqada l-ijmā'u 'alā annahumā afḍal min sā'iri l-buldān;
wa-idhā naẓarta ilā l-tafḍīli baynahumā qāma li-kullin min-
humā anṣārūn wa-a'wān wa-dalīl wa-burhān ḥāshā l-buq'ata
l-mu'azzama l-mukarrama l-zakiyya l-zāhira l-tāhira l-sharīfa
l-munīfa l-'āliya l-ghāliya l-ṭayyiba l-muṭayyaba l-muqaddasa
l-mu'nasa llatī dammat jasadahu l-a'zam wa-khuliqa minhā
badanuhu l-akram ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam, fa-innahā
afḍalu l-biqā'i min ghayri khilāfin wa-lā nizā'in; bal hiya
afḍalu mina l-ka'bati wa-mutaqaddimatun 'alayhā fī l-rutba.
bal naqala ibn al-'aql al-ḥanbalī annahā afḍal mina l-'arshi
l-'azīm. . . .*¹²⁵

¹²⁰ Al-Qurtubī, *al-Tadhkira fī aḥwālī l-mautā wa-umūri l-ākhirā*, ed. Aḥmad Muḥammad Mursī (Cairo, n.d.), I, 83. Al-Qurtubī, *Tafsīr*, VI, 388 sup. Al-Munāwī, *Payḍu l-qadīr*, III, 533, no. 4230.

¹²¹ Al-Saqsinī, *Zahrat al-riyāḍ*, MS. 11 sup. Al-Qurtubī, *al-Tadhkira*, 84–88.

¹²² Al-Samhūdī, *Wafā' al-wafā*, I, 73–74. Ibn Zuhayra al-Qurashī al-Makhzūmī, *al-Jāmi' al-laṭīf fī faḍli makkata wa-ahlihā wa-binā'i l-bayti l-sharīf* (Cairo, 1357/1938), 18–19. Muḥibb al-Dīn al-Ṭabarī, *al-Qirā li-qāṣidi ummi l-qurā*, ed. Muṣṭafā l-Saqqā (Cairo, 1390/1970), 337: *wa-qāla bnu 'abbāsīn: aṣlu ṭīnati l-nabiyyi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallama min surrati l-arḍi bi-makkata; wa-qāla ba'ḍu l-'ulamā'i: fīhi idhānun bi-annahā llatī ajāba mina l-arḍi. wa-min mauḍi'i l-ka'bati duḥiyat al-arḍu, fa-ṣāra rasūlu llāhi [s] huwa l-aṣla fī l-takwīnī, wa-l-kā'inatu taba'un lahu. wa-qāla: li-dhālika summiya "ummiyyan" li-anna makkata ummu l-qurā wa-ṭīnatuhu ummu l-khalīqati.*

¹²³ Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtiḍā'u l-ṣirāt*, 382.

¹²⁴ Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil fī ḍu'afā'i l-rijāl* (Beirut, 1405/1985), VII, 2480. Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisānu l-mizān*, VI, 167, no. 585. Ibn al-Jauzī, *al-Mauḍū'āt*, II, 217.

¹²⁵ Al-Suyūṭī, *Sāji'atu l-ḥaram fī faḍli makkata wa-l-madīnati wa-l-ḥaram*, MS Leiden Or. 1526, 227. Comp. al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-mawāhib*, VIII, 324–25.

Orthodox circles censored in vain the invocations and supplications at the grave of the Prophet.¹²⁶ But popular belief was persistent in holding that Medina surpasses Mecca in its merits: *al-madīna afdālu min makka*.¹²⁷

There was however a special feeling of awe towards Mecca. Some pious people were afraid to commit a sin in Mecca because one perpetrated there was punished by God more severely than elsewhere.¹²⁸ It was thus wise to settle outside Mecca and to set out towards it in order to perform the prescribed ritual practices.¹²⁹

The deteriorating political and economic situation in Medina in the period of the Umayyad caliphate is reflected in a prediction of the Prophet in which he foretold that people of Medina would be summoned by their relatives to leave the city and would set out to territories where they would find an easy life (the prediction refers obviously to the conquered territories), but it was better for them to remain in Medina.¹³⁰

A significant discussion arose in connection with the interpretation of the *ḥadīth* known as *al-īmānu yamānin*. The tradition says that the Prophet pointed with his finger towards Yemen uttering this *ḥadīth*. Transmitters of the *ḥadīth* were however not unanimous about the place in which the Prophet uttered it. Some of them said that it was uttered

¹²⁶ Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'u l-sirāt*, 365.

¹²⁷ Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍu l-qadīr*, VI, 264, no. 9185. Al-Daylamī, *Firdaus al-akhbār*, MS Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 173a. Al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-mawāhib*, VIII, 323. Al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, X, 235 inf. Al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān al-i'tidāl*, III, 623. Al-Sinjārī, *Manā'ih al-karam*, MS fol. 9a–9b. Al-Albānī, *Silsilat al-aḥādīthi l-ḍa'īfa* . . . , III, 638, no. 1444: the tradition is marked by Albānī as *bāṭil*.

¹²⁸ Al-'Aqūlī, *Arf al-ḥib*, MS Leiden, Or. 493, fol. 75b. Al-Sinjārī, *Manā'ih al-karam*, MS fol. 8b: *wa-ruwiya 'an abī 'amr wa-l-zajjāj minā l-ṣūfiyya annahu aqāma bi-makkata arba'ina sanatan lam yabul wa-lam yataghawwaṭ fi l-ḥaram; wa-qāla: inna minā l-ilḥādī fi l-ḥaram an taqūla "kallā wa-llāhi" wa-"balā wa-llāhi."* And see *ibid.*: *wa-yuqālu inna l-dhunūba tataḍā'afu fīhi kamā tataḍā'afu l-ḥasanātu wa-inna l-insāna yu'ākhadhu bi-hammihī fi l-sayyi'āti bi-makkata wa-lau kāna nā'īyan 'anhā*. And see *ibid.*: *wa-'an 'umara raḍiya llāhu 'anhu: la-'an ukhṭī'a sab'ina khaṭī'atan bi-rukbatā aḥabbu ilayya min an ukhṭī'a khaṭī'atan wāḥidatan bi-makkata*. See this tradition recorded by Yāqūt in *Mu'jam al-buldān*, s.v. *rukba*. Al-Bayhaqī, *Shu'ab al-īmān*, VII, 570, no. 3729: *akhbaranā abū 'abd al-raḥmān al-sulamī fī dhikri abī 'amrin muḥammadi bni ibrahīma l-zajjājī qāla yaqūlu: innahu lam yabul wa-lam yataghawwaṭ fi l-ḥaram arba'ina sanatan; kāna yakhruju kulla yaumin bi-'umrata khārija l-ḥarami fa-yabūlu wa-yataghawwaṭu, thumma yarji'u, fa-lā yabūlu wa-lā yataghawwaṭu illā 'inda dhālika l-waṭi fi l-yaumi l-thānī; see references.*

¹²⁹ Al-Sinjārī, *Manā'ih al-karam*, MS fol. 11b: *qāla l-qādī fi "jāmi'ihī" ba'da l-kalāmi 'alā l-mujāwarati, wa-hādhā l-kalāmu fi l-mujāwarati faqat min ghayri suknā, wa-ammā l-suknā wa-l-inqitā'u fa-huwa bi-l-madīnati afdālu*. See the favorable opinion of al-Zamakhsharī about dwelling (*suknā*) in Mecca, *ibid.*, fols. 10b–11a and fol. 12b sup.

¹³⁰ Ibn Ṭahmān, *Mashyakha*, 84, no. 32. See references. 'Alī b. Burhān al-Dīn, *al-Sīra al-ḥalabiyya*, II, 62 inf. Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, I, 349. Al-Qurṭubī, *al-Tadhkira*, 603. Al-Zabīdī, *Iṭḥāfu l-sādāt l-muttaqīn bi-sharḥi asrāri ihyā'i 'ulūmi l-dīn*, I, 206–207. Al-Mundhirī, *al-Tarḥīb wa-l-tarḥīb*, III, 57, no. 1755; and see no. 1756. Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Muḥallā*, VII, 281.

in Tabūk, according to others when he was staying in Medina. One interpretation has it that the Prophet referred to Mecca and Medina, two cities between Tabūk and the Yemen; according to others the Prophet meant the Anṣār: they were of Yemenī origin, they sheltered him in Medina, and helped to spread the religion of Islam. Some scholars argued that the Prophet referred to Mecca: the religion of Islam originated in Mecca and Mecca belongs to the region of Tihāma, which is part of the Yemen. Yet a different interpretation says that the people to whom the Prophet referred were in fact those of the Yemen, and he referred to their true belief in Islam.¹³¹

The expansion of Islam and the rise of the Muslim empire encouraged the establishment of local sanctuaries, places of *ziyārāt*, venerated graves and places of ritual practices. The virtue of the conquest of a locality and the fact that one of the Companions of the Prophet sojourned in this place is exposed in the following *ḥadīth*: *mā min aḥadīn min aṣḥābī yamūtu bi-arḍin illā bu'itha qā'idan — (ya'nī li-ahlihā) — wa-nūran yauma l-qiyāma*.¹³²

A similar idea is inherent in an utterance recorded in Fasawī's *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rikh*, referring to a pious scholar of tradition: *... sami'tu abā ma'sharīn lladhī yarwī 'an ibrahīma l-nakha'iyyi qāla: mā min qaryatin illā wa-fihā man yudfa'u 'an ahlihā bihi, fa-innī la-arjū an yakūna abū wā'ilin minhum*.¹³³

As already mentioned, the number of graves of prophets in a city or a locality was a source of pride and served as a measure of its merits. Lists were made of the tombs in every city and province. According to a tradition of Ka'b (al-Aḥbār) there are ten tombs of prophets in Ṭarsūs, five in Maṣīṣa, a thousand in the fortified cities (*thughūr*) and sea-coasts of Syria; in Antiochia there is one tomb, of Ḥabīb the carpenter; in Ḥimṣ there are thirty tombs of prophets, in Damascus five hundred; in Filastīn there is a similar number. In Jerusalem there are a thousand tombs, in al-ʿArīsh there are ten, and in Damascus there is also the tomb of Moses.¹³⁴

Muslim tradition naturally transmitted utterances containing praises of these places; the collections relating to the virtues of these localities were sometimes put together in special treatises of *faḍā'il*.

The Prophet is said to have predicted the military expedition against Khurāsān, and enjoined the believers to participate and to settle in

¹³¹ Ibn Mandah, *al-Imān*, ed. ʿAlī b. Muḥammad b. Nāṣir al-Faqīhī (Beirut, 1406/1985), I, 523–32, and see editor's comments. Al-ʿAynī, *ʿUmdat al-qārī*, XV, 192, XVI, 72. Al-Ṣaghānī, *Mabāriq al-azhār*, II, 95 sup. Al-Bayhaqī, *Ma'rifatu l-sunan wa-l-āthār*, ed. Aḥmad Ṣaqr (Cairo, 1390/1970), I, 67 sup., 73 inf., 137 sup.

¹³² Al-Jarrāhī, *Kashf al-khafā'*, II, 193, no. 2243. Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ al-qadīr*, V, 470, no. 7994.

¹³³ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rikh*, II, 112; and see references.

¹³⁴ Al-Mauṣilī, *Kitāb al-wasīla*, V/1, 190.

Marw. Marw was built by Dhū l-Qarnayn, who asked God to bless the city. The people of Marw will never be afflicted by any calamity.¹³⁵

Among the cities of Persia a high position was accorded to Qazwīn. The Prophet predicted that at the "end of the days" there would be people "whose true belief would be blended with their blood and flesh"; they would fight the unbelievers in a city called Qazwīn. Paradise would desire them and yearn for them like a she-camel who yearns for her foal.¹³⁶ In another tradition the Prophet says that the courageous people dwelling in Qazwīn, who read the Qur'ān and fight with their swords, will appear on the Day of Resurrection with their jugular veins dripping with blood. They love God and God loves them. The eight gates of Paradise will be opened for them and they will be allowed to enter by any gate they wish.¹³⁷

Another tradition says that God watches the people of Qazwīn twice every day as they let the sinners go unpunished and accept the good deeds of the beneficent.¹³⁸

A peculiar tradition says that a man who dwells in Qazwīn is superior to one who dwells in one of the two *ḥarams*, Mecca or Medina.¹³⁹

In some of the traditions Qazwīn is coupled with 'Asqalān: both are marked as the two cities of paradise.¹⁴⁰ Other traditions place Qazwīn in another list of paradise cities: Alexandria, 'Asqalān, 'Abbādān and Qazwīn.¹⁴¹

A tradition attributed to the Prophet emphasizes the high rank of Alexandria: a person sojourning in Alexandria for three days without harboring hypocritical thoughts will have the same status as a believer from among the Rūm and the 'Arabs who worships God for sixty thousand years.¹⁴²

¹³⁵ Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ al-qadīr*, IV, 130, no. 4774. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 257, nos. 1418–19. Al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, II, 239, no. 3586. Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, I, 401 inf.–402 sup. But see Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 39, no. 33: the *dajjāl* will set out from Khurāsān; and see *ibid.* references. Ibn 'Arāq, *Tanzīhu l-sharī'a l-marfū'a*, II, 47, no. 6; and see *ibid.* the virtues of other cities of Khurāsān. Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisān al-mizān*, III, 120, no. 415.

¹³⁶ Abū l-Qāsim al-Rāfi'ī, *al-Tadwīn fī dhikri ahli l-'ilmi bi-qazwīn*, MS Laleli 2010, fol. 3a. Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ al-qadīr*, IV, 30, no. 4444. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 253, no. 1399.

¹³⁷ Al-Rāfi'ī, *al-Tadwīn*, MS fol. 3a. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 256, no. 1412.

¹³⁸ Al-Rāfi'ī, *al-Tadwīn*, MS fol. 3b. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 256, no. 1416.

¹³⁹ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 257, no. 1417.

¹⁴⁰ Al-Rāfi'ī, *al-Tadwīn*, MS fol. 7a.

¹⁴¹ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 257, no. 1420. But comp. a different list of the *minbars* of Paradise: Anon., *Masa'il 'abdi l-salām li-nabiyyinā*, MS Hebrew Univ., Coll. S.M. Stern, 34.: Qayrawān, Bāb al-abwāb, 'Abbādān and Khurāsān.

¹⁴² Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisān al-mizān*, VI, 219 inf., no. 768.

When the Prophet stated that there were two gates open to Paradise: 'Abbādān and Qazwīn, he was asked whether 'Abbādān was not a newly built place; he answered in the affirmative, but added that it was the first place which believed in Jesus the son of Maryam.¹⁴³

The lengthy chapter of *faḍā'il qazwīn* in al-Muttaqī al-Hindī's *Kanz al-'ummāl*¹⁴⁴ bears evidence to the wide currency given to traditions concerning the virtues of Qazwīn.

These traditions give us the opportunity to follow the process of sanctification of a newly conquered locality, and shows how new sanctuary was coupled with well established sanctuaries held in high esteem, often situated in far regions.

A frequent tendency in the *faḍā'il* literature is to restrict or withdraw part of the sanctity of a locality, by attributing similar virtues to smaller places adjacent to a main locality or on the way to it.

Judda, a well-known place in the vicinity of Mecca, is recorded as a distinguished locality sharing virtues with Mecca. The Prophet is said to have stated: *makkatu ribāṭun wa-juddatu jihādun*.¹⁴⁵ When a man in a council in Mecca prided himself on being a member of one of the most distinguished councils in the city, 'Abbād b. Kathīr¹⁴⁶ said that he was far removed from the virtues of Judda: a prayer in Judda has the value of seventeen million prayers elsewhere, a dirham spent in charity in Judda is worth a hundred thousand dirhams, and good deeds done there are rewarded in the same measure. God will forgive the sins of a man who merely looks at Judda from a distance.¹⁴⁷ The tradition about the four cities of Paradise, Alexandria, Qazwīn, 'Abbādān, and 'Asqalān, was duly modified by an additional significant phrase: "and the superiority of Judda to all these cities is like the superiority of the House of God in relation to other houses (*wa-fadlu judda 'alā hā'ulā'i ka-fadli bayti llāhi l-ḥarāmi 'alā sā'iri l-buyūt*)."¹⁴⁸

Some scholars claimed to have read in "books" (i.e., collections of apocalyptic predictions attributed to the Prophet or to pious persons of the first generation of Islam; sometimes these predictions can be traced

¹⁴³ Al-Rāfi'ī, *al-Tadwīn*, MS fol. 3a.

¹⁴⁴ XIII, 252–57, nos. 1394–1417.

¹⁴⁵ Al-Fākihī, *Ta'rikh*, MS fol. 413b. inf. Ibn Zuhayra, *al-Jāmi' al-laṭīf*, 81, from al-Fākihī. Al-Fāsī, *Shifā'u l-gharām*, I, 87, from al-Fākihī. Ibn Fahd, *Risāla fī faḍli judda*, ed. 'Abd al-Ḥasan Mud'ij, in *Majallat ma'had al-makhtūṭāt al-'arabiyya* (al-Kuwayt, 1987), XXXI, 199. 'Abd al-Qādir b. Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Juddī al-Ḥijāzī, *al-Silāh wa-l-'udda fī ta'rikhi judda*, ed. Muṣṭafā l-Ḥadrī (Damascus–al-Madīna al-munawwara, 1408/1988), 78.

¹⁴⁶ See Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, V, 100–102, no. 169.

¹⁴⁷ Al-Fākihī, *Ta'rikh*, MS fol. 413b. inf. Al-Fāsī, *Shifā'u l-gharām*, I, 87, from al-Fākihī. Ibn Zuhayra, *al-Jāmi' al-laṭīf*, 81, from al-Fākihī. 'Abd al-Qādir b. Aḥmad al-Juddī, *al-Silāh wa-l-'udda*, 78–79.

¹⁴⁸ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 257, no. 1420. 'Abd al-Qādir b. Aḥmad al-Juddī, *al-Silāh wa-l-'udda*, p. 78.

back to Jewish or Christian scriptures) that there would be a bloody encounter (*malḥama*, between believers and unbelievers) in Judda and the believers killed in Judda would be the best among the martyrs.¹⁴⁹ Some traditions claimed that Ḥawwā, the biblical Eve, died in Judda and that her grave is there too.¹⁵⁰

The position of the mosque of Qubā' was similar to that of the Prophet. There were discussions among scholars whether the verse in the Qur'ān: *al-masjidu lladhī ussisa 'alā l-taqwā (sūrat al-tauba 108)* referred to the mosque of the Prophet or to that of Qubā',¹⁵¹ the Prophet was asked about it, according to one tradition, and said that the verse referred to the great mosque of the Prophet in Medina.¹⁵² According to another tradition the verse of the Qur'ān *fīhi riḡālun yuḥibbūna an yataṭahharū wa-llāhu yuḥibbu l-muṭṭahharīna (sūrat al-tauba 108)* refers to the people of Qubā'.¹⁵³

The mosque of Qubā' maintained a very high position; traditions traced back to the Prophet say that any one who prays in the mosque of Qubā' and performs the prescribed ritual practices, will be rewarded as if he performed an 'umra.¹⁵⁴ One of the Companions of the Prophet stated frankly that he preferred a prayer in the mosque of Qubā' to one in Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*).¹⁵⁵ The Companion Sa'd b. Abī Waqqāṣ is even more outspoken: a prayer of two *rak'as* in the mosque of Qubā' is more to his liking (*aḥabbu ilayya*) than setting out twice towards Jerusalem. The merits of worship in Qubā', according to him, are numerous and significant.¹⁵⁶

Needless to say, there is a series of other mosques in Medina which are also recorded as virtuous sanctuaries in which the Prophet used to pray and which deserve to be frequented in order to perform prayers and

¹⁴⁹ Al-Fākihī, *Ta'riḡh*, MS fol. 414a. Ibn Fahd, *Risāla*, p. 200, from al-Fākihī. Ibn Ḥayra, *al-Jāmi' al-laṭīf*, p. 81, from al-Fākihī. Al-Fāṣī, *Shifā'u l-gharām*, I, 87, from al-Fākihī.

¹⁵⁰ Ibn Fahd, *Risāla*, p. 203. 'Abd al-Qādir b. Aḥmad, *al-Silāḡ wa-l-'udda*, p. 102.

¹⁵¹ See e.g., al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 182. Al-Samḥūdī, *Wafā'u l-wafā*, pp. 250, 414–15, 797–800. Al-'Ayyāshī, *Tafsīr*, ed. Ḥāshim al-Rasūlī l-Maḡallātī, (Qumm, 1371), II, 111, no. 135: *sa'altuhu 'alayhi l-salāmu 'ani l-masjidi lladhī ussisa 'alā l-taqwā min awwali yaumin fa-qāla: masjidu qubā' . . .* Al-Warṡhīlānī, *Nuzhatu l-anṣār fī faḡli l-ta'riḡhi wa-l-akhbār* (Beirut, 1394/1974), p. 468.

¹⁵² Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 372–73.

¹⁵³ Al-Muttaḡī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 228, no. 1271. 'Umar b. Shabba, *Ta'riḡh al-madīna al-munawwara*, ed. Fahīm Muḡammad Shaltūt (n.p.), I, 48–50.

¹⁵⁴ Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 373. Al-Muttaḡī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 227–29, nos. 1269–70, 1274–83. Al-Samḥūdī, *Wafā'u l-wafā*, pp. 800–806. Ibn Ḥajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisānu l-mīzān*, VI, 324 ult., no. 1157. Al-Warṡhīlānī, *Nuzhat al-anṣār*, p. 468.

¹⁵⁵ Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 373, ult.

¹⁵⁶ 'Umar b. Shabba, *Ta'riḡh*, I, 42: *Sa'd b. abī waqqāṣ: la-an uṣallī fī masjidi qubā'a rak'atayni aḥabbu ilayya min an ātiya bayta l-maqdisi marratayni. lau ya'lamūna mā fī qubā'a la-ḡarabū ilayhi akbāda l-ibil*. Al-Warṡhīlānī, *Nuzhat al-anṣār*, p. 468.

ritual practices.¹⁵⁷

A similar development by which small sanctuaries around, or on the way to the main sanctuary are given great importance can be observed in Palestine. A place which gained a high position in this way was 'Asqalān. The Prophet named 'Asqalān one of the two brides of Paradise¹⁵⁸ and predicted that seventy thousand martyrs would stand up from the cemetery of 'Asqalān on the Day of Resurrection.¹⁵⁹ The Prophet is said to have promised that these martyrs will be led to Paradise like a bride to her husband.¹⁶⁰ The Prophet says further that there are two tomb-sites that will shine for the people of Heaven as the light of the sun shines for the people on earth: the graves of Baqī' al-Gharqad and those of 'Asqalān.¹⁶¹

The Prophet urged the believers to stay in 'Asqalān, promising its people security and calm in a time of troubles and contests.¹⁶² Tradition says that in 'Asqalān there are still graves of the pious and of the successors to the Companions of the Prophet (*al-tābi'ūn*) which remain unknown. 'Asqalān contains the well which Abraham dug with his own hand. There are also utterances of the Prophet as to the merits of 'Asqalān as a *ribāt*.¹⁶³ According to a tradition a believer who spends a day and a night in 'Asqalān as a *murābiṭ* will die as a martyr (*shahīd*) even if his death occurs sixty years later and even if he dies in a land of unbelievers.¹⁶⁴

Ṭabariyya was a distinguished city too. In the vicinity of the Lake of Ṭabariyya was the grave of Sulaymān b. Dāwūd.¹⁶⁵ To the east of the lake are the graves of Luqmān and his son.¹⁶⁶ In Ṭabariyya are buried the Companion Abū 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh and his wife.¹⁶⁷ A grave of another Companion, Abū Hurayra, is on the slope of the mountain of Ṭabariyya.¹⁶⁸ Ṭabariyya has a well which was visited by

¹⁵⁷ 'Umar b. Shabba, *Ta'rīkh*, I, 57-79.

¹⁵⁸ According to another tradition the two brides are 'Asqalān and Ghazza. See al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 250, no. 1384.

¹⁵⁹ Ibn 'Adī, *al-Kāmil*, I, 294 sup. Muḥammad b. Ḥibbān al-Bustī, *Kitāb al-majrūhīn*, ed. Maḥmūd Ibrāhīm Zāyid (Beirut, n.d.), I, 270, III, 58.

¹⁶⁰ Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 160, no. 175. Al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, I, 330 ult., no. 1245. Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XVII, 134, no. 426.

¹⁶¹ Al-Mausili, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 193.

¹⁶² Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 250, no. 1385, XVII, 133-34, nos. 423-25.

¹⁶³ See al-Harawī, *al-Ishārāt ilā ma'rifati l-ziyārāt*, ed. J. Sourdél-Thoumine (Damascus, 1953), p. 32.

¹⁶⁴ Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, XIII, 251, no. 1387.

¹⁶⁵ Al-Harawī, *al-Ishārāt*, p. 19. The author rejects however this tradition.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 19. The author mentions however that another tomb of Luqmān is said to exist in Yemen in a mountain named Lā'at 'Adan.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 19. The author records other tombs ascribed to Abū 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh in the area of al-Urdunn or in Baysān.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 19. Other traditions say that his tomb is in Baqī' or in 'Aqīq, or in

‘Īsā b. Maryam; he is said to have performed a miracle there.¹⁶⁹ Outside Ṭabariyya is the grave of ‘Abdallah b. al-‘Abbās b. ‘Alī b. Abī Ṭālib and the *mashhad* of Sukayna bint al-Ḥusayn.¹⁷⁰ The Lake of Ṭabariyya will play a significant role when the false Messiah (the *Dajjāl*) will appear; the *Dajjāl* is said to have inquired about this Lake when he happened to meet some believers.¹⁷¹ The rod of Moses, the one given him by Jibrīl when Moses set out for Madyan, and the ark of Ādam are at the bottom of the Lake and will be pulled out by the *Qā’im* when he will be raised.¹⁷²

A city distinguished by the most favorable utterances of the Prophet was ‘Akka (Acre). Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī records the following utterance of the Prophet concerning ‘Akka: “There is a city between two mountains named ‘Akkā. If any one enters it out of desire for it (*raghbatan fiḥā*), God will forgive him his former and future sins. Any one who turns away from ‘Akka with aversion will not get God’s blessing for going away from it. There is a well in ‘Akka, named ‘Ayn al-baqar; God will fill with light the inside space of any one who drinks from it. Any one who pours the water of this well upon himself will remain pure until the Day of Resurrection.”¹⁷³

A lengthy *ḥadīth* transmitted by ‘Ā’isha exposes a lucid pattern of the growth of the *faḍā’il* literature. A deputation of the people of Syria came to Yathrib.¹⁷⁴ One of them visited ‘Ā’isha; she asked where they were from, and he told her that they were from Syria, from Urdunn, from the region of ‘Akka, from the city itself. ‘Ā’isha then lifted the screen which separated her from the people in the room and fell down prostrating herself to God. She lifted her head and said: “I have seen a man from the people of Paradise. Have you drunk from the well of ‘Ayn al-Baqar in ‘Akka?” When he answered “yes” she asked whether he had noticed the smell of camphor of the water. He said “yes” again and ‘Ā’isha exclaimed “Blessed art thou, blessed art thou” (*ṭubāka, thumma ṭubāka*) and quoted an utterance of the Prophet according to which the *ḥūrīs* of Paradise sprinkle camphor from Paradise in the well of ‘Ayn al-Baqar. She said that if the man from ‘Akka had not been a stranger

Yubnā.

¹⁶⁹ Ibid., p. 19.

¹⁷⁰ Ibid., p. 19.

¹⁷¹ Muḡhulṭāy, *al-Zahr al-bāsim fī sīrat abī l-qāsim*, MS Leiden Or. 370, fol. 158b inf.–159a sup.

¹⁷² Al-Māzandarānī, *Manāqib salmān*, p. 17. But see al-Bustī, *al-Majrūḥīn*, II, 34: the Torah, Moses’ rod, and the remainder of the broken Tablets are in Antakia.

¹⁷³ Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī, *al-Khiṣāl al-mukaffira li-l-dhunūb*, ed. Muḡammad Riyāḍ al-Mālik (Damascus, 1383/1963), p. 33.

¹⁷⁴ Ibn Ṭahmān, *Mashyakha*, p. 95, no. 43. The Prophet forbade to call the city “Yathrib”; it had to be called “al-Madīna.” The Umayyads, however, continued to call the locality “Yathrib” or “al-Muntina.”

with whom she was not allowed to be in contact (*innaka rajulun lasta minnā bi-mahramin*) she would ask him to spit in her mouth, thus hoping to attain Paradise. She quoted the utterance of the Prophet according to which drinking and washing at the well of 'Ayn Baqar, and drinking from 'Ayn al-Fulūs in Baysān, or from the well of Silwān in Jerusalem, or from Zamzam in Mecca, will keep a man's body from the fire of Hell.

Then she turned to the man from 'Akka and continued to quote the utterances of the Prophet about 'Akka.¹⁷⁵ The Prophet said that walking in the streets of 'Akka carries with it more merit than prayer in some mosques. The Prophet touched upon the rewards of those who would be stationed in 'Akka as a military force ready to meet the enemy (*al-murābiṭūn*): he who stayed in 'Akka as a *murābiṭ* for one night would be considered as one who would fight with his spear for the cause of God; he who stayed for two nights would be considered as one who fought with his sword for the cause of God; he who stayed for three nights would be considered as one who came floundering in his blood; he who stayed for forty days would be given seventy Badrī warriors and would not forfeit his pay (*ajr*) neither in this world or in the next one (*fī l-dunyā wa-l-ākhirā*).

'Ā'isha attests having heard the Prophet announce that one prayer in the mosque of 'Akka on Friday has the value of eight thousand two hundred prayers elsewhere. In another utterance the Prophet states that Jibrīl stretches his wing above 'Akka; God guards it with His eye and the city is kept from every damage and harm.¹⁷⁶

'Akka is coupled with another city as regards merits of performing ritual practices. The Prophet is said to have stated that two bendings (*rak'atāni*) in Qaysariyya and 'Akka are more to God's liking than a thousand bendings (*rak'a*) in Jerusalem.¹⁷⁷ The tradition, obviously a forged one, is a convincing case of the rise and growth of small local religious centers and their rivalry with the established great localities.

A tradition in which the virtues of these small centers are emphasized says that the Prophet was asked whether there was a city in Paradise reminiscent of a city in this world. The Prophet stated that there were

¹⁷⁵ Al-Mauṣilī, *Wasīla* V/1, 192, records an additional utterance: "Blessed is he from among my people who saw 'Akka and blessed is he who saw the man who saw 'Akka"; he said it seven times.

¹⁷⁶ Al-Nazwī, *al-Muṣannaf*, XI, 14–15; and see a fragment of the tradition *ib.* p. 52. And see al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla* V/1, 192–193. I am indebted to the late Dr. Suliman Bashear who made available to me a copy of the MS Princeton, Yahudah 4183 (*Faṣl fī faḍā'il 'akkā*) in which this tradition is recorded and which contains many details about the virtues of Acre. He made as well available to me a refutation of the virtues of Acre written by Muḥammad b. Muḥammad al-Maghribī al-Azharī and entitled: *al-Raḡīm bi-taḥdīrī a'lām al-bashar min aḥādīthi 'akkā wa-'aynihā al-musammāt bi-'ayni l-baqar* (Princeton, MS Yahudah 5923).

¹⁷⁷ Al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 193.

four such cities in Paradise: 'Akka, 'Asqalān, Judda and 'Abbadān. Further the Prophet stressed the special virtues of 'Abbadān: a *takbīra* in 'Abbadān is more meritorious than a thousand bendings (*rak'a*) in another mosque; he who visits 'Abbadān and who anticipates by this the reward of God (*muḥtasiban*), God will forgive him his sins and will reward him with an 'umra; he who prays two bendings in 'Abbadān will get the reward as if he prayed forty bendings (*rak'a*) elsewhere and as if he had attended the battle of Badr with the Prophet.¹⁷⁸

The case of 'Abbadān serves as an example of the rise of a holy place frequented by ascetics and ṣūfīs; a web of miraculous stories and abundant utterances of the Prophet about the virtues of the place enhanced the position of the locality. The sanctity of the isle of 'Abbadān was divulged by Jibrīl himself; he revealed to the Prophet on the night of the *mi'rāj* the unknown details about the creation of the place. The Prophet saw a light on the earth ascending to the sky and asked Jibrīl about it. Jibrīl explained that 'Abbadān was created from four places: from Ṭūr Sīnā, from *bayt al-maqdis*, from the *masjid al-ḥarām* and from the mosque of Medina. Jibrīl then stated that he who prayed two *rak'as* in 'Abbadān would be like a man who prayed in the four places. Jibrīl assured the Prophet that he who visited 'Abbadān and spent one night in it, God would grant him the reward as if he visited Mecca, Jerusalem, Ṭūr Sīnā and the mosque of Medina. God would respond to the invocations and supplications in 'Abbadān.¹⁷⁹

The story of 'Abbadān is an example of the creation of a combined sanctity based on the blending of well known and venerated elements of sanctity.

The firm belief of the Muslim community in the sanctity of the holy places in Islam was weakened to some extent by the orthodox circles themselves who raised considerable doubts as to the soundness of traditions which were widely accepted.

A subject of contention of this kind was the problem whether the Prophet did perform a prayer in the mosque of al-Aqṣā during his *isrā'*. The scholars were divided in their opinions: some asserted that he had indeed prayed at al-Aqṣā, but others denied this, saying that had he prayed there the believers would be obliged to pray in Jerusalem, for they would have to act according to the ritual practice performed by the Prophet; his prayer would have become an obliging *sunna*.¹⁸⁰

As early as in the Umayyad period some members of the ruling family reduced the sanctity of Jerusalem: '*an ibni shihābin: kāna sulaymān*

¹⁷⁸ Al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 193 inf.-194.

¹⁷⁹ Al-Mauṣilī, *al-Wasīla*, V/1, 194.

¹⁸⁰ Al-Ṭabarī, *Tahdhīb al-āthār*, I (*Musnad 'abdallāh b. al-'abbās*), 443-70, nos. 728-46. Al-Ṭayālīsī, *Musnad* (Hyderabad, 1321), p. 55, no. 411. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *Jāmi' bayān al-'ilm wa-faḍlihi* (al-Madīna al-munawwara, n.d.), II, 103.

b. 'abd al-malik lā yu'azzimu ilyā kamā yu'azzimuhā ahlu baytihi. qāla: fa-sirtu ma'ahu wa-huwa waliyyu 'ahdin wa-ma'ahu khālid b. yazīd b. mu'āwiya. . . . Khālid b. Yazīd said that he had read the Torah and the Book revealed by God to Muḥammad. The Rock of the sanctuary of Jerusalem was not enjoined by God to the Jews as *qibla* in their Scripture; the decision to take the Rock as *qibla* was a result of an historical development: the Ark of the Sakīna (*tābūt al-sakīna*) was placed on the Rock. When God became angry with the Jews He removed the Ark from the Rock. Then the Jews consulted among themselves and decided to pray in the direction of the Rock and established it as their *qibla*.

Thus the Rock itself had no sanctity at all. Abū l-ʿĀliya¹⁸¹ could indeed convince a Jew who claimed that the Rock was the *qibla* of Moses, that Moses prayed in the direction of the Ka'ba; he merely performed the prayer at the Rock: *kāna yuṣalli 'inda l-ṣakhra wa-yastaqbilu l-bayt al-ḥarām, fa-kānat al-ka'batu qiblatahu wa-kānat al-ṣakhratu bayna yadayhi*.¹⁸²

Al-ʿAbdarī records in his *al-Madkhal* a significant opinion concerning the practice of bad innovations (*bid'a*) which occurred in some virtuous and distinguished places. The *bid'a* under consideration was the controversial *ṣalāt al-raghā'ib* which started in Jerusalem. The virtuous places have no influence on the deeds and practices performed in them: *fa-aqūlu: inna hādhihi al-ṣalāt* [i.e., *ṣalāt al-raghā'ib*] *shā'at bayna l-nās ba'da l-mi'ati l-rābi'ati wa-lam takun tu'rafu; fa-lafzuhu hādha yadullu 'alā annahā bid'atun*. Further he argues:

fa-hādha l-lafzu ayḍan minhu yadullu 'alā annahā bid'atun, idh anna mabda'a fi'lihā fi bayti l-maqdisi dūna ghayrihi. wa-l-buqa'u wa-in kānat mimma lahā faḍīlatun fī nafsihā fa-laysa lahā ta'thīrun fīmā ḥadatha fīhā; wa-lau kāna kadhālika la-dhahaba kathīrun min al-sharī'a wa-l-iyādhu bi-llāhi, wa-qad ḥafiẓahā llāhu wa-l-ḥamdu li-llāhi.¹⁸³

¹⁸¹ See Ibn Hajar al-ʿAsqalānī, *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, XII, 143, no. 685.

¹⁸² Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Badā'i' al-fawā'id* (Beirut [reprint], n.d.), IV, 170 inf.-171. Additionally the Jew was persuaded of the argument of Abū l-ʿĀliya by the fact that the *qibla* of the mosque of the prophet Ṣāliḥ was in the direction of the Ka'ba. The Christians too were not ordered by Jesus to face East in their prayers, nor was such injunction given to them in the Evangelium or in any of their Scriptures. An instructive passage (*ibid.*, pp. 171 inf.-172 sup.) about the *qibla* of the Samaritans, a mountain in the district of Nābulus, attempts to prove the worthlessness of their claim that that *qibla* was enjoined in the Torah. Ibn Qayyim himself checked the text and failed to find the alleged Samaritan *qibla* in this Scripture. On the *qibla* of Jerusalem and the attitude of some of the Umayyads towards it; see Suliman Bashear, "Qur'ān II, 114 and Jerusalem," *BSOAS*, 52 (1989), p. 237; and see the reference in note 158.

¹⁸³ Al-ʿAbdarī, *al-Madkhal*, IV, 267 inf.-268.

Al-ʿAbdarī explains that Jerusalem cannot be blamed for the bad innovations. Jerusalem is in fact the third city as to its virtues; Mecca and Medina are superior to Jerusalem in virtue and in these two cities there occurred events which the *sharīʿa* is reluctant to accept.¹⁸⁴

It is precisely this inferior position of Jerusalem, being third in rank among the dignified cities, that caused Jerusalem to be mindful of the claims of other cities. Such was the case of the competition of Jerusalem with Damascus, which according to some scholars is the fourth sanctuary to which one should set out for ritual practices.¹⁸⁵

In a detailed, comprehensive and exhaustive study, Professor Joseph Sadan subjects the competition between Jerusalem and Damascus to an illuminating scrutiny.¹⁸⁶ The pivot of discussion in Sadan's two articles is the location of *maqām nabī mūsā*: whether it is to be sought in the vicinity of Jerusalem or of Damascus. Sadan dealt with the philological elements and analyzed the arguments of the opponents, basing himself on a huge bibliographical array. Even the indication of the common word *al-shām* was heatedly discussed and variously interpreted by different groups. The *ḥadīth qudsī*: *anā rabbu l-shāmi man arādahā bi-sūʿin qaṣamtuhu*¹⁸⁷ "I am the Lord of al-Shām and shall break anyone who wishes it ill" was differently explicated by scholars according to their opinion whether *al-shām* refers to the whole territory of Syria or merely to Damascus.¹⁸⁸ In some cases *al-shām* was said to apply to Jerusalem.¹⁸⁹

Sadan points out that the treatise of al-Timurtāshī (d. 1054 H.), *al-Khabar al-tāmm fī hudūd al-arḍi l-muqaddasati wa-filastīn wa-l-shām* as well as that of Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb (d. 1649), *Durru l-nizām fī maḥāsini l-shām*, were both composed at the instigation and encouragement of some official dignitaries in Egypt and in Syria.¹⁹⁰

The treatise of Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb, *Durru l-nizām*, which is based on *ḥadīth* material combined with some historical traditions, reflects the

¹⁸⁴ Al-ʿAbdarī, *al-Madkhal*, IV, 268 sup.

¹⁸⁵ See above, at note 35; and see Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb, *Durru l-nizām fī maḥāsini l-shām*, MS Princeton, Yahudah 1862 (4427), fols. 3b–4a.

¹⁸⁶ J. Sadan, "Maqām nabī mūsā between Jericho and Damascus: On the History of the Rivalry between Two Holy Places" (in Hebrew), *Hamizrah hehadash* (1979), pp. 22–38 and idem, "The Conflict Concerning the *maqām nabī mūsā* in the Muslim Sources" (in Hebrew), *Hamizrah hehadash* (1979), pp. 220–38.

¹⁸⁷ See this tradition assessed in al-Jarrāḥī's *Kashf al-khafāʾ*, I, 202, no. 612; and see *ibid.*: *wa-shtahara ayḍan: wayka umma l-jabābira man ammaḥa bi-sūʿin qaṣamtuhu, wa-l-khiṭāb li-dimashq...* And see Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb, *Durru l-nizām*, fol. 6b, l. 3: *anā llāhu rabbu l-shāmi lā udīmu fihā ḡulma l-ḡālīmī...*

¹⁸⁸ See e.g., J. Sadan, "Maqām nabī mūsā between Jericho and Damascus," p. 26.

¹⁸⁹ See Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb, *Durru l-nizām*, fol. 6b, l. 8, *qāla rasūlu llāhi, qāla llāhu taʿālā li-l-shāmi wa-huwa baytu l-maqdisi: anti janmatī wa-quḍī wa-ṣafwatī min bilādī, man sakanaki fa-bi-rahmatin minnī...*

¹⁹⁰ J. Sadan, *Maqām nabī mūsā*, pp. 26–27.

rivalry between the two religious centers in Islam.

Another aspect of the struggle of Jerusalem to gain a proper status in the competition between the holy places in Islam is exposed in an interesting treatise written by Burhān al-Dīn b. Jamā'a (d. 790 H)¹⁹¹ named *Kitābu stiqbāli l-qiblatayan*.¹⁹²

As in the case of the treatises of Muḥammad b. Ḥabīb and al-Timurtāshī, the treatise of Ibn Jamā'a was inspired by a discussion between two scholars as to the *qibla* of the prophets who preceded the prophet Muḥammad; it was held in the presence of a dignitary who got the high rank of combining "the sword and the pen" and "word and deed."

The pivot of the dispute was the disparity in the opinions of the two scholars: one of them maintained that none of the prophets of the past (i.e., before the emergence of Islam) turned his face towards the Rock as a *qibla* except Muḥammad. His opponent held the view that all the prophets turned their faces towards the Rock; only Muḥammad turned his face towards the Ka'ba.¹⁹³

Ibn Jamā'a states that both scholars have a right to their views. The disputant who claimed that none of the prophets turned his face towards the Rock had in mind, according to Ibn Jamā'a, the *ḥadīth* transmitted by Abū l-ʿĀliya¹⁹⁴ that the Ka'ba is the *qibla* of all the prophets: *al-ka'batu qiblatu l-anbiyā'i kullihim*. The one who claimed that all the prophets turned their faces towards the Rock except Muḥammad based his opinion on the utterance of the Prophet transmitted by al-Zuhrī¹⁹⁵ saying that since Ādam descended on earth God did not send a prophet without appointing as his *qibla* the Rock of *bayt al-maqdis*: *lam yab'ath allāhu mundhu aḥbaṭa ādama ilā l-dunyā nabiyyan illā ja'ala qiblatahu ṣakhrata bayti l-maqdis*.

The tradition of al-Zuhrī is indeed transmitted by Yūnus b. Yazīd al-Aylī,¹⁹⁶ a faithful student of al-Zuhrī, and is recorded by al-Musharraf b. al-Murajjā.¹⁹⁷

¹⁹¹ See C. Brockelmann, *GAL*, II, 112. And see the *fatwā* of Burhān al-Dīn b. Jamā'a on the problem of *samā'*, MS Hebrew University AP. Ar. 158, fols. 11a–20a: *hādha su'ālun sa'alahu shakhṣun minā l-fuqarā'i ghafara llāhu lahu amīn amīn li-maulānā qāḍī l-quḍāti burhānī l-dīnī bni jamā'a taghammadahu llāhu bi-rahmatihī amīn lammā kāna khaṭībān bi-bayti l-maqdisi wa-dhālika fī sanati ithnatayni wa-sab'īna wa-sab'imi'atin*.

¹⁹² MS Hebrew University, Yahudah Col., Ar. 318.

¹⁹³ MS Yah. Ar. 318, fol. 89a.

¹⁹⁴ See Ibn Sa'd, *al-Tabaqāt al-kubrā* (Beirut, 1377/1957), VII, 112–17.

¹⁹⁵ See F. Sezgin, *GAS*, I, 280–83.

¹⁹⁶ See Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī, *Tahdhīb al-tahdhīb*, XI, 450–52, no. 869.

¹⁹⁷ Al-Musharraf b. al-Murajjā, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis wa-l-khalīl wa-faḍā'il al-shām*, MS Tübingen 1, fol. 36a inf. Maḥmūd Ibrāhīm, *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis* (Kuwayt, 1406/1985), p. 306 (from al-Miknāsī's *Faḍā'il bayti l-maqdis*). Al-Wāsiṭī, *Faḍā'il al-bayti l-muqaddas*, ed. I. Hasson (Jerusalem, 1979), p. 51, no. 78 (and see the references of

There are several traditions attributing the virtue of prophethood to Jerusalem or to *al-shām* in general. A peculiar utterance transmitted by Ḍamra b. Rabīʿa¹⁹⁸ stated: "Never was a prophet sent except from Syria [*Shām*]; if he was not from Syria, he was moved to Syria": *lam yub'ath nabiyyun illā mina l-shāmi, fa-in lam yakun minhā usriya bihi ilayhā*.¹⁹⁹

The idea that the prophets turned their faces towards the Ka'ba as their *qibla* was also popular. "Never did God send a prophet without enjoining him to pray in the direction of the Ka'ba. The Jews and the Christians were ordered to do so but strayed from the right path."²⁰⁰ A tradition recorded on the authority of 'Urwa says that every prophet performed the pilgrimage to Mecca except Hūd and Ṣāliḥ; Nūḥ too performed the pilgrimage. Hūd was sent by God to perform the pilgrimage, but he was impeded by the troubles of his people and could not carry out his mission. After Ibrāhīm every prophet without exception performed the pilgrimage to Mecca and performed the rites of the circumambulation of the Ka'ba.²⁰¹

According to another tradition traced back to Mujāhid, seventy prophets performed the ḥajj to Mecca; among them was Moses clad in a Qaṭwānī woolen striped cloak, and Yūnus, who uttered the *talbiya*: *labbayka kāshifa l-kurab*.²⁰²

the editor). Ibn al-Jauzī, *Faḍā'il al-quds*, p. 114.

¹⁹⁸ See *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, I, 330, no. 3959.

¹⁹⁹ Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, III, 112.

²⁰⁰ Al-Suyūṭī, *Sāji'at al-ḥaram*, MS Leiden, Or. 1526, p. 225 sup.: *wa-qad ruwiya: mā ba'atha llāhu nabiyyan illā qila lahu: ilā l-ka'batī ṣallū, wa-anna l-yahūda wa-l-naṣārā umirū bihā wa-lakinnaḥum 'anhā ḍallū* . . .

²⁰¹ Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 129. Al-Sayyid al-Bakrī b. al-Sayyid Muḥammad Shaṭā al-Dimyāṭī, *I'ānat al-ṭālibin 'alā fathī alfāz fathī l-mu'in*, II, 277: *lam yab'ath allāhu nabiyyan ba'da ibrahīma 'alayhi l-ṣalātu wa-l-salām illā ḥajja; wa-lladhī ṣarraḥa bihi ḡayruhu annahu mā min nabiyyin illā ḥajja khilāfan li-man istathnā hūdan wa-ṣāliḥan* . . . *qāla l-'allāma 'abd al-ra'ūf: wa-qā'iluhu 'urwatu bnu l-zubayr raḍīya llāhu 'anhum qāla: balaghānī anna ādama wa-nūḥan ḥajjā dūna hūdin wa-ṣāliḥin li-shtighālihimā bi-amri qaumihiḥimā, thumma ba'atha llāhu ibrahīma fa-ḥajjahu wa-'allāma manāsikahu, thumma lam yab'ath allāhu nabiyyan ba'dahu illā ḥajjahu. wa-yujābu 'an qauli 'urwata bi-anna l-ḥadītha 'alā fardī ṣiḥḥatihi mu'āraḍun bi-ahādītha kathīratin annahumā ḥajjā, minhā qaulu l-ḥasani fī risālatihi anna rasūla llāhi [s] qāla: inna qabra nūḥin wa-hūdin wa-shu'aybin wa-ṣāliḥin fīmā bayna l-rukni wa-l-maqāmi wa-zamzama. wa-mīna l-ma'lūmi annahum lā ya'tūna l-bayta bi-ḡayri ḥajjin* . . . Further the author discusses the problem whether the prayer in the ḥaram of Mecca is permitted, as the locality contains the tombs of the prophets. He says it is permissible, arguing: *wa-lā tukrahu l-ṣalātu bayna l-rukni wa-l-maqāmi wa-zamzama tawahhuman min ḥadīthi l-ḥasan li-kaunihimā maqburatan, li-annahā maqburatu l-anbiyā'i wa-hum ahyā'u fī qubūrihim*. The author attempts to prove that the tradition of the Prophet, *lā tattakhidhū qubūra anbiyā'ikum masājida*, cannot be applied in case of the tombs in the court of the ḥaram of Mecca. And see Ishāq b. Bishr, *Kitāb al-mubtada'* (*al-juz' al-khāmis*), MS Ṣāhiriyya 359 (*majmū'a*), fol. 132a.

²⁰² Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 129.

Another view as to the sojourn of the prophets in Mecca is seen in several traditions stressing that the prophets used to set out to Mecca either when persecuted by their people²⁰³ or when their people perished; the prophets then stayed in Mecca worshipping God until they died. Nūḥ, Hūd, Shu'ayb and Ṣāliḥ are buried in the sanctuary of Mecca, between Zamzam and the Ḥijr.²⁰⁴

Ibn Jamā'a, aware of the contradiction in the opinions of the two scholars, states that the way chosen by him in his scrutiny is to follow the path of explication which may result in a harmonization; if this is hard to achieve another way should be chosen: the two opinions are to be considered as if they were two buildings in danger of collapse; sound, searching scholars have to be consulted.

Ibn Jamā'a promises to base himself on the opinions of these scholars and provide a historical outline of the subject chronologically arranged.

The first man chosen by God for the rank of prophecy was Ādam. We do not know however whether the Temple of Jerusalem existed in his time, except in God's preconceived knowledge, says Ibn Jamā'a.

It is essential for Ibn Jamā'a to establish when the Temple of Jerusalem was built. He quotes Abū Muhammad al-Qāsim Ibn 'Asākir who recorded in his *al-Mustaḡṣā fī faḍā'ili l-masjidi l-aqṣā* the opinion of Ka'b al-Aḥbār saying that the ancient foundation of the Temple was laid by Sām b. Nūḥ; later Dawūd and Sulaymān built upon this base. As it is stated in the reliable *ḥadīth* collection that between Ādam and Nūḥ there were ten generations (*qurūn*), the earliest date for the building of the foundation of the Temple was that of Sām b. Nūḥ. There are however other traditions claiming that some of the sons of Ādam laid the foundation of the Temple; another tradition claims that it was the angels who established its foundation after they had built the Ka'ba.²⁰⁵

²⁰³ Al-Mausilī, *al-Wasīla*, III/2, 309: *mā min nabiyyin haraba min qaumihi illā haraba ilā llāhi bi-makkata fa-'abada llāha fihā ḥattā māta*. 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd b. 'Abd al-Rahmān al-Marākashī, *al-Rauḍ al-mughtanam fī faḍli mā'i zamzam*, MS Firenze, Biblioteca Laurenziana, Or. 178, fol. 20a: *kāna l-nabiyyu minā l-anbiyā'i idhā kadhhabahu qaumuhu wa-halakāt ummatuhu laḥiqa bi-makkata sharrafahā llāhu fa-ya'budu llāha fihā huwa wa-man ma'ahu ḥattā yamūta*. See A. Arazī, "Conflit de préséance entre la Mekke et Medine," *JSAI* 5(1984), pp. 212-13.

²⁰⁴ Al-'Āqūlī, *'Arf al-ṭīb*, MS Leiden Or. 493, fol. 70a: *kāna l-nabiyyu minā l-anbiyā'i idhā halakat ummatuhu laḥiqa bi-makkata yata'abbadu fihā l-nabiyyu wa-man ma'ahu ḥattā l-mauti; fa-māta bihā nūḥ wa-hūd wa-shu'ayb wa-ṣāliḥ wa-qubūruhum bayna zamzam wa-l-ḥijr*. Ibn Abī l-Dunyā, *al-Ishrāf fī manāzil al-ashrāf*, MS Chester Beatty 4427, fol. 80a sup.: *'an ibni 'abbāsīn: fī masjidi l-ḥarāmī qabrānī, qabru shu'ayb mustaqbal al-ḥijr wa-qabru ismā'īl fī l-ḥijr*. Muḥammad b. Yūsuf al-Gharnāṭī l-Jiyānī, *Tafsīr al-baḥr al-muḥīṭ* (Cairo, 1328), I, 140: *wa-li-dhālika summiya wasatuhā bakkata li-anna l-arḍa bukkat min taḥtiḥā; wa-khtuṣṣat bi-l-dhikr li-annahā maqarru man halaka qaumuhu minā l-anbiyā'i wa-dufina bihā nūḥ wa-hūd wa-ṣāliḥ bayna l-maqām wa-l-rukn . . .*

²⁰⁵ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiqbāl*, MS Yah. Ar. 318, fol. 89b. And see Nāṣir al-Dīn b. Khadīr, *al-Mustaḡṣā*, MS Escorial 1767, fol. 5b: *fī muthīri l-gharāmī 'an abī l-'abbāsī l-*

As to the Ka'ba, the sanctuary existed and was frequented by the people who came either for pilgrimage or for a visit. Ādam performed the *hajj* and the circumambulation of the Ka'ba. According to a tradition recorded by al-Shāfi'ī in his *Umm* the angels met Ādam on his return from the *hajj* and greeted him with the greeting *burra hajjuka*; they told him that they used to perform the pilgrimage two thousand years before his pilgrimage. Ibn Jamā'a quotes other sources as to Ādam's stay in Mecca and the ritual practices performed by him, or performed in his time. He is said to have performed forty pilgrimages from India to Mecca on foot (from Ṭabari's *Ta'rikh*). According to another tradition he so-journed in Mecca until his death; he used to circumambulate the Ka'ba seven times a night and five times a day (from al-Azraqī's, *Ta'rikh*). Ibn Jamā'a emphasizes that these traditions cannot be rejected except by people who assume that the first to build the Ka'ba was Abraham and that it did not exist before him. This opinion is shared by some people in later times, but the majority of scholars opposes it.

Ibn Jamā'a is of the opinion that the prayer (*al-ṣalāt*) was a legally binding practice (*kānat al-ṣalātu mashrū'atan*) already at the time of Ādam. The tradition of Ādam's request on his deathbed to have a bunch of grapes from heaven mentions that Ādam was washed and clad with a shroud; Jibrīl performed the prayer at his grave and he was buried (from 'Abdallah b. Aḥmad's *Ziyādāt al-musnad*).²⁰⁶ Another tradition says that the angels carried the body of Ādam and placed it at the door of the Ka'ba; then Jibrīl performed the prayer (from Fākihī's *Ta'rikh Makka*). A tradition that goes back to Ibn 'Abbās says that Jibrīl refused to pray on the grave of Ādam, but instructed Shīth to pray on his father's grave thirty *takbīras*: five as a prayer (*ṣalāt*), twenty-five as a distinctive, supererogatory practice in honor of Ādam (*tafḍīlan li-ādam*) (from Ibn 'Asākir's *Ta'rikh*).

These traditions, maintains Ibn Jamā'a, support each other to establish the fact that the prayer for the dead (*ṣalāt al-janāza*) was mandatory at the time of Ādam. He assumes that other prayers were probably established at that period and quotes from the commentary of al-Rāfi'ī to the *Musnad* of al-Shāfi'ī that the morning prayer was the prayer of Ādam, the prayer of midday (*al-ẓuhr*) was the prayer of Dāwūd, the afternoon prayer (*ṣalāt al-ʿaṣr*) was the prayer of Sulaymān, the prayer of sunset was the prayer of Ya'qūb and the prayer of the evening (*ishā'*) was that of Yūnus. There are no explicit traditions about the *qibla* of the pre-Islamic prophets, Ibn Jamā'a admits; but he assumes that the *qibla* of Ādam was the Ka'ba; it was already mentioned earlier, says Ibn Jamā'a, that Ādam circumambulated the Ka'ba and performed the

qurṭubī: *yajūzu an yakūna banat-hu l-malā'ikatu ba'da binā'i l-bayti bi-idhni llāhi*.

²⁰⁶ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiḡbāl*, fol. 89b.

pilgrimage to it and it is therefore plausible that he also prayed in the direction of the Ka'ba.²⁰⁷

In a special passage dealing with the *qibla* of the prophets Ibn Jamā'a remarks that there is no explicit mention of the *qibla* of the prophets who lived in the period between Ādam and Abraham, but it is well known that they revered the House, performed the pilgrimage to Mecca, performed the circumambulation, prayed at the House and made invocations there. Stories about the pilgrimage of Nūḥ, Hūd, Šāliḥ, Shu'ayb and 'Ād are widely circulated. Ibn Jamā'a reiterates the tradition about the prophets who moved to Mecca after their people perished and who stayed there worshipping God until their death (see above, notes 203–204). The graves of these prophets are found around the House and it is not far fetched to assume that they faced it in their prayers (*fa-muqtaḍā hādḥā allā yub'ada annahum kānū yuṣallūna ilayhi*).

Additionally Abū l-ʿĀliya reported that he saw the grave of Šāliḥ with the *qibla* in the direction of the Ka'ba; that was also the *qibla* of the grave of Daniyāl. As to the question how one can know it, since the tradition says that the Deluge ruined the House and erased it, Ibn Jamā'a adopts Mujaḥid's view according to which the place of the Ka'ba became erased by the flood and hidden, but there remained nevertheless a red hill which the flood did not submerge. People knew that that was the place of the Ka'ba, and those who suffered from ill-treatment used to frequent this spot and mentioned their grievances in their invocations; they were answered and got help. Ibn Jamā'a states that this tradition is sounder than the one transmitted by Ḥudhayfa saying that the House was lifted (*rufi'a*) and nobody performed the *ḥajj* in the period between Nūḥ and Ibrāhīm. (recorded by al-Fākihī).²⁰⁸

A later chapter is dedicated to the elucidation of the direction of the *qibla* of Abraham and his descendants. Abraham, rescued from the ruse and deceit of Namrūd in Bābil, set out (*hājara*) to Syria (*al-shām*) and settled in the Holy Land (*al-arḍ al-muqaddasa*); he dedicated himself to the worship of God. People of the Book claim that he set up his tent to the East of Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*). In that period Hājar became pregnant and bore his son Ismā'īl. Then happened the famous event between her and Sārah, as a result of which Abraham moved Hājar and her son to the *wādī* of Mecca. Abraham used to visit them from time to time riding the beast named al-Burāq and would return to the Holy Land. We have no information, says Ibn Jamā'a, what his *qibla* at that time was. After he set out to Mecca on the order of God and built the Ka'ba at His order, the Ka'ba became his *qibla* and that of his descendants; so things continued until the time of Moses. The Muslim

²⁰⁷ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiqbāl*, fol. 90a.

²⁰⁸ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiqbāl*, fol. 90b.

community is unanimous concerning this matter; only the Jews have a different opinion about it.

The *qibla* of the descendants of Abraham seems to have been a subject of controversy. Ibn Jamā'a quotes the commentary of al-Wāhidī in which the suffixed personal pronoun in the word *qiblatihim* and *kānū 'alayhā* in the phrase: *mā wallāhum 'an qiblatihim llatī kānū 'alayhā* (Qur'ān 2:143) refers to Ibrāhīm, Ismā'il, Ishāq, Ya'qūb and the tribes, because they claimed (falsely) that the *qibla* of Abraham was the Temple of Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*). But that is not the first case of their slander (this obviously refers to the unbelievers and the People of the Book). Ibn 'Abbās is said to have interpreted the phrase *fa-la-nuwalliyannaka qiblatan tardāhā* as referring to the *qibla* of Ibrāhīm, i.e., to the Ka'ba.

The question of some believers why the faces of the patriarchs in their graves are not turned in the direction of the Ka'ba is answered that they remain in the position in which they threw themselves down at their decease.²⁰⁹

The traditions about the *qibla* of Moses are confused. Ibn Jamā'a states that according to what he could gather Moses prayed in the direction of the Rock. Ibn Jamā'a mentions a story which corroborates this view: when 'Umar consulted Ka'b al-Aḥbār as to where to establish the place of the Aqṣā mosque he advised him to put it behind the Rock. In that case the mosque would combine two *qibla*: that of Moses and that of Muḥammad. 'Umar rebuked him, accusing him of trying to imitate the Jewish ritual practice. A different tradition says however that Moses' *qibla* was the Ka'ba. Some scholars championed this tradition, interpreting in this way the verse *wa-kadhālika ja'alnākum ummatan wasaṭan* [Qur'ān 2:143]. Ibn Jamā'a considers the two opinions plausible, as Moses revered both the Temple and the Ka'ba. His reverence of the Ka'ba is proved by the fact that he performed the pilgrimage to the Ka'ba. The reverence of the Temple can be deduced from the fact that before his death he prayed that he might be brought close to the Holy Land to a "stone-throwing" distance. A third opinion says that Moses observed the prayer towards the Tent of the Time (*qubbat al-zamān*) also called the Tent of the Covenant (*qubbat al-'ahd*) which God ordered to make from wood of *shamshād* and to embellish it with gold, silver and silk. After the death of Moses, when Yūsha' b. Nūn took control of Jerusalem, he put the Tent on the Rock; he and the people of Israel prayed in the direction of the Tent and they were followed in their practice by succeeding generations. When the Tent was worn out after long use people prayed in the direction of the Rock, the spot where the Tent had been placed.

Ibn Jamā'a points out that it is obvious that this way of prayer was

²⁰⁹ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiqbāl*, fols. 90b-91a.

observed according to a revelation of God; were it not so the Prophet would not have agreed with praying in the direction of Jerusalem. The Rock thus remained the *qibla* of the prophets who dwelt in the Holy Land (*al-arḍ al-muqaddasa*); but these prophets revered the Ka'ba as well and performed the pilgrimage to Mecca. Ibn Ishāq stated that after Abraham all the prophets sent by God performed the pilgrimage to Mecca. Many sources report the pilgrimage of Moses, Jesus and Jonah (Yūnus); in some reports the *talbiyāt* of the prophets are recorded.²¹⁰

Ibn Jamā'a dedicated a lengthy passage to the discussion of the *qibla* of the Prophet in the various periods of his prophetic career and provided a scrutiny of the different traditions concerned with this subject.

It is the unanimous opinion of the scholars of Islam that God combined the two *qiblas* for the Prophet. The differences between them refer to the particular circumstances (*kayfiyya*) of the event. According to the opinion of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (al-Qurṭubī), the Prophet prayed during the period of his stay in Mecca in the direction of the Ka'ba. When he went out to Medina on his *hijra*, he prayed in the direction of Jerusalem. Later he turned to the Ka'ba and prayed in the direction of the Ka'ba. Thus the abrogation of God's injunction as to the *qibla* took place twice.

Al-Ṭabarī records in his *Tafsīr* the opinion of Ibn Jurayj stating that the Prophet prayed during the first period in Mecca in the direction of the Ka'ba, and then turned away from it (*surifa 'anhā*) towards Jerusalem. The Anṣār thus prayed in Medina towards Jerusalem for three years. Al-Ṭabarī also records the opinion of Qatāda saying that they prayed for two years towards Jerusalem. When the Prophet arrived in Medina after his *hijra* they prayed with him towards Jerusalem; then they changed direction and prayed towards the Ka'ba.

Ibn Jamā'a expresses his reservation: the majority of scholars assume that the Prophet prayed in Mecca only in the direction of Jerusalem. He used however to perform the prayer between the Yamānī Column and the Black Stone (*bayna l-rukni l-yamānī wa-l-ḥajari l-aswad*); in this position the Ka'ba was in front of him and the person behind him could think that he prayed towards the Ka'ba. There is, however, the possibility, says Ibn Jamā'a, that he did it out of preference for facing the Ka'ba, since the Ka'ba was the *qibla* of his ancestor Ibrāhīm, and in order to gain the sympathy of Quraysh (*li-kaunihā qiblata abīhi ibrahīma wa-ta'allufan li-qurayshin*). When the Prophet came to Medina – in which it was impossible to combine between the two *qiblas* – he prayed in the direction of Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*) in order to gain the sympathy of the Jews. When he realized that they did not abstain from their wrong course he turned while praying in the direction of the Ka'ba.

²¹⁰ Ibn Jamā'a, *Istiqbāl*, fol. 91a–b.

The scholars who adopted these opinions differed as to the question of what caused the Prophet to turn towards Jerusalem in his prayer while he was staying in Medina. Some of them assumed that it was a firm decree imposed on the Prophet (*ḥatman*); this is indicated by the verse *wa-mā jaʿalnā l-qiblata llatī kunta ʿalayhā* (Qurʾān 2:144). Another group of scholars assumed that God granted the Prophet the option between the two *qiblas* at his arrival in Medina. Others say that he was given the free choice of the four sides and was permitted to turn in his prayer in whatever direction he wanted, and he opted for the Temple of Jerusalem (*fa-khtāra bayta l-maqdisi*). Later he turned to the Kaʿba. As evidence for this opinion, Ibn Zayd quoted the verse *wa-li-llāhi l-mashriqu wa-l-maghribu fa-aynamā tuwallū fa-thamma wajhu llāhi* (Qurʾān 2:115).

There is now general consensus that members of the community should turn their faces towards the Kaʿba, except in the case of great fear or when one performs a supererogatory prayer (*nāfila*), as is indicated in the books of *fiqh*.

Scholars were unanimous as to the verse dealing with the change of *qibla*: *qad narā taqalluba wajhika fī l-samāʾi* (Qurʾān 2:145), but they differed as to the date of the revelation. Some of them gave as the date of the revelation Rajab of the second year of the *hijra*; others established the date as Shaʿbān of that year. That was the reason why some doubts were raised as to the length of period during which the Prophet prayed in Medina in the direction of Jerusalem – whether it was sixteen or seventeen months. Ibn Abī Ḥātim assumed that he prayed in the direction of Jerusalem for seventeen months and three days and that the change of *qibla* took place in the middle of Shaʿbān. Al-Wāqidī stated that it happened on a Tuesday. As to the time of the change, there are different traditions: some say that the first prayer in Medina in the direction of the Kaʿba was the afternoon prayer (*al-ʿaṣr*) – this is the tradition recorded in al-Bukhārī’s *Ṣaḥīḥ* on the authority of al-Barāʾ. Others say that the revelation of the change was granted before the midday prayer (*al-ẓuhr*) and that that was the first prayer performed in the direction of Mecca – this tradition was recorded by al-Nasāʾī on the authority of Abū Saʿīd b. al-Muʿallā.

A third tradition says that the revelation was released after the first two *rakʿas* of the midday prayer were performed by the Prophet (*wa-qad ṣallā rasūlu llāhi ṣallā llāhu ʿalayhi wa-sallam mina l-ẓuhri rakʿatayni*) in the mosque of the Banū Sulaym; the believers in the mosque turned around (*istadārū*) and the Prophet completed the prayer with them. Therefore, the mosque of the Banū Sulaym was called *masjid al-qiblatayn*.²¹¹

²¹¹ Ibn Jamāʿa, *Istiḳbāl*, fol. 92a.

Ibn Jamā'a finally touches upon the interpretation of the tradition recorded on the authority of al-Zuhrī after finishing the treatise of "Facing the Two *Qiblas*" (*"Kitābu stiḡbālī l-qiblatayn"*) written in haste.

The tradition saying that all the prophets prayed in the direction of the Temple of Jerusalem cannot be explicated in the way conceived by al-Zuhrī. It has to be interpreted in connection with the tradition of the *isrā'*. During this event, all the prophets were gathered for the Prophet and he headed the prayer; they stood behind him. This event took place before the *hijra* and, of course, before the change of the *qibla*.

In connection with the Prophet's prayer during the *isrā'*, Ibn Jamā'a notes the tradition recorded in the *Mustaqṣā* according to which the Prophet performed the prayer standing to the north of the Rock (*waqafa min shāmi l-ṣakhra*); in this way he combined the two *qiblas*. That, remarks Ibn Jamā'a, does not invalidate the claim that the Prophet was enjoined to pray in the direction of the Temple of Jerusalem and that all the prophets prayed behind him.

This problem of facing the two *qiblas* belongs to the problems of transmitted lore (*al-masā'il al-naqliyya*) and cannot be treated by logical analysis (*llatī lā maḡāla li-l-'aqli fihā*). Ibn Jamā'a ends the treatise by calling for a cautious approach to the *ḥadīth* and by urging that the soundness of the transmitted traditions be established.

The attempts to raise Jerusalem to a position of importance comparable to other religious centers in the Muslim empire are reflected in some reports and stories depicting the marvels of Jerusalem in ancient times, relating the tales of the prophets in Jerusalem and virtues of the holy places in this city, and recording the utterances of the Prophet about its virtues.

The unfortunate conditions in Medina are reflected in the following report: Medina was in a sad situation at the Prophet's arrival (on his *hijra-k*). The report says that the people of the city were in a poor state: they did not ride horses, nor did they gain booty. After the arrival of the Prophet, they obtained sufficient means of subsistence.

It is evident that the improvement in the economic situation in Medina was due to the raids and expeditions of the Prophet's troops against the hostile tribes.²¹²

The superiority of Jerusalem to Medina is reflected in the following utterance of the Prophet, issued by him after his return from his nocturnal journey *isrā'* to Jerusalem. When 'Imrān b. Ḥuṣayn expressed his

²¹² Al-Samarqandī, *Tafsīr*, MS Chester Beatty 3668, I, fol. 277b: *wa-dhālika anna l-nabiyya, ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam, qadima l-madīnata wa-kāna ahlu l-madīnati fī shiddatin min 'ayshihim lā yarkabūna l-khayla wa-lā yahūzūna l-ghanīmata fa-lammā qadima l-nabiyyu l-madīnata staghnaw.*

high opinion about the beauty of Medina, the Prophet remarked: "But what if you had seen Jerusalem (*bayt al-maqdis*)? And how not, added the Prophet, as everyone in this city is visited, but does not set out to visit [other places-k]; the souls *al-arwāḥ* are dispatched to Jerusalem, but the soul of Jerusalem is directed only to God." God honored Medina, said the Prophet, and made it pleasant by his stay in this city. "I shall stay in it, [i.e., in Medina-k] he said, in my lifetime and after my death. Were it not for this reason, I would not have performed the *hijra* from Mecca [scil. to Medina-k], as the moon in Mecca looks more beautiful than in any other place."²¹³

The stories about the virtues of the sanctuary of Jerusalem were embellished by the legends of the building of the Temple by David and Solomon and the miracles witnessed by the people during the centuries on the Temple precincts and on the Rock.²¹⁴ Several stories record the discussions between the Jews and the Muslims as to whether Jerusalem surpassed Mecca or whether Mecca surpassed Jerusalem in virtues and distinctive features. The Jews claimed that the Temple surpassed the Ka'ba in excellence and greatness (*wa-qālat al-yahūdu: baytu l-maqdisi afdalu wa-a'zamu mina l-ka'bati*) because it was the place of refuge of the prophets (*muhājar al-anbiyā'*) in the Holy Land; the Muslims stated that the Ka'ba surpassed the Temple in excellence.²¹⁵

It was in connection with disputes of this kind that God revealed the verse: Surely the first House founded for mankind is that at Bacca, abounding in blessings and a guidance for all peoples.²¹⁶

God created it two thousand years before He created earth.²¹⁷

The following widely circulated utterance of the Prophet seems to have been a final solution to the question under discussion: the first House created by God for worship was the Ka'ba; and forty years later the Temple in Jerusalem was built.²¹⁸

The high position of Jerusalem is reflected in another utterance of the Prophet, in which he allotted to Jerusalem the second place in rank after Mecca; Jerusalem follows Mecca as a sanctuary and is not preceded by any other holy place. The Prophet is said to have stated: *ṣalātun fī*

²¹³ Shams al-Dī al-Suyūṭī, *Ithāf al-akhiṣṣā*, I, 99.

²¹⁴ See e.g., al-Wāsitī, *Faḍā'il*, pp. 6–11, 19–20.

²¹⁵ See al-Marīzī, *Kitāb fihī dhikru mā warada fī bunyāni l-ka'bati l-muazzama*, MS Leiden Or. 560, fol. 165a; and see al-Saqṣīnī, *Zahrat al-riyāḍ*, MS Hebrew Univ. Yah Ar. 571, p. 221.

²¹⁶ Qur'ān 3:97.

²¹⁷ See al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr*, ed. Shākir, VII, 19–22; and see al-Bayhaqī, *Shu'ab al-īmān*, VII, 542–43, no. 3697.

²¹⁸ See al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr*, VII, 22, no. 7434; Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Maqdisī, *Faḍā'il*, p. 47, no. 13; al-Bayhaqī, *Shu'ab al-īmān*, VII, 541, no. 3696 (and see *ib.*, p. 542, notes); al-Suyūṭī, *Fākihāt al-ṣayf*, p. 213; al-Ṭahawī, *Mushkil al-āthār*, (Hyderabad, 1333), repr., I, 32–33.

*bayti l-maqdisi khayrun min alfi ṣalātin fī ghayrihā illa l-ka'bata.*²¹⁹

This utterance is obviously a transformation of the utterance *ṣalātun fī masjidi hādhā afdalu min alfi ṣalātin fīmā siwāhu mina l-masājidi illā l-masjida l-ḥarāma.*²²⁰

It was probably current and widely circulated in the early period, when the journey to the distinguished mosques was recommended only to the two sanctuaries: Mecca and Medina.²²¹

Jerusalem, put in place of Medina, could take pride in spots of unsurpassed sanctity like the Rock which God had chosen as His throne and from which He ascended to Heaven.²²²

On this Rock, God will judge mankind (on the Day of Judgment-k) and on this Rock, the Scales will be placed.

Jerusalem gained its high position concurrently with the decrease in the authority of Medina. Orthodox scholars admitted that Medina had surpassed other centers of knowledge of the prophetic tradition until the period of Mālik b. Anas. But already in the first period of Islam the great majority of the Companions left Medina and settled in different regions of the Islamic Empire. They created new centers of knowledge which did not lag behind Medina.²²³

Ibn Ḥazm was outspoken on the subject of the *ijmā'* of the scholars of Medina: people of Baṣra, Kūfa, Syria, Mecca and Yemen adopted the tradition of the Prophet from his Companions. They transmitted the traditions of the Prophet told by the Companions of Medina who either emigrated to other cities or remained in Medina. The Qur'ān is one, and is the same both in Medina and in other places; the *sunan* of the Prophet are well known in Medina and outside Medina. The people in the various localities of the Muslim Empire are as knowledgeable as those of Medina.

Ibn Ḥazm further stresses that Mālik, Shāfi'ī and Abū Ḥanīfa did not practice *taqlīd*, nor did they bid anyone to imitate the *sunna* of Medina or of any other place.²²⁴

It is against the background of these ideological contentions that there grew the tradition of the virtues of Jerusalem and arose the inquisitiveness as to the change in the direction of the prayer and the

²¹⁹ Al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'rifa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, II, 292-93; al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī, *al-Riḥla fī talabī l-ḥadīth*, ed. Nūr al-Dīn 'Itr (Beirut, 1395/1975), 134-38.

²²⁰ See e.g., al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, IV, 226-27, nos. 5104-5108 with different versions of the *ḥadīth*.

²²¹ See note 3 above.

²²² See Diyā' al-Dīn al-Madīnī, *Faḍā'il*, 57-59, nos. 27-33.

²²³ See e.g., Ibn Taymiyya, *Ṣiḥḥat uṣūl madhhab ahli l-madīna*, ed. Aḥmad Ḥijāzī l-Saqqā (Cairo, 1988), 44, 48.

²²⁴ Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Iḥkām fī uṣūli l-aḥkām*, ed. Muḥammad Aḥmad 'Abd al-'Azīz (Cairo, 1398/1978), 1139-47.

sojourn of the prophets in Jerusalem, as exposed in the treatise of Ibn Jamā'a, the preacher of the Aqṣā.

The treatise of Ibn Jamā'a concerning the direction of the prayer of the Prophet and the tale of the Rock was preceded by a significant treatise by a preacher in the Aqṣā mosque, Abū Ḥaṣṣ 'Umar b. Badr al-Mauṣilī (d. 627 AH). In a series of concise assertions, the author refuted the validity of prophetic traditions relating to various topics of beliefs, tenets, religious practices and ritual prescriptions. The subjects refuted in the treatise are usually preceded by a headline: ... *lā yaṣihḥu fī ḥādhā l-bābi 'an rasūli llāhi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam shay'un*.

The short treatise entitled *al-Mughnī 'ani l-ḥifẓ wa-l-kitāb* (Cairo, 1342), was "absorbed" by Majd al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Ya'qūb al-Fayrūzābādī, the author of the *Qāmūs* (d. 1175 AH) wrote a critical commentary on the last chapter of Fayrūzābādī's *Sifr al-sa'āda*, entitled *al-Tankūt wa-l-ifāda fī takhrījī ahādīthi khātimati sifri l-sa'āda* (ed. Aḥmad al-Barza [Beirut, 1407/1987]). Another scrutiny of the treatise of 'Umar b. Badr al-Mauṣilī al-Ḥanafī was written by Ḥusām al-Dī al-Maqdisī and entitled, *Faṣl al-khiṭāb bi-naqdi kitābi l-mughnī 'ani l-ḥifẓi wa-l-kitāb*. The book was edited as a critical edition with an introduction and abundant comments and references by Abū Ishāq al-Ḥuwaynī al-Atharī Ḥijāzī b. Muḥammad b. Sharīf (Beirut, 1405/1985).

The treatise of 'Umar b. Badr al-Mauṣilī, the preacher of the Aqṣā mosque, contains a significant passage with which we are concerned here. This passage was, of course, transmitted in the treatises mentioned above and thoroughly commented upon:

*Bāb faḍa'il bayti l-maqdis wa-l-ṣakhra wa-'asqalān wa-qazwīn. qāla l-muṣannif: lā yaṣihḥu fī ḥādhā l-bābi shay'un 'an rasūli llāhi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam ghayra thalāthati ahādīthi fī bayti l-maqdis, ahādīthi: "lā tushaddu l-riḥālu illā ilā thalāthati masājida," wa-l-ākharu annahu su'ila 'an auwalī baytin wuḍi'a fī l-ardī fa-qāla: "al-masjidu l-ḥarāmu." thumma qāla "mādhā?" qāla: "al-masjidu l-aqṣā." qāla: "kam kāna baynahumā?" qāla: "arba'ūna āman." wa-l-ākhiru: "inna l-ṣalāta fīhi ta'dilu sab'ami'ati ṣalātin."*²²⁵

²²⁵ 'Umar b. Badr al-Mauṣilī, *al-Mughnī 'ani l-ḥifẓ wa-l-kitāb*, 25; al-Fayrūzābādī, *Sifr al-sa'āda* (Beirut, 1398/1978), 149; Ibn Himmāt, *al-Tankūt wa-l-ifāda*, 53-63 (with the head line: *bāb faḍa'il bayti l-maqdis wa-l-ṣakhra wa-'asqalān wa-qazwīn wa-l-andalus wa-dimashq*); al-Ḥuwaynī, *Kitāb faṣl al-khiṭāb bi-naqdi kitāb al-mughnī 'ani l-ḥifẓi wa-l-kitāb*, 42-45.

Authors of collections of weak and forged traditions did not refrain from severe censure of the *ḥadīths* about the virtues of Jerusalem and the Rock. Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya (d. 751 AH) marked in his *al-Manār al-munīf fī l-ṣaḥīḥ wa-l-ḍaʿīf* all the traditions in praise of the Rock as deliberately invented lies. The footprint in the Rock is an obvious lie, invented by forgers in order to increase the number of visitors to the place.

The most favorable thing which may be said about the Rock is that it was the *qibla* of the Jews. It corresponds in its location to the Sabbath in time; God gave the Muḥammadan people the Kaʿba in exchange:

... *kullu ḥadīthin fī l-ṣakhrati fa-huwa kadhibun muftaran, wa-l-qadamu lladhī fihā kadhibun mauḍūʿun*

... *wa-arfaʿu shayʿin fī l-ṣakhrati annahā kānat qiblata l-yahūdī, wa-hiya fī l-makāni ka-yaumi l-sabti fī l-zamāni; abdala llahu bihā ḥadhihi l-ummata l-muḥammadiyya l-kaʿbata l-bayta l-ḥarāma*.²²⁶

The author records some sound traditions about Jerusalem (ibid., p. 86, nos. 159–161). However, he assesses as “confused” the tradition recorded by Ibn Mājah, according to which the prayer in al-Aqṣā has the value of fifty thousand prayers in another mosque.²²⁷

Ibn Qayyim considers the tradition about the *isrāʾ* to Jerusalem, the tying of the Burāq to the door of the mosque and the *miʿrāj* from the mosques as sound traditions.²²⁸

Ibn Qayyim marks also the tradition saying that the believers will seek protection from Yājūj and Mājūj in the sacred precincts of Jerusalem, as a sound one.²²⁹

The severe verdict of the collections of forged traditions on the *faḍaʿil* of Jerusalem, Hebron, Acre and other places in the Holy Land did not stop the incessant flow of these *faḍaʿil*. The lengthy chapter on the virtues of the holy places in Jerusalem in the work of Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī (d. 911 AH), *Fākihāt al-ṣayf wa-anīs al-ḍayf* [pp. 213–25], the abundant quotations on the virtues of the sanctuaries in Jerusalem recorded in his *al-Durr al-manthūr fī l-tafsīr bi-l-maʿthūr* bear evidence to the vitality of these traditions.

²²⁶ Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *al-Manār*, ed. Aḥmad ʿAbd al-Shāfi (Beirut, 1408/1988), 85, nos. 156–7.

²²⁷ Ibid., 86, no. 162 ... *wa-huwa ḥadīthun muḍṭarib*

²²⁸ Ibn Qayyim, ibid., 87, no. 164.

²²⁹ Ibn Qayyim, ibid., 87, no. 165.

At the end of the ninth century, Muḥīr al-Dīn al-ʿUlaymī al-Ḥanbalī (d. 928 AH) wrote his comprehensive work *al-Uns al-jalīl bi-taʾrīkhi l-quḍsi wa-l-khalīl*.²³⁰ The work is indeed a treasure of traditions on the virtues of Jerusalem and Hebron.

But despite the revival of the traditions in praise of Jerusalem, conditions in the Aqṣā mosque in the eleventh century AH, as described by Abū l-Faṭḥ Shams al-Dīn al-Dajjānī al-Qudṣī al-Shāfiʿī in his treatise *Jawāhir al-qalāʾid fī faḍli l-masājīd*,²³¹ were rather gloomy and disheartening.

The recent revival of research on the historical, social, and religious aspects of the customs, beliefs and ritual practices in the early Islamic period and the incessant flow of editions of early Arabic sources may bring about a revaluation and an elucidation of some hitherto overlooked or insufficiently scrutinized details concerning the ideas on holy places in the first centuries of Islam and their development during the following centuries.

²³⁰ (ʿAmmān, 1973), see the detailed indices of the book prepared by Ishāq Mūsā al-Ḥusaynī, Ḥasan ʿAbd al-Raḥmān al-Silwādī, Munīra Muḥammad al-Daghlāwī and Muḥyassar Ismāʿīl Ghannām (Jerusalem, 1988).

²³¹ Edited by Moshe Perlmann, *IOS* 3 (1973), 261–92.