

"DO NOT ASSIMILATE YOURSELVES . . ."

Lā tashabbahū . . .

The sweeping victories gained by the Muslim forces during their conquests in Syria, Irāq and Persia, and their speedy advance in these vast areas, brought about a meeting between the Muslims and the native peoples of those areas. It is, therefore, evident that new principles had to be established in order to guide the Muslim community in its relations with Christians, Jews and Magians. Basing themselves on interpretations of Qur'ānic verses, Muslim scholars stated that Jews and Christians were to be considered unbelievers.¹ Very early commentators of the Qur'ān interpreted the verse: "And confound not truth with falsehood . . ." (*wa-lā talbisū l-ḥaqqā bi-l-bāṭili* -- Qur'ān II, 43) as constituting a warning to the believers not to mix Islām with (the precepts and injunctions of -- K) Judaism and Christianity.² Many of the traditions touching upon this subject

1 See, e.g., 'Abd al-Jabbār, *Tanzīh al-qur'ān 'ani l-maṭā'in*, Beirut ed., pp. 118-119 (cf. p. 118, 13. *wa-dhālika ṣifatu l-yahūdi wa-hum kuffār . . .*); Muqātil, *Tafsīr*, MS. Ahmet III, 74-2, fol. 211b. (. . . *wa-dhālika anna l-yahūda wa-l-naṣārā yushrikūna fī ṣalātihim fī l-biya'i wa-l-kanāisi . . .*). There is however a difference between the unbelief of the People of the Book and that of those who associate idols with God (*al-mushrikūn*); the latter are stronger in their unbelief (. . . *li-anna kufra l-mushrikīna aghlaḏu min kufri ahli l-kitābi . . .*); Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām ahli l-dhimma*, ed. Ṣubḥī al-Ṣāliḥ, Damascus 1381/1961, I, 10.

2 Yaḥyā b. Salām, *Tafsīr*, *Mukhtaṣar Ibn Zamanīn*, Ms. Fas, Qarawiyiyyīn no. 40-34, p. 8 (. . . *qāla qatāda: ya'nī lā takhliṭū l-islāma bi-l-yahūdiyyati wa-l-naṣrāniyyati . . .*); al-Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr*, Cairo 1387/1967, I, 341-342 (see p. 341, 1.3 . . . *lā talbisū l-yahūdiyyata wa-l-naṣrāniyyata bi-l-islāmi wa-qad 'alimtum anna dīna llāhi lhadhī lā yuqbalu ḡayruhu wa-lā yujzā illā bihi l-islāmu wa-anna l-yahūdiyyata wa-l-naṣrāniyyata bid'atun wa-laysat min allāhi . . .*); Ibn Kathīr, *Tafsīr*, Beirut 1385/1966, I, 146; al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr* (= *Jāmi' al-bayān 'an ta'wīl al-qur'ān*), ed. Maḥmūd and Aḥmad Shākīr, Cairo n.d., I, 568, no. 825 (and see another interpretation *ibid.* no. 826:

were scrutinized by I. Goldziher.³

The Muslim community was enjoined to observe strictly the injunctions of the Qur'ān and to follow faithfully the *sunna* of the Prophet. Jāhilī customs and usages were to be abandoned. Thus the prayers performed at sunrise and sunset, when the polytheistic unbelievers (*al-mushrikūn*) used to prostrate themselves to the sun, were forbidden. The sun rises and sets clasped between the two horns of the Devil.⁴ Jāhilī

al-ḥaqq is rendered by: *al-taurāt lladhī (!) anzala llāhu 'alā mūsā* and *al-bāṭil* by *alladhī katabūhu bi-aydihim*); al-Samarqandī, *Tafsīr*, Ms. Chester Beatty, 3668, I, fol. 16 b; al-Shaukānī, *Fath al-qadīr al-jāmi' bayna fannayī l-riwāya wa-l-dirāya min 'ilmi l-tafsīr*, Beirut n.d. I, 76; Abū Ḥayyān, *Tafsīr al-baḥr al-muḥīt*, Cairo 1328, I, 179; and see Muḥammad b. Abī Bakr al-Rāzī, *Masā'il al-rāzī wa-ajwibatuhā*, Cairo 1381/1961, p.5 . . . *li-anna l-murāda bi-talbisihim al-ḥaqqā bi-l-bāṭilī kitābatuhum fī l-taurāti mā laysa minhā . . .*; Muqātil, *Tafsīr*, ed. 'Abdallah Shaḥāta, Cairo 1969, I, 34: . . . *thumma qāla li-l-yahūdi wa-lā talbisū . . . wa-dhālika anna l-yahūda yuqirrūna bi-ba'di amri muḥammadin wa-yaktumūna ba'dan.*

- 3 See, e.g., I. Goldziher, "Über jüdische Sitten und Gebräuche aus muhammedanischen Schriften," *MGWJ*, vol. XXIX, (1880), 302-365; idem, "Usages Juifs d'après la littérature religieuse des Musulmans," *REJ*, XXVIII (1894) 75-94; and see the comprehensive study on this subject published recently: Albrecht Noth, "Abgrenzungsprobleme zwischen Muslimen und nicht-Muslimen: Die "Bedingungen 'Umars (*al-shurūṭ al-'umariyya*)" unter einem anderen Aspekt gelesen," *JSAI*, IX [1987] 290-315.
- 4 See e.g. 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, ed. Ḥabību l-Raḥmān al-A'zamī, Beirut, 1392/1972, II, 424-434 (*al-sā'atu llatī yukrahu fihā l-ṣalātu*); according to some traditions prayer in the middle of the day is also reprehensible: see e.g. al-Daylamī, *Firdaus al-akhbār*, Ms. Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 186a . . . *lā tuṣallū 'inda ṭulū'i l-shamsi, fa-innahā taṭlā'u bayna qarnay shayṭānin, fa-yasjudu lahā kullu kāfirin, wa-lā 'inda ghurūbihā fa-innahā taghrubu bayna qarnay shayṭānin, fa-yasjudu lahā kullu kāfirin, wa-lā wasaṭa l-nahāri fa-innahā tasjuru jahannama 'inda dhālika . . .*; al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, Cairo 1978, I, 895; Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtiḍā' al-ṣiraṭ al-mustaqīm, mukhālafatu aṣḥāb al-jaḥīm*, ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid al-Fiqī, Cairo 1369/1950, p. 135-136; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, Hyderabad 1355, repr. Beirut, II, 453-455; al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id wa-manba' al-fawā'id*, Beirut

practices during the *ṭawāf* were rejected and forbidden.⁵ The practices of bewailing the dead, which were considered to be a remnant of Jāhiliyya customs, were also forbidden.⁶ Bedouin forms of greeting were to be given up. When al-Zubayr came to visit the Prophet in his illness and greeted him by saying *ja'alanī llāhu fidāka*, the Prophet rebuked him by saying that he had not yet given up his bedouin manners (*mā tarakta a'rābiyyataka ba'du*).⁷ The meal consumed after the funeral

1967, II, 493; Muḥammad Ḥabībullah al-Shinqīṭī, *Zād al-muslim fīmā ṭafaqa 'alayhi l-bukhārī wa-muslim*, Cairo 1387/1967, I, 134, nos. 347-348; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ al-qadīr, sharḥ al-jāmi' al-ṣaghīr*, Beirut 1391/1972, V, 318-319, nos. 9408-9409; Ibn Kathīr, *al-Bidāya wa-l-nihāya*, Beirut-al-Riyāḍ 1966, I, 62; al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, Cairo 1348, XV, 192; al-Zamakhsharī, *al-Fā'iḳ*, ed. Muḥammad Abū l-Faḍl Ibrāhīm and 'Alī al-Bijāwī, Cairo 1971, III, 179; *L'A*, s.v. *qrn*; al-Majlisī, *Bihār al-anwār*, Tehran, 1392, LXXXII, 254, sup.; al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, Hyderabad, 1395/1975, VIII, 124, no. 881; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, ed. Ḥamdī 'Abd al-Majīd al-Silafī, n.p., 1405/1985, I, 352, no. 1070, VII, 227, no. 6946, 234, nos. 6973-6974, VIII, 62, no. 7344; al-Būṣīrī, *Miṣbāhu l-zujāja fī zawā'idi bni mājah*, ed. Mūsā Muḥammad 'Alī and 'Izzat 'Alī 'Aṭīyya, Cairo 1983, I, 412, no. 1253; Ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, ed. Muḥammad Muṣṭafā l-'A'zamī, Beirut 1395/1975, II, 256-257, nos. 1273, 1275.

5 See e.g. Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'*, pp. 124-125; cf. M.J. Kister, "Concessions and conduct," in G.H. Juynboll (ed.), *Studies on the first century of Islamic society*, Southern Illinois University Press, 1982, pp. 100-103; and see U. Rubin, "The Ka'ba, Aspects of its ritual functions and position in pre-Islamic and early Islamic times," *JSAI*, VIII (1986), 97-131.

6 See e.g. Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, ed. 'Abd al-Khāliq al-Afghānī, Hyderabad 1388/1968, III, 389-390 (but see *ib.* p. 391 sup.: the *niyāha* permitted). And see about the forbidden practices of the wailing women *ib.* p. 290 sup.: *anna rasūla llāhi (ṣ) la'ana man ḥalaqa wa-kharaqa wa-salaqa . . .*; *ib. anna rasūla llāhi (ṣ) la'ana l-khāmishata wajhahā wa-l-shāqqata jaybahā . . .*; and see al-Būṣīrī, *Miṣbāḥ al-zujāja fī zawā'idi bni mājah*, I, 518-520, nos. 1580-1583, 521, no. 1585.

7 Mālik b. Anas, *Risāla fī l-sunan wa-l-mawā'iḏ wa-l-ādāb*, ed. 'Abdallah Aḥmad Abū Zīna, Cairo 1403/1983, p. 44.

(*al-ṭa'ām 'alā l-mayyit*) was considered a Jāhilī practice.⁸ Ibn 'Umar refrained from praying in a mosque embellished with merlons (*shurufāt*) and gave an order to pull down the merlons because they were reminiscent of the idol stones (*anṣāb*) of Mecca.⁹ The main concern of the religious leaders of the Muslim society was to establish some barrier between the Muslim community and the communities of the Jews, Christians and Magians. This separation was to be upheld in the various spheres of social relations, as well as in rites and customs. In the very early period after the death of the Prophet some young boys kept their side curls uncut. Anas b. Mālik was enraged when he saw a young boy with such curls and ordered him to shave them immediately, because this was the fashion of the Jews.¹⁰ The Prophet told his daughter Fāṭima to pierce the lobes of the ears of al-Ḥasan and al-Ḥusayn, in order to differentiate them from the usage of the Jews.¹¹ Some scholars maintained that

8 Ibn Abi-Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, III, 290, inf.; and see 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, III, 550, no. 6664 . . . 'an sa'īdi bni jubayr qāla: *thalāthun min 'amali l-jāhiliyyati: al-niyāhatu wa-l-ṭa'āmu 'alā l-mayyiti wa-baytūtatu l-mar'ati 'inda ahli l-mayyiti laysat minhum*; and see al-Būṣīrī, *al-Zujāja*, I, 535, no. 1612.

9 Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'*, p. 132, inf.

10 Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'*, pp. 131, inf.-132 sup.; and see L 'A s.v. qṣṣ; Ibn al-Athīr, *al-Nihāya fī gharībi l-ḥadīth*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥammad al-Ṭanāhī, Cairo 1385/1965, IV, 71, s.v. qṣṣ; idem, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl min aḥādīthi l-rasūl*, ed. Muḥammad Ḥāmid al-Fiqī, Cairo 1368/1949, V, 424, no. 2893.

11 Ibn Bābūyah al-Qummī, *Man lā yaḥḍuruḥu l-faqīh*, ed. Ḥasan al-Mūsawī al-Khursān, Beirut 1401/1981, III, 319, no. 1534; and see the description of Sufyān al-Thaurī as a young man with an earring in his ear: Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil fī qu'afā'i l-rijāl*, *al-Muqaddima*, ed. Subḥī l-Badrī l-Samarrā'i, Bagdad 1977, p. 156; and see al-Mundhirī, *al-Targhīb wa-l-tarḥīb*, ed. Muḥyī l-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd, Cairo, 1381/1961, IV, 223, no. 3182: . . . *wa-inna fī udhunī la-qurṭayni, wa-anā ghulām . . .*; and see the opinion of Mālik b. Anas in 'Abdallah b. Abī Zayd al-Qayrawānī, *al-Jāmi' fī l-sunan wa-l-ādāb wa-l-maghāzī wa-l-ta'rīkh*, ed. Muḥammad Abū l-Ajfan and 'Uthmān Biṭṭīkh, Tunis-Beirut 1402/1982, p. 231: . . . *wa-akrahu l-qurṭa mina l-dhahabi li-l-ghilmāni l-ṣighār*.

performing circumcision on the seventh day after a boy's birth is disliked, as this may indicate an assimilation to a Jewish custom.¹² Orthodox scholars were unwilling to instruct people to avoid work on Friday, considering this to be too close to the usage of the Jews and the Christians who do not work on Saturday and Sunday respectively.¹³ The believers were enjoined to refrain from placing their hands on the tombs or kissing them when visiting a cemetery; it was considered a Jewish custom.¹⁴

The Prophet ordered the believers not to greet each other in the way observed by Jews and Christians: the Jews greet each other by raising their fingers, the Christians by raising their hands.¹⁵ Some traditions attributed to the Prophet claimed that he forbade shaking hands with *dhimmi*s. The prohibition is explained by commentators by saying that the *dhimmi*s are

12 See 'Abdallah b. Abī Zayd al-Qayrawāni, *al-Jāmi'*, pp. 208 ult.-209 sup. . . . *qāla mālik: wa-lā yu'jibunī an yukhtana l-ṣabiyyu bnu sab'ati ayyām, wa-hādihā fi'lu l-yahūd . . .* [but see the note of the editors, *ib.*]; and see Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Zād al-ma'ād fī hadyi khayri l-'ibād*, Beirut, n.d. II, 4.

13 See al-Ṭurtūshī, *al-Ḥawādith wa-l-bida'*, ed. Muḥammad al-Ṭālibī, Tunis 1959, p. 133: . . . *wa-qāla mālik fī l-mudawwana inna ba'da aṣḥāb al-nabiyyi (ṣ) kănū yakrahūna an yatrūka l-rajulu l-'amala yauma l-jumu'a kamā tarakati l-yahūdu wa-l-naṣārā fī yaumi l-sabti wa-l-aḥadi* ; and cf. Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Zād al-ma'ād*, I, 115.

14 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī, *al-Ghunya li-ṭālibī tarīqa l-ḥaqqi 'azza wa-jalla*, Cairo 1322, I, 44: . . . *wa-idhā zāra qabran lā yaḍa' yadahu 'alayhi wa-lā yuqabbilhu, fa-innahu 'ādatu l-yahūd . . .*

15 Al-Munāwī, Fayd, VI, 402, no. 9798: . . . *lā tusallimū taslīma l-yahūdi wa-l-naṣārā, fa-inna taslīmahum ishāratun bi-l-kufūfi wa-l-ḥawājibi*. (And see the comments of al-Munāwī, *ib.*); Al-Munāwī, Fayd, V, 384, no. 7679: . . . *laysa minnā man tashabbaha bi-ghayrinā, lā tashabbahū bi-l-yahūdi wa-lā bi-l-naṣārā fa-inna taslīma l-yahūdi l-ishāratu bi-l-aṣābi' wa-taslīma l-naṣārā l-ishāratu bi-l-akuffi* ; Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Iqtīdā'*, p. 85; al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, I, 684; Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl*, VII, 388, no. 4861; Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, ed. Ḥusayn Salīm Asad, Beirut 1404/1984, III, 397, no. 1875; Ibn al-Qaysarānī, *Ma'rifa al-tadhkira fī l-aḥādīthi l-mauḍū'a*, ed. 'Imād al-Dīn Aḥmad Ḥaydar, Beirut 1406/1985, p. 139, no. 387; *Fawā'id min kalāmi bni rajab*, Majmū'a, Ms. Hebrew University AP. Ar. 8* 158, fol. 104a = Ms.

unbelievers, *kuffār*, and therefore do not deserve to have their hands shaken. The Muslims, on the other hand, are brethren, and they have to greet each other with the shaking of hands and with the greeting of *salām*.¹⁶ Mālik b. Anas, however, did not see any wrong in shaking hands with Jews and Christians.¹⁷ Similar in content were some traditions traced to Ibn 'Abbās. Had Pharaoh greeted me by saying, "May God bless you", I would answer, "And you". "And Pharaoh is dead already", added Ibn 'Abbās.¹⁸ Ibn 'Abbās is said to have recommended that the greeting of a Jew, a Christian or a Magian be answered in a proper manner; he based himself on Sūra IV, 86: *And when you are greeted with a greeting, greet with a fairer than it, or return it; surely God keeps a watchful count over everything*, which in his opinion referred to believers and to unbelievers alike.¹⁹ A tradition traced to Abū Mūsā al-Ash'arī, who is said to have answered in a due manner the greeting of a *dihqān* in a letter sent to him, displays the same attitude.²⁰ Some traditions enjoin that the response of a believer to the greeting of the People of the Book be confined to the utterance "And upon you"; this concise response was justified by the fact that the Jews greeted the Prophet by saying *al-sām 'alayka*, and the Prophet ordered that the malediction of the Jews be answered

Laurenziana, Or. 197, fol. 94a; Goldziher, *Über jüdische Sitten*, p. 355.

16 Al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *al-Manhiyyāt*, ed. Muḥammad al-Sa'īd Zaghlūl, Beirut 1405/1985, p. 76 sup.; comp. al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, VI, 350, no. 9569: . . . *nahā an yuṣāfaḥa l-mushrikūna au yuknau au yuraḥḥaba bihim* . . . (and see *ib.*, the comments of al-Munāwī); and see 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī, *al-Ghunya*, I, 44.

17 Mālik b. Anas, *Risāla*, p. 44.

18 Faḍlu llāhi al-Jīlānī, *Faḍlu llāhi l-ṣamad fī tauḍīḥi l-adabi l-mufrad li-abī 'abdi llāhi muḥammadi bni ismā'ila l-bukhārī*, Ḥimṣ, 1388/1969, II, 555, no. 1113; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, X, 319, no. 10609.

19 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 549, no. 1107; and see: Maḥmūd Muḥammad al-Zabīdī, *Uqūd al-jawāhir al-munīfa*, ed. Wahbī Sulaymān al-Albānī, Beirut 1406/1985, II, 151 ult.-152.

20 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 544, inf.-545, sup.

by the ominous: *wa-'alaykum*.²¹ Several traditions enjoined upon Muslims not to be the first to greet Jews and Christians;²² this injunction was often coupled with the utterance of the Prophet in which it was said that Jews and Christians encountered on a road should be forced to the narrowest part of the way.²³

In another tradition, the list of people from whom one should withhold one's greeting includes Jews, Christians, Zoroastrians, wine drinkers, people who cast doubts on the

21 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 545, no. 1102, II, 548, nos. 1105-1106, II, 553, no. 1110; Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Dīnawarī (Ibn al-Sunnī), *'Amal al-yaum wa-l-layla*, Hyderabad 1358, p. 67; Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl*, VII, 389-392, nos. 4863-4866; Mālik b. Anas, *Risāla*, p. 44; al-Jaṣṣāṣ, *Aḥkām al-Qur'ān*, Quṣṭanṭīniyya, 1338, III, 427; Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, V, 295, no. 2916, 410, no. 3089, 425, no. 3114, 445, no. 3153, 478, no. 3214; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, IX, 68, no. 646, 69, no. 660, 70, nos. 672, 675; Goldziher, *Über jüdische Sitten*, p. 308; al-Dā'i Thiqaṭ al-Imām, *al-Majālis al-mustanṣiriyya*, ed. Muḥammad Kāmil Ḥusayn, n.p., n.d., p. 109; 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī b. Balabān al-Fārisī, *al-Iḥsān fī taqrīb ṣaḥīhi bni ḥibbān*, ed. Shu'ayb al-Arna'ūt, Beirut 1404/1984, II, 220, no. 503.

22 Al-Jaṣṣāṣ, *op.cit.*, III, 427: . . . *qāla abū bakrīn* [i.e. al-Jaṣṣāṣ]: *wa-innamā kuriha al-ibtidā'u li-anna l-salāma min taḥiyyati ahli l-jannati fa-kuriha an yubda'a bihi l-kāfiru idh laysa min ahlihā wa-lā yukrahu l-raddu 'alā wajhi l-mukāfa'ati . . .*; al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 545, no. 1102; Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil fī du'afa'i l-rijāl*, VII, 2237-2238; Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, II, 236, no. 936; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, VI, 386, no. 9726; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, II, 277-278, nos. 2162-2164; I. Goldziher, *Über jüdische Sitten*, p. 307.

23 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 547, no. 1103, 554, no. 1111; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, VI, 386, no. 9726; al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, I, 87; Ibn al-Sunnī, *'Amal*, p. 67; Ibrāhīm b. 'Alī al-Fayrūzābādī al-Shīrāzī, *al-Muhadhdhab fī fiḥi l-imāmi l-shāfi'i*, Beirut 1379/1959 (repr.), II, 255; Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl*, VII, 392, no. 4867; al-Jaṣṣāṣ, *Aḥkām*, III, 427; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Zād al-ma'ād*, II, 27 [and see the different views of the Muslim scholars on this subject, *ib.*]; al-Fayrūzābādī, *Sifr al-sa'āda*, Beirut 1398/1978, p. 103; Muḥammad Muṣṭafā 'Azmi [= al-A'zamī], *Studies in early Hadīth Literature*, Beirut 1968, Ar. text, p. 20, no. 29 and pp. 80-81 [the assessment of the tradition].

pedigree of people's mothers and players of chess.²⁴ In one of the pious utterances the believer is recommended to utter the formula of the oneness of God when looking at a church or a synagogue, on hearing the sound of a horn (*shabūr*) or a church-bell (*nāqūs*) or when looking at a group of unbelievers, Jews or Christians.²⁵

Scholars devoted some attention to the problem of how to deal with a greeting given by mistake, that is, if a Muslim responded to the greeting of a *dhimmi* but later realized that he had made a mistake, he would often come back and ask him to "give him back" the greeting.²⁶ In one case of this kind the reason for asking the response to the greeting to be "given back" is formulated as follows: the mercy of God and His blessing are reserved exclusively for the Muslims; therefore the believer ('Uqba b. 'Amir al-Juhani) substituted the invocation "May God expand the span of your life (*aṭāla llāhu ḥayātaka*) and multiply (*akthara*) your wealth and children" to the conventional response to a greeting.²⁷ The reason why one should avoid a greeting which contained a reference to the "Mercy of God" was that the blessing to someone who sneezed had been changed because of the Jews. The latter would present themselves to the Prophet sneezing, and would expect the Prophet to say, "May God have mercy upon you (*raḥimakumu llāhu*)", but the Prophet used to say: "May God lead you to the right way (*yahdikumumu llāhu wa-yuṣliḥu bālakumu*)."²⁸ It is similarly forbidden to use the

24 Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, IX, 132, no. 1099; al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, II, 417, no. 4296.

25 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī, *al-Ghunya*, I, 47 . . . *wa-yustahabbu idhā ra'ā bay'atan au kanīṣatan . . . an yaqūla: ashhadu an lā ilāha illā llāhu waḥdahu lā sharīka lahu ilāhan wāḥidan lā na'budu illā iyyāhu.*

26 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 555, no. 1115; I. Goldziher, *Über jüdische Sitten*, p. 308.

27 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 554, no. 1112; al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, II, 401, no. 4247: *idhā da'autum li-aḥadin mina l-yahūdi au al-naṣārā fa-qūlū: akthara llāhu mālaka wa-wuldaka.*

28 Al-Jīlānī, *op.cit.*, II, 555, no. 1114; Ibn al-Sunnī, *'Amal*, p. 72; Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl*, VII, 400, no. 4888.

formula *salāmu llāhi 'alaykum* when writing to non-Muslims; the formula to be used should be *al-salāmu 'alā man ittaba'a l-hudā*; this formula was used by the Prophet in his letter to Musaylima.²⁹

The believers were warned of adoption of ideas and customs of Jews and Christians and were enjoined not to follow them in their practices and rites. But it is worthwhile to notice that the Prophet himself is said to have followed the practices and rituals of the People of the Book until ordered by God to act differently.³⁰

29 Mālik b. Anas, *Risāla*, p. 40.

30 See e.g. al-Ḥāzimī, *al-l'tibār fī bayāni l-nāsikhī wa-l-mansūkhī mina l-akhbār*, Hyderabad 1359, p. 121: . . . *Kāna yatashabbahu bi-ahli l-kitābi, fa-lammā nusikha dhālika wa-nuhiya 'anhu nahā . . .*; and see al-Ṭahāwī, *Sharḥ ma'ānī l-āthār*, ed. Maḥmūd Sayyid Jāo al-Ḥaqq, Cairo 1388/1968, I, 489: . . . *Kāna yatabi'u ahla l-kitābi hattā yu'maru bi-khilāfi dhālika . . . li-anna ḥukmahu ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam an yakūna 'alā sharī'ati l-nabiyyi lladhī kāna qablahu hattā yuḥdatha lahu sharī'atun tansukhu . . .*; and see *ib.* p. 490 the comment of 'Alī when the believers stood up at a funeral: "that [was so] while you were Jews", *dhālika wa-antum yahūdu . . .*; al-Ṭahāwī explains that 'Alī referred to the fact that they followed the *sharī'a* of the Jews; later it was abrogated by Islam. And see *ib.* p. 389: the hairdress of the Prophet was like that of the Jews; it was later changed by the Prophet. And see Ibrāhīm al-Bājūrī, *Hāshiya 'alā l-shamā'ili l-muḥammadiyya . . . li-l-tirmidhī*, Cairo 1344, p. 41: . . . *kāna yasdilu sha'rahu . . . wa-kāna l-mushrikūna yafruqūna ru'usahum . . . wa-kāna yuḥibbu muwāfaqata ahli l-kitābi fīmā lam yu'mar fīhi bi-shay'in, ay fīmā lam yuṣṭab fīhi minhu shay'un 'alā jihati l-wujūbi au al-nadbi; qāla l-Qurṭubī: wa-ḥubbuhu muwāfaqatahum kāna fī auwwali l-amri 'inda quḍūmihi l-madīnata fī l-waḥti lladhī kāna yastaqbilu qiblatahum fīhi li-ta'allufihim, fa-lammā lam yanfa' fīhim dhālika wa-ghalabat 'alayhim al-shaqwa amara bi-mukhālafatihim fī umūrin kathīratin; wa-innamā āthara maḥabbata ahli l-kitābi dūna l-mushrikīn li-tamassuki ulā'ika bi-baqāya sharā'i l-rusuli, wa-hā'ulā'i wathaniyyūn*; and see the discussion concerning the *sharī'a* followed by the Prophet in the period of the Jāhiliyya before his Call: Ibn al-'Arabī, *Tafsīr al-qur'ān* (= *Aḥkām al-qur'ān*), pp. 23-24; 'Abdallah b.

Believers were enjoined to refrain from disputes with the People of the Book as to the Torah, the Injil and the Zabūr, and from confirming their views; believers should affirm the truth of passages which are true, and which have been falsified or declared untrue (*fa-tukadhdhibūnahum*) by the People of the Book. The believers were enjoined to believe only in the holy Book, i.e. the Qur'ān.³¹

An extremist attitude towards the *dhimmi*s is exposed in traditions which say that Jibrīl refrained from conveying the revelation to the Prophet and from touching his hand because the Prophet had touched the hand of a Jew. Only after the Prophet had performed the ritual ablution did Jibrīl shake his hand and convey the revelation to him.³² A similar tradition says that the Prophet advised Abū Hurayra not to shake hands with a Jew or a Christian after having performed the *wuḍū'*; if he shook hands with them, he would have to repeat the

Muḥammad al-Ṣadīqī al-Ghimārī, *Takhrīj aḥādīthi l-luma' fī uṣūli l-fiqh*, ed. Yūsuf 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar'ashlī, Beirut 1405/1984, pp. 184-185; al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-mawāhibi l-laduniyya*, Cairo 1328, VII, 239-242: . . . *wa-qad ikhtalafa l-'ulamā'u hal kāna 'alayhi l-ṣalātu wa-l-salāmu qabla ba'thatihi muta'abbidan bi-shar'i man qablahu am lā . . .*; and see Mughultāy, *al-Zahr al-bāsim fī sīrat abī l-qāsim*, MS. Leiden Or. 370, fol. 110 a-b: . . . *qāla l-mādhiri: ikhtalafa l-nāsu hal kāna muta'abbidan qabla nubuwwatihi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam bi-shar'atin am lā . . .*

31 *Al-Daylamī*, *Firdaus al-akhbār*, Ms. Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 188 b, sup.; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, IX, 413, no. 9759. The utterance *lā tuṣaddiqū ahla l-kitābi* is said to have been connected with a peculiar usage in the first stage of Islam, as reflected in the following report: . . . *'an abī hurayrata [r] qāla: kāna ahlu l-kitābi yaqra'ūna l-taurāta bi-l-'ibrāniyyati wa-yufassirūnahā li-ahli l-islāmi bi-l-'arabiyyati; fa-qāla rasūlu llāhi [ṣ]: lā tuṣaddiqū ahla l-kitābi . . .*; see Ibn Ḥazm, *al-Fiṣal fī l-milal wa-l-ahwā'i wa-l-niḥal*, Cairo 1384/1964, II, 13 sup.; cf. al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr fī l-tafsīr bi-l-ma'thūr*, Cairo 1314, II, 48.

32 Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, III, 227; al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-'itidāl*, ed. 'Alī Muḥammad al-Bijāwī, Cairo 1382/1963, III, 299; I. Goldziher, *Usages juifs*, p. 76.

ablution.³³ Although scholars called upon Muslims to restrict their contacts with the People of the Book, the believers were urged to summon them to embrace Islam whenever they met them.³⁴

The consensus of the Muslim scholars was that the precepts of Islam abrogated the injunctions of every religion which preceded Islam; God annulled the laws of the Torah, the Injil and the other religions, and made the laws of Islam incumbent upon mankind and upon the *jinn*.³⁵ If the Torah or the Gospels are taken as booty during a military expedition, they should not be left to stand as they are, because these are books deliberately altered (*mubaddala*) and without any sanctity (*lā ḥurmata lahā*). The writing should therefore be scratched out, and the vellum or paper utilized in a proper fashion.³⁶

It stands to reason that traces of Jewish and Christian rites and usages should be abrogated. The Prophet forbade believers to lean on their left when sitting during prayer. Such practices were labelled by the Prophet "the prayer of the Jews".³⁷ The believers were ordered not to sway during prayer from one side to the other in the manner of the Jews when they prayed³⁸

33 Muḥyī l-Dīn Ibn al-'Arabī, *al-Wāṣāyā*, Beirut n.d., p. 198; 'Abd al-Qādir al-Jīlānī, *al-Ghunya*, I, 44 inf.

34 Muḥyī l-Dīn Ibn al-'Arabī, *al-Wāṣāyā*, p. 198.

35 Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām*, I, 259.

36 Ibrāhīm b. 'Alī al-Shīrāzī, *al-Muhadhdhab*, II, 241 inf.

37 Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz al-'ummāl*, VII, 342, no. 2212, VIII, 97, no. 716, 98 nos. 717-718; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, VI, 345, no. 9536; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, VII, 316, no. 7243: *hādhihi jilsatu l-maghḏūbī 'alayhim*.

38 Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VIII, 129, no. 921: . . . 'an ummi rūmān qālat: *ra'ānī abū bakrin amīlu fī l-ṣalāti fa-zajaranī zajratan kidtu anṣarifū min ṣalāti thumma qāla: sami'tu rasūla llāhi [ṣ] yaqūlu: idhā qāma aḥadukum fī l-ṣalāti fa-l-yusakkīn aṭrāfahu wa-lā yamīlu mayla l-yahūdi, fa-inna taskīna l-aṭrāfi min tamāmi l-ṣalāti*; al-Khallāl, *al-Musnad min mas'āl aḥmad b. muḥammad b. ḥanbal*, Ms. Br. Mus. Or. 2675, fol. 80a: . . . *wa-l-yahūdu tanūdu fī l-ṣalāti, wa-kadhālika*

or when the Torah was unrolled.³⁹ Muslim scholars disapproved of invocations at the *minbar* that were accompanied by the raising of hands and by loud noises; these were labelled *taqlīs al-yahūd*.⁴⁰ Standing up and raising one's hands during the *ṭawāf* was condemned as a Jewish custom. "Jews in the synagogues use such a practice", said 'Abdallah b. 'Amr b. al-'Āṣ, and advised the believers who used to follow this practice during the *ṭawāf* to utter such invocations in their councils (*majālis*, not during the *ṭawāf*).⁴¹ Jews used to close their eyes

l-rāfiḍatu . . .

39 *Ibn al-Athīr, al-Nihāya*, V, 124, s.v. *nwd*.

40 *Al-Ṭurtūshī, Kitāb al-ḥawādith*, p. 59 inf. [The text *lā tuqallīs taqlīša l-yahūd* is interpreted by Mālik (b. Anas) as denoting rising of the voice and rising of hands in invocation. *Taqlīš* in this meaning could, however, not be traced in the standard dictionaries; but a very similar definition is given for *taqlīs* (with a *sīn*): *al-taqlīs huwa raf'u l-ṣauti bi-l-du'a'i wa-l-qir'āti wa-ghinā'i*; see e.g. *L 'A*, s.v. *qls*; and see *ib.* other interpretations of the verb]. According to tradition the Prophet was entertained by *taqlīs* on the day of 'īd al-*fiṭr*: *kāna yuqallasu lahu yauma l-*fiṭr**; this is rendered by al-Munāwī by: . . . *yudrabu bayna yadayhi bi-l-duff wa-l-ghinā'* [al-Munāwī, *Fayd*, V, 238, no. 7130]. *Taqlīs*, entertainment, play, is said to have been practiced on two days of feasts in the period of the Jāhiliyya; it was replaced by the entertainment on the days of 'īd al-*fiṭr* and 'īd al-*adḥā*. [See e.g. al-Ṭahāwī, *Mushkil al-āthār*, Hyderabad 1333, II, 211]. Qays b. Sa'd b. 'Ubāda is said to have been astonished that this practice was abandoned after the death of the Prophet [. . . *shahidtu 'īdan bi-l-anbār, fa-qultu lahum: mā lī lā arākum tuqallisūna kamā kānū yuqallisūna 'alā 'ahdi rasūli llāhi (ṣ)*]; al-Ṭahāwī, *Mushkil*, II, 209]. A similar utterance is attributed to 'Iyāḍ al-Ash'arī [al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, II, 586, inf.]. 'Iyāḍ stresses that the *taqlīs* is a *sunna* [*fa-innahu sunnatun*]; the word *taqlīs* is explained by Yūsuf b. 'Adiyy as an entertainment in which girls and boys used to sit on the roads playing drums and other instruments [*ib.* II, 586, penult., and cf. al-Ṭahāwī, *Mushkil*, II, 212, sup.]. And see on *taqlīs* in the time of the Prophet: Ibn al-Athīr, *Uṣd al-ghāba*, IV, 164 and Ibn Ḥajar, *al-Iṣāba*, IV, 756, no. 6143.

41 About raising of hands during prayers and invocations see: al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-ītidāl*, ed. 'Alī Muhammad al-Bijāwī, Cairo 1382/1963, III, 429, no. 7036: *man rafa'a yadayhi fī l-ṣalāt fa-lā ṣalāta lahu*; and see

during their prayers; this practice was disliked and even forbidden in Islam.⁴² Two features of Jewish prayer, the

Ibn Hibbān al-Bustī, *Kitāb al-majrūhīn*, ed. Maḥmūd Ibrāhīm Zāyid, n.p. 1976, III, 46, 11.1-2; Ibn al-Qaysarānī, *Ma'rifat al-tadhkira*, p. 85, no. 17: . . . *a-ra'aytum raf'akum aydiyakum fī l-ṣalāti innahā la-bid'atun*; and see the various versions of this utterance: al-Bustī, *al-Majrūhīn*, I, 186: . . . *bid'atun, ya'nī ilā uḥunayhi; mā zāda rasūlu llāhi 'alā hādihā, ya'nī thadyayhi . . . wa-auma'a ḥammād ilā thadyayhi . . . ; wa-l-'arabu tusammī l-ṣalāta du'ā'an, fa-khabaru ḥammādin hādihā a-ra'aytum raf'akum aydiyakum fī l-ṣalāti' arāda bihi "fī l-du'ā'" . . . ;* and see al-Būṣīrī, *Miṣbāhu l-zujāja*, I, 299, no. 860: . . . *ra'aytu rasūla llāhi (ṣ) yarfa'u yadayhi fī l-ṣalāti ḥadhwā manḥibayhi hīna yaftatiḥu l-ṣalāta wa-hīna yarka'u wa-hīna yasjudu . . . ;* and see another tradition *ib. pp. 299-301*. Cf. Ibn al-Qaysarānī, *Ma'rifatu l-tadhkira*, p. 153, no. 451: . . . *ra'aytu l-nabiyya (ṣ) kāna idhā rafa'a ra'sahu mina l-sajdati l-ūlā rafa'a yadayhi tilqā'a wajhihi*; and see *ib. p. 117, no. 233: . . . kāna idhā raka'a rafa'a yadayhi lā yujāwizu bihimā uḥunayhi wa-qāla: al-shayṭānu yarfa'u yadayhi fauqa ra'sihi*; and see Ibn Hibbān al-Bustī, *al-Majrūhīn*, I, 316: . . . *inna l-shayṭāna hīna ukhrija mina l-jannati rafa yadayhi fauqa ra'sihi*; and see this tradition: Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil fī du'afā'i l-rijāl* III, 1224; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, IX, 300-301, nos. 9298-9300; and see the scrutiny of the different versions of the tradition of rising the hands: Murtaḍā l-Zabīdī, *'Uqūdu l-jawāhiri l-munīfa*, ed. Wahbī Sulayman al-Albānī, Beirut 1406/1985, I, 100-103 [and see the comments of the editor]; and see Muḥammad b. Ja'far al-Kattānī, *Naẓm al-muanāthir mina l-ḥadīthi l-mutawātir*, Cairo 1983, pp. 85-86, no. 67, 176-177 no. 203. Ibn Rajab al-Ḥanbalī, *Jāmi' al-'ulūm wa-l-ḥikam*, ed. 'Abd al-'Azīz Kāmil and Muḥammad al-Aḥmadī Abū l-Nūr, Cairo 1969, I, 222, penult.-226; cf. Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, V, 291, no. 294; and see al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, X, 388, no. 10779; Ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, I, 294-296, no. 583, 344-345, nos. 693, 695, III, 146-147, nos. 1791-1792; and see, e.g., M.J. Kister, "Concessions and conduct" in: G.H.A. Juynboll (ed.) *Studies on the first century of Islamic society*, p. 98, note 80; al-Ṭurṭūshī, *al-Hawādith*, p. 122.

⁴² 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, II, 271, no. 3329; Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtida'*, p. 85; al-Daylamī, *Firdaus*, Ms. Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 186a; al-Jarrāhī, *Kashfu l-khafā'i wa-muzilu l-ilbās 'ammā ishtahara mina l-aḥādīthi*

sadl and the *ishtimāl al-šammā*,⁴³ were strongly disapproved of. Tradition says that the Prophet was admonished not to follow other unpleasant features of Jewish prayers: members of a Jewish congregation would lower their voices and then raise them, following the lead of one of them, who raised his voice and shouted loudly.⁴⁴ The believers were ordered to abstain from talking to each other during prayers, as this was the custom of Jews and Christians.⁴⁵ The greeting *may God hear your and our prayer on the Day of the Feast* was marked by the Prophet as a greeting of the People of the Book and he,

'*alā alsinatī l-nās*, Beirut 1351, no. 3003; closing of eyes was however permitted in certain circumstances: see 'Izz al-Dīn 'Abd al-Salām, *al-Fatāwā*, ed. 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. 'Abd al-Fattāh, Beirut 1406/1986, p. 147, no. 106.

43 Al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, Hyderabad [reprint al-Riyāḍ 1968], II, 242-243; Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, II, 730; Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'*, pp. 129-131 [see the discussion about the meaning of the word and the problem of the permissibility of prayer in this way]; Ibn al-Athīr, *al-Nihāya*, s.v. *sdl*; al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-Jawāmi'*, II, 492: . . . *lā yashtamil aḥadukum ishtimāla l-yahūd . . .*; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VIII, 13, no. 78: . . . *lā yashtamil aḥadukum fī l-ṣalāti shtimāla l-yahūd* 129, nos. 917-918; al-Tūsī, *al-Nihāya fī mujarradi l-fiḡhi wa-fatāwā*, Beirut 1390/1970, pp. 97 inf.-98 sup.; al-Majlisī, *Biḡār al-anwār* LXXXIII, 203-211; al-Baḡrānī, *al-Ḥadā'iq al-nāḡira fī aḡkām al-'itratī l-tāhira*, ed. Muḡammad Taḡiyy al-Ayrawānī, Najaf 1379, VII, 122-125; and see Abū Yūsuf, *Kitāb al-āthār*, ed. Abū l-Wafā, Cairo 1355, p. 39, nos. 201-202 [and see the comments of the editor]; and see ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḡīḡ*, I, 378, no. 769 [*ishtimāl*], 379, no. 772 [*sadl*]; and see Zayn al-Dīn b. Ibrāḡīm b. Nujaym al-Miṣrī, *Sharḡ risālatī l-ṣaḡḡā'ir wa-l-kabā'ir*, Cairo 1401/1981, p. 63.

44 Ibn Kathīr, *Tafsīr*, IV, 361; al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr*, [Būlāḡ 1321, repr. Beirut] XV, 125; and see al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manḡūr*, III, 156: . . . *wa-akḡraja abū l-ṣhaykḡi 'ani bni 'umara qāla: kānat banū isrā'īla idḡā qarā'at a'immatuhum jāwabūhum fa-kariḡa llāḡu dhālika li-hādhīhi l-ummati; qāla: idḡā qurī'a l-qur'ānu fa-stamī'ū wa-anṣitū*.

45 Al-Muttaqī al-Hindī, *Kanz*, VIII, 112, no. 809; al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manḡūr*, III, 156.

therefore, disapproved of it.⁴⁶

One item of clothing which marked the difference between the ritual of the Muslims and that of the Jews was the shoe. Shoes were indeed a token of high social position for their owners. The Prophet was ordered to wear shoes and to set a seal (i.e. a ring with a seal) on his finger.⁴⁷ Shoes were considered to be "the wear of the prophets".⁴⁸ The Prophet is said to have advised the believers to hold shoes in high esteem, as they were "the anklets of men".⁴⁹ One of the epithets of the Prophet was *ṣāhib al-na'layn*.⁵⁰ According to one tradition, the Prophet entrusted his Companion, Abū Hurayra, with a special mission: he handed him his shoes and ordered him to assure everyone whom he met while carrying them that he would enter Paradise if only he uttered the *shahāda*, as a token of his firm belief. Abū Hurayra was however impeded by 'Umar in his mission, for 'Umar kicked him and threw him to the ground. Abū Hurayra returned

46 Ibn Ḥamza al-Ḥusaynī al-Dimaṣḥqī, *al-Bayān wa-l-ta'rif fī asbāb wurūdi l-ḥadīthi l-sharīf*, Beirut 1400/1980, II, 339, no. 1038. Ibn al-Qaysarānī, *Ma'rifat al-tadhkira*, p. 157, no. 472; Ibn Ḥibbān al-Bustī, *al-Majrūhīn*, II, 149; al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān al-ītidāl*, II, 543, no. 4791; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, IX, 133, no. 1101. [but see *al-Majrūhīn* II, 301: the Prophet approved of this greeting]; and see I. Goldziher, *Usages Juifs*, p. 85.

47 Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, V, 138; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, II, 190, no. 1635; Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl fī madḥi l-ni'āl*, Hyderabad 1334, p. 100; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām ahli l-dhimma*, p. 755.

48 Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, p. 27.

49 Al-Daylamī, *Firdaus*, Ms. Chester Beatty 4139, fol. 35b: . . . *istajīdū l-ni'āl fa-innahā khalākhīlu l-rijāl*; al-Zamakhsharī, *Rabī'u l-abrār wa-nuṣuṣ al-akḥbār*, ed. Salīm al-Nu'aymī, Bagdad 1402/1982, IV, 28 (attributed to al-Aḥnaf); Ibn Qutayba, *'Uyūn al-akḥbār*, Cairo 1349/1930, I, 301 (attributed to al-Aḥnaf); al-Jāḥiẓ, *al-bayān wa-l-tabyīn*, ed. 'Abd al-Salām Hārūn, Cairo (reprint Beirut), III, 98; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām*, p. 755 (attributed to 'Umar).

50 Aḥmad al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, p. 101; al-Zurqānī, *Sharḥ al-mawāhib al-laduniyya*, Cairo 1326, III, 136, 1.3.

to the Prophet, gave him back his shoes and, crying, informed him of 'Umar's deed. 'Umar succeeded in persuading the Prophet that Abū Hurayra's mission should be stopped, as the promise of Paradise might have brought about remissness in carrying out one's religious duties.⁵¹

Yellow shoes were regarded with favour, and the Prophet is said to have stated that he who wears them would enjoy contentment as long as they were on his feet.⁵² Scholars admitted, however, that it is not incumbent on the believers to wear shoes like those of the Prophet.⁵³ An utterance attributed to the Prophet says that God granted the Muslim community the distinction of performing their prayers while wearing shoes.⁵⁴ In another utterance attributed to the Prophet it is stated that shoes are the adornment of prayer.⁵⁵ The Prophet interpreted the phrase: "O children of Ādam! look to your adornment at every place of worship [*khudhū zīnatakum 'inda kulli masjidin*, Sūrat al-a'rāf, 31]", as denoting an injunction to wear shoes during prayers.⁵⁶ A great many traditions state that the Prophet used to

51 Aḥmad al-Maghribī, *Faṭḥ al-muta'āl*, pp. 60-61.

52 Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, I, 78; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, X, 320, no. 10612.

53 See Muḥammad Aḥmad al-'Adawī, *Uṣūl fī l-bida'i wa-l-sunan*, n.p., 1401, p. 42.

54 Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr al-manthūr*, III, 78, inf.: . . . *mimmā akrama llāhu bihi hādhihi l-ummata lubsu nī'ālihim fī ṣalātihim*; 'Ali b. Muḥammad b. 'Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī'ati l-marfū'a 'ani l-aḥādīthi l-shanī'ati l-mauḍū'a*, ed. 'Abd al-Wahhāb 'Abd al-Laṭīf and 'Abdallah Muḥammad al-Ṣiddiq, Beirut 1399/1979, II, 101, no. 74.

55 Al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr*, III, 78, inf; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, II, 54; Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 405, no. 532.

56 Al-Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr*, VII, 190 sup.: . . . *ilbasū nī'ālakum fa-ṣallū fihā*; Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, pp. 1829, 2156, 2171; al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr*, III, 78 inf.: . . . *khudhū zīnatakum 'inda kulli masjidin, qāla: ṣallū fī nī'ālikum*; al-Shaukānī, *Faṭḥ al-qadīr*, II, 201; and see *ib. min tamāmi l-ṣalāti al-ṣalātu fī l-na'layn*; (and see this tradition: al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 376, no. 2450; and see Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, VI, 2156); Ibn 'Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī'a*, II, 101 (*zayn al-ṣalāti l-ḥidhā'u*).

pray with his shoes on.⁵⁷ Some sources record lists of Companions and *ṭābi‘ūn* who performed their prayers while they were wearing shoes.⁵⁸ Ibrāhīm al-Nakha‘ī took care to put on his shoes at the beginning of prayer.⁵⁹ Very high merit was placed on prayer while wearing one’s shoes: according to a tradition, an angel announces to the believer who prays while wearing shoes that all his sins have been forgiven and that he should resume

-
- 57 Al-Taḥāwī, *Sharḥ ma‘ānī l-āthār*, ed. Muḥammad Sayyid Jādd al-Ḥaqq, Cairo n.d., I, 511-512; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma’ al-zawā‘id*, II, 54, 55; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 431; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ighāthat al-lahfān min maṣāyidi l-shayṭān*, reprint Beirut, 1358/1939, I, 147; al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr*, III, 79 sup.; Ibn ‘Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, VI, 2214; Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī, *Fath al-bārī, sharḥ ṣaḥīḥ al-bukhārī*, Būlāq 1300 (repr. Beirut), I, 415; Ibn Daqīq al-‘Id, *al-Ilmām bi-aḥādīthi l-aḥkām*, ed. Muḥammad Sa‘īd al-Maulawī, Damascus, p. 91, no. 204; al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta‘āl*, pp. 49, 50; al-Yūsufī, *Zād al-muslim*, V, 65; al-‘Aynī, *‘Umdat al-qārī*, IV, 119; Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, II, 415; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, V, 222, no. 7059; ‘Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, I, 384, no. 1500 (and see *ib.* no. 1502: the Prophet entered the mosque wearing shoes, prayed wearing shoes, and left the mosque wearing shoes); Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Maqqisī, *al-Muḥarrar fī l-ḥadīth*, ed. al-Mar‘ashī, Samāra and al-Dhahabī, Beirut 1405, I, 177, no. 208; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu‘jam al-kabīr*, XXII, 205, nos. 539-540; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VIII, 138-139, nos. 994, 999, 1001, 1002, 1006, 1011; ‘Umar b. Shabba, *Ta’rīkh al-madīna al-munawwara*, ed. Fahīm Muḥammad Shaltūt, Mecca 1399/1979, p. 40; al-Būṣīrī, *Miṣbāḥ al-zujāja*, I, 349. A remarkable report says, however, that Mālīk b. Anas forbade the governors to ascend the minbar of the Prophet [scil. in Medina] wearing shoes or boots [see ‘Abdallah b. Abī Zayd al-Qayrawānī, *al-Jāmi‘*, p. 140, sup.].
- 58 Maḥmūd Muḥammad Khaṭṭāb al-Subkī, *al-Manḥal al-‘adhb al-maurūd, sharḥ sunan al-imām abī dāwūd*, Cairo 1394, V, 41; Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, II, 416-417; and see ‘Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, I, 386, no. 1508, 387, nos. 1509, 1511; al-Jāḥiẓ, *al-Bayān wa-l-tabyīn*, III, 110.
- 59 ‘Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, I, 387, no. 1510; and see the tradition *idhā qumtum ilā l-ṣalāti fa-nta‘ilū*: Ibn ‘Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, VI, 2156, inf.; Ibn ‘Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī‘a al-marfū‘a ‘ani l-akḥbārī l-shanī‘ati l-maudū‘a*, II, 100; al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-‘itidāl*, III, 509, no. 7351.

his worship anew.⁶⁰ The reason for the injunction to pray while wearing one's shoes is given in a widely circulated utterance of the Prophet: "Act against the practice of the Jews, as they do not pray while wearing one's shoes or their boots" (*khālīfū l-yahūda, fa-innahum lā yuṣallūna fī ni'ālihim wa-lā fī khifāfihim*).⁶¹ Another tradition of the Prophet on this subject has a slightly different wording. It says: "Pray while wearing your shoes, and do not assimilate yourselves to the practice of Jews (*ṣallū fī ni'ālikum wa-lā tashabbahū bi-l-yahūd*)."⁶² Muslim scholars explained the Jewish practice of praying barefoot by the fact that Jews considered prayer while wearing shoes as signifying lack of respect and esteem (scil. for the sanctuary); furthermore, the Jews in their conduct followed Moses, who was ordered to take off his shoes in the holy valley of Ṭuvā, mentioned in the Qur'ān (Sūrat Tā-Hā, 13).⁶³

60 Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 376, no. 2449.

61 Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 42; al-Suyūṭī, *al-Durr*, III, 78; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 432; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, II, 54; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ighāthat al-lahfān*, I, 147; Ibn Ḥajar, *Fath al-bārī*, I, 415; al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, IV, 119; al-Daylamī, *Firdaus*, Ms. Chester Beatty 3037, fol. 75b; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 374, no. 2430; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, III, 431, no. 3879; al-Suyūṭī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, I, 505 penult.-506; Ibn 'Arāq, *Tanzīh al-sharī'a*, II, 101, no. 74; Ibn Qayyim, *Aḥkām*, p. 756; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 432, sup.; Ibn Taymiyya, *Iqtidā'*, p. 178; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-zam'ān ilā zawā'idi bni ḥibbān*, ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Razzāq Ḥamza, Cairo n.d., p. 107, no. 357; and see I. Goldziher, *Über jüdische Sitten*, p. 314.

62 See, e.g., al-Munāwī, *al-Fayḍ*, IV, 201, no. 5021; and see al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān al-i'tidāl*, IV, 457, no. 9835: . . . ṣallū fī l-ni'āl khālīfū l-yahūd transmitted by Shaddād b. Aus; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 374, no. 2431.

63 Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 45 inf.; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, IV, 201, no. 5021. And see the comments of al-Munāwī, *ib.*: the leather of Moses' shoes was from an impure beast, a donkey, and he was therefore ordered to take them off. In addition, he had to receive the blessing of the holy valley [*al-wādī al-muqaddas*] by touching its ground with his

The problem of the prayers of the believers while wearing their shoes caused a vivid discussion as to the ways of performing the ritual ablution, the *wuḍūʿ*. The verse enjoining the *wuḍūʿ*, [Sūrat al-māʿida, verse 6] was interpreted by some scholars as enjoining washing of the feet; others assumed that it imposed only the obligation to wipe the feet.⁶⁴ As for the prayer

feet. The Prophet stated that the conclusions drawn by the Jews and their practices were not sound [*ʿalā ḡhayri ṣiḡḡatin*], though the matter itself was true. (Cf. al-Zurqānī, *Sharḡ al-muwaḡḡa*, ed. Ibrāhīm ʿAṭwa ʿAwaḡ, Cairo 1382/1962, V, 281, 1.1 . . . *fa-qāla kaʿb: kānata min jildi ḡimārīn mayyītin, fa-ḡādhā sababu amriḡi bi-khalʿihā; fa-akhadha l-yahūdu minhu anna khalʿa l-naʿlayni fī l-ṡalati laysa bi-ṡaḡīḡ . . .*). These arguments are recorded in al-Qurṡubī's *Tafsīr* XI, 173; al-Qurṡubī mentions however other reasons for the commandment to take off the shoes: Moses was ordered to do so because of awe and respect for the holy place, Ṭuwā; like in the *ḡaram* of Mecca one had to enter the holy place of Ṭuwā barefoot. According to another interpretation the removal of his shoes by Moses denoted metaphorically the removal of thoughts on children and family from his heart.

⁶⁴ See e.g. al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, IX, 328, nos. 2720-2721; Muḡammad b. Aḡmad b. ʿAbd al-Hādī l-Maqdisī, *al-Muḡarrar fī l-ḡadīḡ*, I, 99, no. 37, 100, nos. 39, 41, 106, no. 52, 108, no. 60; al-Būṡrī, *Miṡbāḡu l-zujāja*, I, 183, no. 187. A significant utterance reported on the authority of Ibn ʿAbbās says that people objected to everything except washing [of feet], but he [i.e. Ibn ʿAbbās] did not find in the Qurʿān anything except wiping [of the feet]: *inna l-nāsa abau illā l-ḡusl, wa-lā aḡidu fī kitābi llāhi illā l-maṡḡa* (*ibidem*, no. 188); and see al-Shafiʿī, *Ikhtilāf al-ḡadīḡ*, ed. ʿĀmir Aḡmad ḡaydar, Beirut 1405/1985, pp. 169-171 [and see esp. the utterance of al-Shafiʿī, *ib.*, p. 170; and see the references of the editor]; and see the contradictory traditions: ʿAbd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṡannaḡ*, I, 18-28, nos. 53-82; al-Suyūṡī, *al-Durr al-manḡḡūr*, II, 262-263 [see the significant utterance attributed to Anas b. Mālik, *ibid.* p. 262: *nazala l-qurʿānu bi-l-maṡḡi, wa-l-sunnatu bi-l-ḡusli*]; al-Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr* [ed. Ṣḡakīr], X, 52-64, 74-80, nos. 11447-11536 [see the contradictory opinions pp. 58-59 and the harmonizing assumptions pp. 62-64; see the opinion of al-Ṭabarī pp. 74-80]; al-Bayḡaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, I, 67-77 [see p. 68 seq.: *bābu l-takrāri fī ḡusli l-riḡlayni, bābu l-dalīli ʿalā anna farḡa l-riḡlayni l-ḡuslu wa-anna maṡḡumā lā yajzī*; and see p. 74 about performing the washing of the feet while wearing shoes]; see Abū

of the believer wearing boots, he was absolved from washing his feet at every *wuḍū'* on condition that he had washed his feet before putting on his boots.⁶⁵

These traditions enjoining not to *assimilate themselves* seem to belong to a very early phase in the emergence of Islam, in which it was felt to be essential for the nascent Muslim community to establish distinctive features for its own religious rites and practices, so as to differentiate itself from all other religious communities.

There was however no full consensus among Muslim scholars in a later period as to prayer in shoes. Traditions recorded in very early collections of *ḥadīth* seem to indicate a certain amount of reservation. Ibn Jurayj (d. 150 A.H.) asked 'Aṭā whether a believer may pray while wearing shoes. 'Aṭā answered, "yes", and added that he had heard that the Prophet had prayed with his shoes on. "What is wrong with them (i.e. with shoes)? The Prophet also prayed while wearing boots", said 'Aṭā.⁶⁶ Ibn Jurayj's doubts as to whether or not prayer while wearing shoes is permissible are exposed in this tradition. Another report tells of Abū Hurayra's denial of the rumour that he did not allow people to pray with their shoes on. He asserted that he had seen the Prophet pray in shoes.⁶⁷ Uncertainty as to the manner of prayer is visible in a significant conversation between two of the Companions of the Prophet: Abū Mūsā al-Ash'arī and 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd. Abū Mūsā led the prayer

Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 449, no. 600: . . . *thumma akhadha bi-kaffayhi mina l-mā'i fa-ṣakka bihimā 'alā qadamayhi wa-fīhimā l-na'lu thumma qalabahā thumma 'alā l-ukhrā mithla dhālika; qultu: fī l-na'layni? qāla: fī l-na'layni, thalāthan.* See Ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, I, 83-87, nos. 161-168, 100-101, nos. 199-202.

65 See, e.g., al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, II, 334, nos. 2393-2394, and cf. *ib.*, IX, 288, no. 9238; and see al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, I, 292 ult.

66 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 384, no. 1501; cf. al-Kattānī, *Nazm al-muṣanāthir*, p. 99, no. 81.

67 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 385, no. 1504; al-Ṭaḥāwī, *Sharḥ ma'ānī l-āthār*, I, 511-512.

and took off his shoes before starting the prayer. 'Abdallah asked him, "Why did you take off your shoes; are you in the holy valley of Ṭuvā?"⁶⁸ The conflicting perceptions underlying this report are elucidated in a different version of this tradition: 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd came to Abū Mūsā al-Ash'arī. When the time of prayer arrived, Abū Mūsā urged his guest to lead the prayer, but 'Abdallah refused since Abū Mūsā was the host and the prayer was to be performed in his abode and in his *masjid*. Abū Mūsā agreed, and before he started the prayer he took off his shoes. Then 'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd asked him about the reason for his action enquiring ironically whether he thought he was in the holy valley of Ṭuvā. The final phrase of the tradition, seems to hold the clue for the understanding of Ibn Mas'ūd's question and for the desired conclusion: "We saw indeed the Prophet praying in boots and in shoes."⁶⁹ Taking off the shoes is obligatory in the Ka'ba or in a Holy Place, but the usual daily prayers should be performed wearing shoes.

Indeed, the Prophet prayed barefoot in the Ka'ba on the Day of the Conquest of Mecca.⁷⁰

'Abdallah b. Mas'ūd's remark seems to have been grounded on the widely circulated tradition according to which God singled out the Prophet and the Muslim community granting them the privilege to perform their prayers in every spot on earth. "God made the earth for me a mosque and [its dust a means of] purification", says the utterance of the Prophet.⁷¹

68 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, I, 386, no. 1507; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, IX, 292, no. 9261.

69 Al-Ṭahāwī, *Sharḥ ma'ānī l-āthār*, I, 511 inf.; and see al-Qurtubī, *Tafsīr*, XI, 173 inf.; al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, IX, 293, no. 9262.

70 See Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ẓam'ān*, p. 252, no. 1022: . . . ḥaḍartu raṣūla llāhi (s) yauma l-faṭhi wa-ṣallā fī l-ka'batī, fa-khala'a na'layhi fa-waḍa'ahā 'an yasārihi . . .

71 See, e.g., al-Bāḥī, *Sunan al-ṣāliḥīn*, Ms. Leiden Or. 506, fol. 44b.; al-Ṭabarī, *Tahdhīb al-āthār*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥammad Shākir, Cairo 1402/1982, I, 441; al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, IV, 8-10 [. . . ja'ala l-arḍa kullahā lī wa-li-ummatī ṭahūran wa-masjidan fa-aynamā adrakatī l-rajula min ummatī l-ṣalātu fa-'indahū masjiduhu wa-'indahū

Accordingly there was no reason to take off one's shoes at prayer.

Shoes had to be cleaned, of course, before prayer, and some of the sources include passages concerning the manner of cleaning one's shoes, especially as the Prophet and his Companions used to pray while wearing the same shoes in which they walked in the streets of Medina and in which they performed their bodily needs.⁷²

According to one tradition a peculiar incident brought about a fundamental change in the perception of prayer and its rules. The Prophet is said to have taken off his shoes one day during prayer, and the believers followed suit. After the prayer the Prophet explained that he had taken off his shoes because the angel Jibrīl had informed him that there was filth attached to his shoes.⁷³ Another noteworthy tradition relates that the Prophet took off his shoes during prayer only once and never repeated this again.⁷⁴ Another reason why the Prophet took off

ṭahūruhu; and see *ib.* several different versions]; al-Kattānī, *Naẓm al-mutanāthir*, pp. 79-80, no. 59 [see the different versions recorded by the author], and p. 207, no. 257; al-Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr*, XIX, 20; al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-zam'ān*, pp. 104-105, nos. 338-345; Ibn al-Athīr, *Jāmi' al-uṣūl*, VI, 312, no. 3668, 319, no. 3681; Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ighāthat al-lahfān min maṣāyidi l-shayṭān*, Cairo 1358/1939, I, 148-149; and cf. Y. Friedmann, "Finality of Prophethood in Early Islam," *JSAI*, VII [1986] 181, note 16.

72 See, e.g., Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 43; al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, V, 222 (see the commentary of the author on tradition no. 7059).

73 Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ighāthat al-lahfān*, I, 146 (it was the blood of a tick of a camel); al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 431; Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, II, 417; Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 40 inf.-41; al-Ṭahāwī, *Sharḥ ma'ānī l-āthār*, I, 511; Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, p. 2162; Ibrāhīm al-Shīrāzī, *al-Muhadhdhab fī fiqhī l-imām*, I, 70 sup.; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-zawā'id*, II, 55; al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, pp. 54-55; Sa'dī Ḥusayn 'Alī Jabr, *Fiqh al-imām abī ṭhaur*, Beirut 1403/1983, p. 200; al-Qurṭubī, *Tafsīr*, XI, 174; Ibn Sa'd, *Ṭabaqāt*, Beirut 1380/1960, I, 480 (. . . *anna fihimā qadharan au adhan . . .*); al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, X, 83, no. 9972. And see Ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, I, 374, no. 786, II, 107, no. 1017.

his shoes *after* prayer is given in a tradition in which it is stated that the Prophet once replaced a strap on his shoe that had been torn, by a new one; after the prayer the Prophet ordered that the torn strap be returned, explaining that he had been distracted during the prayer by the new strap.⁷⁵ Another tradition relating to this theme says that the Prophet was bored by his shoes and therefore took them off *during* prayer, followed by the believers.⁷⁶ The event at which the Prophet took off his shoes during prayer is linked in some traditions with the utterance of the Prophet enjoining the believers to clean their shoes at the gate of the mosque, to put them on and to wear them during the prayer.⁷⁷ It is surprising to read in the final passage of this story, recorded by 'Abd al-Razzāq and Ibn abī Shayba, that the Prophet took off his shoes and that the congregation followed suit and imitated his action. After the prayer the Prophet stated, "He who likes to pray in his shoes may do so, and he who likes to pray barefoot may do so."⁷⁸ Another report according to which the Prophet gave permission to pray either wearing shoes or barefoot records a different reason for this utterance of the Prophet: he just gave his feet a rest, and decided that he who wants to take off his shoes may take them off, he who wants to pray while wearing them may pray with his shoes on.⁷⁹ A tradition which confirms this last

Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 416, 11.2-4; Ibn Sa'd, *Ṭabaqāt*, I, 481.

75 'Abd al-Raḥīm al-'Irāqī and Abū Zur'a al-'Irāqī, *Ṭarḥ al-tathrīb fī sharḥi l-taqrīb*, Ḥalab n.d. II, 379; Ibn Sa'd, *Ṭabaqāt*, I, 481.

76 Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma'*, II, 55.

77 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 388, no. 1514; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 375, nos. 2443-2444; and cf. *ib.* nos. 2440, 2442; Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 191; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 402 inf., 403 sup.; al-Ḥārith al-Muḥāsibī, *Fahm al-ṣalāt*, ed. Muḥammad 'Uthmān al-Khasht, Cairo 1403/1983, p. 72; Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Mawārid al-ẓam'ān*, p. 107, no. 360.

78 Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 415, inf.; 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 387, no. 1513; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 376, no. 2446.

79 Al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 376, no. 2447.

point of view states indeed that the Prophet used to pray in either of the two manners, wearing shoes or barefoot.⁸⁰

The change in the perception of the practice of prayer is evident: the believers were granted permission to pray as they wished, either barefoot or wearing shoes. Accordingly the imperative verb *khālifū* had to be reinterpreted and was explicated as a word merely denoting permission.⁸¹ Al-Subkī is right in stating that this tradition turns the obligation to pray with one's shoes on into a free choice left to the believer; being shod while praying is put on a par with being barefoot.⁸² The utterance became widely circulated in the period following the death of the Prophet, when the Arab tribes went on their huge conquest expeditions. The very early mosques in the conquered territories differed widely from the simple mosque of the Prophet at Medina; prayer with shoes on was not appropriate to floors covered with tiles or slabs. Besides, the Jews in some of these territories, in contrast to the Jews in the Arab peninsula, may have prayed while they were wearing shoes. Consequently, Muslim scholars were compelled to make a re-evaluation of the traditions about the manner of prayer in a mosque: prayer while wearing one's shoes was stated to be a concession (*rukḥṣa*) reserved to the Prophet and his Companions. Shoes are admittedly an adornment of prayer, but treading on filthy ground (*mulāmasatu l-arḍi llatī takthuru fihā l-najāsāt*)

80 Nūr al-Dīn al-Haythamī, *Majma'*, II, 54, 56; al-Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-kubrā*, II, 431; Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, V, 1827; al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, p. 95; al-Ṭahāwī, *Sharḥ ma'ānī l-āthār*, I, 512; al-Yūsufī, *Zād al-muslim*, V, 66; al-Suyūfī, *Jam' al-jawāmi'*, II, 520; Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb al-maurūd*, V, 43; 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, I, 385, no. 1503, 387 no. 1512; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VIII, 139, no. 1000; Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, *Musnad* (ed. Shākir), X, 157, no. 6627, 188, no. 6660, 206, no. 1679; Ibn Sa'd, *Ṭabaqāt*, I, 480.

81 Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 43, 11.1-3: . . . *li-anna l-takhyīra wa-l-tafwīḍa ilā l-mashī'ati dalīlu l-ibāḥati . . .*

82 Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 43: . . . *wa-huwa min al-aḥādīthi l-ṣārīfati li-l-amri bi-l-ṣalāti fī l-na'li fī l-ḥadīthi l-sābiqi mina l-wujūbi ilā l-ibāḥa . . .*

depreciates the position of such a prayer, and the elimination of impurity and filth is of greater importance than adornment (scil. through wearing shoes) during prayer.⁸³

Some doubts were even cast on the soundness of the tradition *khālifū l-yahūd* in connection with the transmitter of the *hadīth*.⁸⁴

Only Ḥanbalī scholars continued to stick to the idea that prayer while wearing one's shoes is a *sunnī* practice.⁸⁵

The practice of prayer in the mosques without shoes became a common feature in the Islamic Empire; special chapters in the collections of *hadīth* and *fiqh* discuss at length the problem where to put the shoes for the duration of the prayer.⁸⁶ The clash between the early tradition, i.e. that the Prophet prayed while he was wearing his shoes, and the common practice of praying barefoot in mosques, is reflected in an utterance of al-Ḥasan [evidently al-Baṣrī], who wondered why none of the transmitters who reported that the Prophet had prayed without removing his shoes did not themselves pray while wearing shoes.⁸⁷ People in the mosques were not aware that the Prophet had prayed in shoes; the fact that some persons

83 Al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, III, 431 (See the commentary on no. 3879), V, 222 (See the commentary on no. 7059); Maḥmūd al-Subkī, *al-Manhal al-'adhb*, V, 43; al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, pp. 51, 88; Ibn Ḥajar, *Fath al-bārī*, I, 415; al-Yūsufī, *Zād al-muslim*, V, 64-66; al-'Aynī, *Umdat al-qārī*, IV, 119.

84 See al-Munāwī, *Fayḍ*, IV, 201 (See commentary on no. 5021); and see al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, IV, 457, no. 9835; al-Maghribī, *Fath al-muta'āl*, p. 89: . . . *warada fī kauni l-ṣalāti fī l-ni'āl mina l-zīna al-ma'mūri bi-akhdhihā fī l-āyati ḥadīthun qa'ifun jiddan auradahu ibn 'adiyy fī l-kāmil wa-ibn mardawayh fī tafsīrihi min ḥadīthi abī hurayra wa-l-'uqaylī min ḥadīthi anas . . .*

85 Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Ighāthat al-laḥfān*, I, 147-148.

86 See e.g. 'Abd al-Razzāq, *al-Muṣannaf*, I, 389, nos. 1518-1522; al-Muttaqī l-Hindī, *Kanz*, VII, 374, nos. 2434-2435.

87 Al-Jāhīz, *al-bayān wa-l-tabyīn*, III, 110: . . . *wa-kāna l-ḥasan yaqūlu: mā 'ajaba qauman yarwūna anna rasūla llāhi (ṣ) ṣallā fī na'layhi . . . thumma lā tarā aḥadan minhum yuṣallī munta'ilan.*

appeared in the mosques with their shoes on brought about rows and clashes in the mosques, and these culminated sometimes in the killing of those persons.⁸⁸

The attitude of the later Muslim scholars is reflected in a succinct response by the famous commentator of Muslim's *Ṣaḥīḥ*, al-Nawawī [d. 676 H]. He was asked whether it was a sound tradition [*ḥal ṣaḥḥa*] that the Prophet had prayed while wearing shoes, whether prayer with one's shoes on or prayer barefoot was preferable (*afḍal*), whether it was a sound tradition that the Prophet had taken off his shoes during prayer and that his action had been imitated by his Companions, that he had asked them why they had done it and disapproved of their deed, and then why he had disapproved of it. Al-Nawawī stated that both traditions [i.e. that he prayed wearing shoes and that he took off his shoes during prayer] were sound. Prayer barefoot is however preferable, says al-Nawawī, because the Prophet prayed barefoot more frequently than while wearing shoes; he merely prayed while shod in order to show that this manner of prayer is permissible. The Prophet took off his shoes when he was informed by Jibrīl that the shoes contained some filth (*adḥan*), which prevented him from praying. Finally the Prophet disapproved of taking off one's shoes, because he objected (*kariha*) to an action being performed during prayer, which need not to be carried out during ritual service.⁸⁹ It is noteworthy that al-Nawawī does not mention at all that there was an element of differentiation and exclusivity in the wearing of shoes during prayer; prayer with his shoes on was performed by the Prophet only in order to show that this manner of praying was permissible.

In summing up, it may be assumed that the common and widely followed practice of praying barefoot in the mosques was a result of the significant changes in the social and material conditions of life in the Muslim community: the sumptuous style

⁸⁸ See al-Maghribī, *Faṭḥ al-muta'āl*, p. 52; al-Yūsufī, *Zād al-muslim*, V, 65.

⁸⁹ Al-Nawawī, *al-Manthūrāt wa-'uyūnu l-masā'ili l-muḥimmāt*, ed. 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā, Cairo 1402-1982, p. 39, no. 60.

of building which characterized the congregational mosques, and the floors covered with carpets, called for the solemn prayers to be performed barefoot. In some areas of Arabia Jews may have continued to pray without shoes in their synagogues, but pious Muslim scholars did not object to a practice that was similar to that of some unbelievers in one place or another, provided that it was not contrary to the usages of Islam.⁹⁰

A peculiar opinion as to the utterance enjoining the believers to pray wearing shoes in contradistinction to the practice of the Jews who pray barefoot is expressed in a book by Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya. The reason for this injunction was, according to Ibn Qayyim, that the Prophet ordered the believers to deviate from the practices of the People of the Book and therefore enjoined them to pray with their shoes on. After the death of the Prophet 'Umar forbade the People of the Book to wear shoes of the kind worn by the Muslims.⁹¹

The difference between the injunction of the Prophet and the order of 'Umar⁹² is explained by Ibn Qayyim's scrutiny of the social and political situation at the time of the Prophet, and of the changes undergone by the Muslim community in the period of 'Umar. Shoes, says Ibn Qayyim, were not the wear of

90 Aḥmad b. Aḥmad al-Khalījī al-Shāfi'ī l-Khalwatī, *al-Wasm fī l-washm*, Cairo 1323, pp. 19-20: . . . *wa-ammā sulṭanu l-'ulamā'i al-'izzu bnu 'abdi l-salām, raḥimahu llāhu, fa-innahu ashāra ilā raddihi fī fatāwāhu idh qāla: l-murādu bi-l-a'ājimi lladhīna nuḥinā 'ani l-tashabbuḥi bihim atbā'u l-akāsiratī fī dhālika l-zamāni, wa-yakhtaṣṣu l-nahyu bimā yaf'alūnahu 'alā khilāfi muqtaḍā shar'inā; fa-ammā mā fa'alūhu 'alā wafqi l-ijābi au al-nadbi au al-ibāḥati fī shar'inā fa-lā yutrak li-ajli ta'ātīhim iyyāhu, fa-inna l-shar'a lā yanḥā 'ani l-tashabbuḥi bi-mā adhina llāhu fīhi . . .*

91 Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Aḥkām*, p. 748: . . . *wa-nahāhum 'umaru raḍiya llāhu 'anhu an yalbasū ni'āl al-muslimīn.*

92 Ibn Qayyim, *Aḥkām*, p. 755, 1.4: . . . *qāla: wa-fī kitāb 'umar: wa-lā yalbasūna l-na'layn, qāla: fa-yumna'u ahlu l-dhimma min lubsi jam'i l-ajnāsi mina l-ni'āl; wa-l-na'lani humā min ziyyi l-'arabi min ābādi l-dahri ilā yauminā ḥadhā . . .*

al-'ajam; they used to wear a kind of boot called *al-tamsak*,⁹³ and they should be forced to return to this peculiar wear. Furthermore, so says Ibn Qayyim, shoes are the wear of scholars, honourable persons (*ashrāf*) and distinguished men (*akābir*), and should consequently be reserved for their use alone.

One has to admit, says Ibn Qayyim, that the Jews of Medina and its surroundings indeed wore shoes, and that the prophet did not forbid them this practice. He merely enjoined the believers to act contrary to the Jewish habit of praying barefoot, and ordered them to pray while wearing shoes. Neither the Prophet nor Abū Bakr, sayd Ibn Qayyim, obliged the People of the Book to wear the *ghiyār*, the garments that were meant to differentiate them from the Muslim community, since the believers had still not overpowered the People of the Book, nor had they yet abased them or occupied their countries; the People of the Book were in control of the majority of these countries and the believers kept their status according to the agreements and peace pacts that had been concluded (. . . *li-anna l-muslimīna lam yakūnū qad istaulau 'alā ahli l-kitāb wa-qaharūhum wa-adhallūhum, wa-malakū bilādahum; bal kānat aktharu bilādihim lahum wa-hum fihā ahlu ṣulḥin wa-hudnatin*),⁹⁴ consequently, the only thing that could be done at that time was to order the believers to act differently from the practices of these people. But when God granted the Muslim community victory and gave them the lands and possessions of the conquered peoples, and when the believers could impose upon them the law of Islam, 'Umar ordered the People of the Book to wear the *ghiyār*, and all the Companions gave their consent to the injunctions of 'Umar.⁹⁵ It is thus evident that

93 The word was evidently miscopied by the scribe and misread by the editor. The correct reading seems to be *al-shamushak*. Prayer while wearing *arab shoes* was preferred; prayer while wearing *shamushak* boots was forbidden. (See al-Ṭūsī, *al-Nihāya fī mujarradi l-fiqh*, p. 98; al-Bahrānī, *al-Ḥadā'iq al-nādira*, VII, 114-115).

94 Ibn Qayyim, *Aḥkām*, p. 755, inf.

95 Ibn Qayyim, *Aḥkām*, p. 756.

'Umar's order concerning the shoes of the People of the Book was in accordance with the injunction of the Prophet, and consistent with the new circumstances of the Muslim strength and power.

The shoes of the Prophet remained an object of veneration among the common people and especially among the pious believers. A single shoe of the Prophet was preserved for centuries and kept with great care and reverence. Finally it came into the possession of al-Malik al-Ashraf (Qait Bay), who built a special room for it at the side of the *minbar* in the *madrassa al-ashrafiyya*. The single shoe was placed under a copula covered with silk curtains; the room was sumptuously decorated and the visiting crowds kissed the heavily scented shoe. The shoe also had miraculous powers of healing. Pious ascetics and mystics composed verses in praise of the shoe. A special keeper was hired and was given a pay of eighty dirhams per month. He was enjoined to open the room for the visiting crowds every Monday and Thursday.⁹⁶

The transformation of Muslim practice from the wearing of shoes at prayer to taking them off provides a fascinating example of the manner in which customs initially frowned upon as an imitation of unbelievers, were gradually adopted as the only correct form of behaviour.

96 Al-Maghribi, *Fath al-muta'āl*, pp. 355-359.

ADDENDA

ad note 1: A significant *fatwā* of Ibn Taymiyya touches upon the sensitive question of Jews and Christians who secretly believe in Islam, and of Muslims who outwardly show belief, but in reality are hypocrites hiding Jewish, Christian or apostatic beliefs. Some people claim that the angels remove from their graves the bodies of the Jews and Christians who secretly believed in Islam and place them in the graves of Muslims, and in contrast remove the bodies of the unbelieving Muslims from their graves and place them in the graves of Jews and Christians. Ibn Taymiyya had no knowledge of such a tradition. He states, however, that the Jews and Christians who secretly believed in Islam before the time of their agony did not declare their belief in Islam at their death will be gathered on the Day of Resurrection with the Muslims, while the unbelieving Muslims will be gathered with the unbelievers, their equals. [Ibn Taymiyya, *al-Fatāwā l-kubrā*, Beirut, n. d. I, 369, no. 224].

ad note 6: See al-‘Iṣāmī, *Simṭ al-nujūmi l-‘awālī fī anbā’i l-awā’il wa-l-tawālī*, Cairo 1380, I, 411.

ad note 7: See this tradition in al-Ṭabarī, *Tahdhīb al-āthār wa-taḥṣīl al-thābiti ‘an rasūli llāhi [ṣallā llāhu ‘alayhi wa-sallam] mina l-akhbār*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥammad Shākīr, Cairo 1982, IV, 111-112, nos. 180-183. [And cf. *ib.* no. 184. And see the assessment of this tradition *ib.* pp. 112-113].

ad note 9: According to a report recorded in al-Muttaqī l-Hindī’s *Kanz al-‘ummāl*, VIII, 127, no. 906 the believers avoided performing prayers in churches adorned with statues.

ad note 12: And see Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Tuḥfat al-maudūd bi-aḥkāmī l-maulūd*, Beirut n. d., pp. 143-145.

ad note 18: See al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-kabīr*, X, 319, no. 10609.

ad note 19: See Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, ed. Mukhtār Aḥmad al-Nadwī, Bombay 1401/1981, VIII, 443, no. 5816: . . . *'an ibni 'abbāsin, qāla: man sallama 'alaykum min khalqī llāhi fa-ruddū 'alayhim wa-in kāna yahūdiyyan au naṣrāniyyan au majūsiyyan; ibid.* VIII, 438-440. nos. 5799-5805. [And see the reference of the editor]; Muḥammad Murtaḍā al-Zabīdī, *al-'Uqūdu l-munīfa*, II, 151, inf. - 152.

ad note 21: See al-Fasawī, *al-Ma'riḥa wa-l-ta'rīkh*, II, 491; Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, VIII, 442-444, nos. 5810-5819 [And see the references of the editor]; Muḥammad Muraḍa al-Zabīdī, *'Uqūdu l-jawāhiri l-munīfa*, II, 151.

ad note 22: See al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān al-i'tidāl*, I, 598, no. 2262; al-Zabīdī, *al-'Uqūd al-munīfa*, II, 151.

ad note 26: See Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, VIII, 468, no. 5919 [And see the note of the editor].

ad note 30: See Abū Ya'lā, *Musnad*, I, 231, no. 266: . . . *inna rasūla llāhi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam kāna yuḥibbu an yatashabbaha bi-aḥli l-kitābi fīmā lam yanzil 'alayhi shay'un fa-idhā unzila 'alayhi tarakahu.* [And see the references of the editor]; and see Ibn Abī Shayba, *al-Muṣannaḥ*, VIII, 261, no. 5127: . . . *kāna aḥlu l-kitābi yasdilūna ash'ārahum . . . wa-kāna rasūlu llāhi ṣallā llāhu 'alayhi wa-sallam yuḥibbu muwāfaqata aḥli l-kitābi fīmā lam yu'mar bihi; qāla: fa-sadala rasūlu llāhi [ṣ] nāṣiyatan [perhaps: nāṣiyatahu] thumma farraqa ba'du.*

ad note 35: See e. g. Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Hidāyat al-ḥayārā fī ajwibati l-yahūdi wa-l-naṣārā*, Beirut, n. d., p. 79: . . . *fa-inna lafza l-taurāti wa-l-injīli wa-l-qur'āni wa-l-zabūri yurādu bihi l-kutubu l-mu'ayyana tāratān, wa-yurādu bihi l-jinsu tāratān; fa-yu'abbaru bi-lafzi l-qur'āni 'ani l-zabūr wa-bi-lafzi l-taurāti 'ani l-qur'ān wa-bi-lafzi l-injīli 'ani l-qur'āni aydan.*

wa-fī l-ḥadīthi l-ṣahīhi 'ani l-nabiyyi [ṣ] khuffifa 'alā dā'uda l-qur'ānu fa-kāna mā bayna an tusraja dābbatuhu ilā an yarkabahā yaqra'u l-qur'āna, fa-l-murādu bihi qur'ānuhu wa-huwa l-zabūru . . .

ad note 37: See e. g. al-Suyūṭī, *al-Hāwī li-l-fatāwī*, I, 463 inf.-464 [*qi'datu l-yahūd*].

ad note 41: See Yaḥyā b. Ma'in, *al-Ta'rīkh*, ed. Aḥmad Muḥammad Nūr Sayf, Makka al-mukarrama 1979, IV, 231, no. 4102: . . . *kāna ibnu mas'ūdin yarfa'u yadayhi fī l-qunūti ilā thadyayhi*; and see *op. cit.* III, 464, no. 2284: . . . *qultu li-yaḥyā: mā taqūlu fī l-takbīr fī l-'īdayn . . . qāla: arā an arfa'a yadayya fī kulli takbīratin . . .* [and see the comments of the editor]; and see *op. cit.* p. 467, no. 2293 the opinion of Abū 'Ubayd al-Qāsim b. Sallām. And see Abū Shāma, *al-Bā'ith 'alā inkāri l-bida'i wa-l-ḥawādith*, ed. 'Uthmān Aḥmad 'Anbar, Cairo 1398/1978, p. 87: . . . *fa-mina l-bida'i . . . wa-ammā raf'u aydihim 'inda l-du'ā'i fa-bid'atun qadīmatun*; and see *ib. inf.*: 'Abd al-Malik about the *bid'a* of raising the hands on the *minbar* on Friday; Ibn Hibbān al-Bustī, *al-Majrūḥīn*, II, 270: . . . *ṣallaytu khalfā rasūli llāhi [ṣ] wa-abī bakrin wa-'umara fa-kānū yarfa'ūna aydiyahum fī awwali l-ṣalāti thumma lā ya'ūdūna*. And see Ibn 'Adiyy, *al-Kāmil*, VI, 2162: the tradition with a slightly different variant: . . . *fa-lam yarfa'ū aydiyahum illā 'inda stiṭāḥi l-ṣalāti*. And see al-Dhahabī, *Mizān al-i'tidāl*, I, 208, no. 817: . . . *'an muqātil 'ani l-aṣbagh b. nubāta 'an 'aliyyin: lammā nazalat 'fa-ṣalli li-rabbika wa-nḥar' qāla: yā jibrīl mā ḥadhīhi l-naḥīra? qāla: ya'muruka rabbuka idhā taḥarramta li-l-ṣalāti an tarfa'a yadayka idhā kabbarta wa-idhā raka'ta wa-idhā rafa'ta mina l-rukū' . . .*; and see the list of the sources of the tradition about raising the hands: al-Suyūṭī, *Kitābu l-azhāri l-mutanāthira fī l-akḥbāri l-mutawātira*, MS Hebrew Univ., Coll. Yahudah Ar. 773, fol. 5a. And see recently M. I. Fierro, "La Polemique a propos de *raf' al-yadayn fī l-ṣalāt* dans al-Andalus", *Studia Islamica*, 1987, pp. 69-90.

ad note 47: And see al- Nazwī, *al-Muṣannaf*, II, 70: . . . *umirtu bi-l-'imāma wa-l-na'layni wa-l-khātam*.

ad note 55: And see al-Haythamī, *al-Maqṣid al-'aliyy fī zawā'id abī ya'lā l-mausiliyy*, ed. Nāyif b. Hāshim al-Da'īs, Judda 1402/1982. p. 370, no. 335.

ad note 57: And see Ibn Khuzayma, *Ṣaḥīḥ*, II, 105, no. 1010; al-Haythamī, *al-Maqṣid al-'aliyy*, p. 370. no. 336.

ad note 61: And see al-Dhahabī, *Mīzān al-'itidāl*, I, 375, no. 1406: . . . *inna l-yahūda idhā ṣallau khala'ū ni'ālahum, fa-idhā ṣallaytum fa-htadhū ni'ālakum*.

ad note 71: On the permission to pray in every place: see Ibn Qayyim al-Jauziyya, *Hidāyatu l-ḥayārā*, pp. 77, l. 2, 84, 91, penult.; al-Majlisī, *Bihār al-anwār*, XVI, 313, 316.

ad note 72: See Murtaḍā l-Zabīdī, *Ithāf al-sādati l-muttaqīn bi-sharḥ asrār ihyā'i 'ulūmi l-dīn*, Beirut n. d. [reprint] III, 307 inf.; and see *op. cit.* other traditions about praying with one's shoes on discussed in a lengthy chapter, *op. cit.* pp. 307-309.

Appendix
by
Menahem Kister

In the preceding article *Lā tashabbahū* "Do not assimilate yourselves . . ."; (hereafter "LT"), numerous traditions are cited, according to which Muslims were forbidden to follow Jewish customs, so as to keep the two communities separate and their religions distinct. Other statements, worded in a manner relatively similar to those of the previous traditions, were apparently intended to censure certain customs practiced by adherents of the Muslim faith, by accusing these Muslims of following the undesirable practices of the Jews (e.g., regarding prayer). Despite the considerable similarity in formulation between these sets of statements, it appears that they are in fact different as far as Islām is concerned, they reflect two distinct trends.

The first trend evidences a clear desire on the part of early Islām for self-definition, as well as a concern over the presence of Jewish influences and practices among its earliest believers. It should be recalled that Islām developed in the shadow of Judaism, among Arabs who maintained extremely close relations with Jews and their religion (especially the *Anṣār*).¹ Particularly noteworthy in this connection is the *Hadīth*² regarding Muḥammad's habit of likening himself to *ahl al-kitāb*, before he was commanded to act otherwise. The concept of 'ilm³ (knowledge) is also relevant in this connection:

-
- 1 On the influence of the *Anṣār* regarding the introduction of Jewish customs into Islam, see: M.J. and Menahem Kister, "On the Jews of Arabia--Notes" [Hebrew], *Tarbiz* 48 (1979), pp. 240, 240 ff.
 - 2 Cited by I. Goldziher, "Usages Juifs," *REJ* 28 (1894), p. 89.
 - 3 This concept in the Qur'ān was discussed by F. Rosenthal, *Knowledge Triumphant*, Leiden 1970, pp. 19-35. However, it seems that Rosenthal paid insufficient attention to the aspect discussed below. Thus, it would appear that the development of the concept 'ilm in the *Jāhiliyya* and

one of the principal factors which led the Arabs in the *Jāhiliyya* to adopt some of the customs followed by their Jewish neighbours was their awareness of the Jews' (and Christians'?) observance of an obligatory and absolute religious praxis, which was deemed desirable by God.⁴ Only gradually did Moḥammed and Islām come to regard their *'ilm* as being superior to that of the Jews. Noteworthy is *Sūra* 2, 144 (regarding the change of the *qibla* to Jerusalem): "If after all the knowlege (*'ilm*) you have been given you yield to their desires (*'ahwā'ahum*), then you will surely become an evildoer."⁵ We know that the *Anṣār* used to pray facing Jerusalem even before Moḥammed arrived in Medīna,⁶

the relevant material in the Qur'ān still require extensive discussion by an expert.

- 4 Cf. the epithet *'ālim*, i.e., "individual learned in the law", applied to Jewish sages in ancient Arabia. For the concept of *'ilm* - suffice it to cite two traditions: "This tribe of the *Anṣār* - idolators - was together with the tribe of the Jews - people of the book - and they saw that [the Jews] were superior to them in knowledge (*faḍlan 'alayhim fi l-'ilm*), and they followed many of [the Jews'] customs. The men of the book would only have normal sexual relations with women . . . and the *Anṣār* followed this practice of theirs" (*al-Durr al-Manthūr*, Vol. 2, Cairo 1314 AH, p. 263, and his sources); "It happened that the Prophet reached the Qubā' mosque and said: Allah praised you because of your purity with regard to your mosque. What is this purity with which you purify yourselves? They said to him, 'Apostle of God, we do not know anything (*naḥnu la na'lamu shay'an*), but we had Jewish neighbours, and they were accustomed to wash their posteriors from excrement, and we washed the way they did'" (al-Haythamī, *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, I, Beirut 1967, p. 212). These two traditions (cited and discussed in the article mentioned in n. 1, pp. 237, 240) appear to be complementary; from them we may infer that the *Anṣār* adopted numerous Jewish customs regarding everyday life and marital relations.
- 5 As opposed to the *Anṣār's* feelings that "the Jews are superior to them in knowledge," and that "they know absolutely nothing."
- 6 See: Ṭabarī, *Tafsīr* II, Ed. Maḥmūd & Aḥmad Shākir, Cairo n.d., p. 529, no. 1837 (1838); Muqātil, *Tafsīr*, ed. 'Abdallāh Maḥmūd Shaḥāta, Cairo 1969, p. 72; 'Umar b. Shabba, *Ta'rīkh al-Madīna*, ed. Fahīm Muḥammad Shaltūt, n.p., 1979, p. 51. I would like to thank my father, Prof. M.J. Kister, for providing me with these references.

and it is possible that the conception of the *'ilm* was partially responsible for this. After Islām became an independent religion, it had to struggle in order to establish its uniqueness.

The second trend manifests itself in Islām after it became an established religion, self-confident and certain of the impropriety of the Jewish customs. It was precisely this self-confidence which enabled it to censure undesirable Muslim practices as Jewish customs. For example, improper conduct in mosques, and the slightest swaying during prayer, was unquestionably not an imitation of Jewish practice, but rather a form of corruption which could be compared to the corruption of the Jews in their prayers.

However, as far as the evidence of the statements cited above regarding ancient Jewish custom is concerned, both categories of statements cited in the preceding article have considerable value. I shall now comment briefly on these statements from the perspective of Jewish sources.

We shall begin by discussing and surveying the development of the Jewish law (*halakhah*), with regard to the wearing of shoes during prayer; thereafter we shall make a number of brief comments on some of the other customs cited in the article. In the Muslim testimonia cited above, we have clear evidence of a Jewish custom (apparently followed by the Jews of Arabia) to pray barefoot in their synagogues. What is known regarding this practice from the Jewish legal sources?⁷

According to the *halakhah*, the priests who served in the

7 See J. Reifmann, "Walking Barefoot" [Hebrew], *Beit Talmud* 1 (1871), pp. 78-80. Reifmann discusses a considerable number of the sources cited below. Likewise, a considerable number of the sources cited here have been discussed by the classical codifiers of Jewish law; however, there is still room for additional discussion of these passages as far as the approach to analyzing them is concerned. (I am indebted to Dr. David Rosenthal for drawing my attention to Reifmann's article.) On the existence of a generally positive attitude to wearing shoes, see *ibid.*, p. 78. Cf. also *Talmud Bavli, Berakhot* 62b, according to MSS: "Just as wearing shoes is respectful . . ." See also R.N.N. Rabbinowicz, *Diqdque Soferim, Berakhot*, Munich 1867, p. 365, note ז.

Temple were forbidden to wear shoes. Even someone who merely entered the Temple Mount was required to remove his shoes (*Mishnah Berakhot* 9:5). The issue of what practices were followed in synagogues in Palestine and Babylonia is somewhat more complicated. From the *Mishnah*, it seems that it was customary to pray wearing shoes. *Mishnah Megillah* 4:8 states: "One who says: I shall not serve as a reader of the prayers [literally: "pass before the ark"] in colored clothing may not read the prayers even in white clothing; [one who says] I shall not read the prayers wearing shoes may not read the prayers even barefoot." This statement appears in the midst of a series of laws regarding heterodox prayer customs. Thus, one may infer that there were heterodox Jews who insisted on leading the congregation in prayer (and perhaps entering the synagogue in general) only while wearing white clothing and walking barefoot. It has been conjectured that these Jews sought to model the customs of the synagogue after the practices followed in the Temple.⁸ However, there is no solid evidence for this assumption. Be that as it may, according to Jewish law and custom in Palestine during the Tannaitic period, there was no obligation to remove one's shoes during prayer, and removal of shoes for prayer was in fact opposed. The same impression is conveyed by the *Baraita* discussing Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai's decree that "the priests are not permitted to wear their sandals while walking up to the platform [in order to recite the priestly benediction]" (*Talmud Bavli Rosh Ha-Shanah* 31b = *Sotah* 40a). From this *Baraita*, one of the Talmudic commentators inferred⁹ that "it is permissible to enter a synagogue wearing sandals; wearing sandals was only prohibited to [the priests] ascending their platform."¹⁰ These are all the

8 See *Mishnah* with the commentary of Ch. Albeck, Jerusalem/Tel Aviv 1952, p. 504 and elsewhere.

9 Rabbenu Hananel, cited by *Tosafot* on *Sotah*, *ibid.*, s.v. נשוא.

10 Reifmann (above, n. 7), attempts to weaken this proof, by claiming that this *Baraita* refers to recitation of the priestly benediction in a place not used on a regular basis for prayer. However, this interpretation

extant sources regarding the Jewish laws and customs regarding the wearing of shoes during prayers in the Tannaitic period [until the end of the second century C.E.] in Palestine.

It was also customary to wear shoes during prayer in the Amoraic period in Babylonia. Regarding the Mishnah cited above ("One must not enter the Temple Mount with his staff, shoes, money-belt, or the dirt on his feet, nor may [the Temple Mount] be used as a shortcut, and *a minori ad mains*, spitting [is prohibited there"]¹¹) it was stated by the Amora Rava (IV century C.E.): "Spitting is permissible in a synagogue, by analogy to [the law concerning] shoes: Just as shoes are prohibited on the Temple Mount and permissible in the synagogue, so too spitting is prohibited on the Temple Mount, but permissible in the synagogue" (*Talmud Bavli, Berakhot* 62b). From here we see that according to Rava, it was obvious that wearing shoes in the synagogue was permissible (cf. also Rava's statement in *Berakhot* 63a), and it would appear that the same holds true regarding Rav Pappa and the anonymous Talmudic discussion (*ibid.*). Indeed the *Talmud* reports that Rav Kahana used to put on his shoes (*puzmeqe*) before praying (*Talmud Bavli, Shabbat* 10a). As the *Tosafot* state, "From here it may be inferred that one should not pray barefoot."¹¹ To the best of our knowledge, then, in Babylonia the Jews prayed wearing shoes.¹²

Very little is known about the *halakhah* regarding prayer

seems rather forced.

- 11 *Tosafot Shabbat* 10a, s.v. רמי פוזמקי. The meaning of the Aramaic idiom *rame puzmeqe* is clear from *Talmud Bavli, Yoma* 78a; *Ketubot* 65b; *Ta'anit* 22a. Therefore the interpretation cited briefly by R. Abraham Maimonides (*Kitāb Kifāyat al-'Ābidīn*, ed. N. Dana, Ramat Gan 1989, p. 103), that the meaning of these words is 'to remove one's shoes' (*qīla yanza'uha*) is probably influenced by current customs of prayer in the east.
- 12 J. Kafih, *Halikhot Teman* (Yemenite Customs) [Hebrew], Jerusalem 1978, p. 64, n. 3, cites the Talmudic statement in *Mo'ed Qatan* 17a regarding "that dog which ate the shoelaces of the rabbis" in connection with removing shoes before entering the synagogues. However, there is no evidence that this passage refers to synagogues.

with shod feet during the Amoraic period in Palestine. Only one allusion to the matter is extant, and it is found in an anecdote appearing in an obscure context in the Jerusalem Talmud:¹³ "Yehudah the son of Rabbi Hiyya [third century C.E.] entered a synagogue; he left his shoes, and they were lost.¹⁴ He said, Had I not gone to the synagogue, my shoes would not have been lost" (*Yerushalmi Bava Metzia* 2:8, 8c). *Prima facie*, it would appear from this passage, as a number of commentators maintain,¹⁵ that Jews in Palestine in the Amoraic period used to remove their shoes before entering the synagogue,¹⁶ (the situation was definitely different in Palestine during the Tannaitic period, as we have already noted). In light of the statements cited previously in the name of Babylonian Sages, Reifmann inferred that there was a dispute between the Babylonian and Palestinian scholars regarding the laws of prayer while wearing shoes.¹⁷ Were this conclusion certain, we could deduce that the practice of the Jews (ostensibly the Jews of Arabia) mentioned in the *hadīth* was a Palestinian custom. This practice would then join a series of instances in which we find a connection between the observances of the Jews of Arabia and Palestinian customs.¹⁸ However, while the interpretation of the *Yerushalmi* suggested above seems very plausible, it should be recalled that the *Yerushalmi* here presents us with an anecdote, whose point is not fully clear, rather than an explicit legal assertion regarding the laws of prayer with regard to shoes. Hence, extreme caution

13 But see Pene Moshe's commentary, *ad loc.*, and S. Lieberman, *Yerushalmi Nezikin*, ed. E.S. Rosenthal and S. Lieberman, Jerusalem 1984, p. 138, on lines 37-38.

14 Ms. Escorial (ed. Rosenthal-Lieberman [above, n. 13], p. 50) reads here: "his shoes were lost" (not: "he left his shoes and they were lost" as in Ms. Leiden).

15 See R. Ishtori Ha-Parhi, *Kaftor Va-Ferah*, ch. 7, and Rabbi J.S. Nathanson, *Ziyyon Yerushalayim*, *ad loc.*

16 Similar customs in Greek and Roman worship. See Th. Wächter, *Reinheitsvorschriften im Griechischen Kult*, Giessen 1910, pp. 23-24.

17 *Ibid.* (above, n. 7).

18 *Ibid.* (above, n. 1), p. 236 ff.

should be employed before drawing far-reaching conclusions from such material. Moreover, it is possible that different customs obtained in different communities in Babylonia and Palestine. In any case, it is noteworthy that in Palestinian halakhic literature from the Geonic period, we read the "the skins of an unclean animal may be used to make [. . . sandals for entering synagogues."¹⁹ Thus, this source attests, *en passant*, that during the Geonic period the Jews of Palestine used to wear shoes in the synagogue.

The internal dynamic which one expects to find in Judaism calls for equating the laws of the synagogue with those of the Temple. Likewise, it may be expected that rites indicating respect for the synagogue should parallel the practices used to demonstrate respect towards persons of high status. (Additional support for this thesis might have been provided by Ex. 3:5 and Josh. 5:15, although early rabbinic sources do not cite these passages with regard to synagogue practice). Such arguments are expressed clearly and at length in a late Palestinian prayerbook: "[And if] one had a shoe or a sandal on his feet, he should remove them o[utside], and en[t]ler barefoot, for servants ordinarily walk barefoot before their mas[te]rs . . .] above, as was the case with Moses and Joshua. For they were told: 'Remove your [s]hoe[s]' (?) . . . for no one enters their presence wearing sandals. And if this is the practice before (human beings, who are created from a) putrid drop, so much the more so before the King of Kings, blessed be He. And so the Sages said: One should not enter the Temple Mount with his

19 S. Assaf, *Teshuvot Ha-Ge'onim* כ"ש ת (5702) (Responsa of the Ge'onim) [Hebrew], Jerusalem 1942, p. 124. (I am indebted to Professor I. Ta-Shema for drawing to my attention this reference). In his notes, Assaf cites the parallel versions of this tradition: "Any tanned leather from an unclean animal may be used for sandals"; "any leather from an unclean animal, after being tanned may be used for sandals." It would appear, then that the leather must be tanned, in accordance with the Muslim law that only tanned leather may be used, especially for prayer (see below, n. 27). See also below.

staff and shoes. And if, because of our sins, we do not have the Temple Mount (in our possession), we still have a minor sanctuary [viz., the synagogue—M.K.], and we must treat it with sanctity and reverence, as it is written, 'You shall revere my holy place.' Therefore, the ancients ordained that lavers with fresh water (should be provided) in the courtyards of all synagogues for the ablution of the hands and feet. And if one was weak or ill, and (hence) unable to remove his shoes, and he was walking cautiously, we need not trouble him to remove his shoes" (*seil*. to keep his shoes clean). It is quite possible that the *halakhah* of this passage (whose precise dating and circle of origin are uncertain) was influenced by the Muslim practice of removing shoes and washing the hands and feet; extensive Muslim influences can be detected in this prayerbook, as already noted by Wieder.²⁰

It is possible that the first indications of the argument that the synagogue should be compared to the Temple may be found in the heterodox practice cited in *Mishnah Megillah* (above). Comparison of the synagogue to the Temple is found, *inter alia*, in the writings of the Karaite Anan (eighth century).²¹ Apparently it was for this reason that Anan required worshippers to pray without wearing shoes.²² Similarly, the Karaite Qirqisānī (second half of the tenth century), who rejects Anan's basic conception of the nature of the synagogue, also

20 Passages from this prayer book were cited by N. Wieder in his important article: "Muslim Influences on Jewish Worship" [Hebrew], *Melilah* 2 (1946), pp. 42, 87-91, 105, 109. Wieder associated this material with the pietistic movement of Rabbi Abraham Maimonides (but see below, n. 29a). The entire text of this prayer book was published by M. Margaliot, *Hilkhot Erez Yisrael Min Ha-Genizah* (Palestinian Halakhot from the Genizah) [Hebrew] Jerusalem 1974, p. 127 ff. Margaliot, in his brief introduction, rejects Wieder's assumption.

21 Anan, *Sefer Ha-Mizvot*, ed. A.E. Harkavy, St. Petersburg 1903, pp. 33-37.

22 So it would appear from Ya'qūb al-Qirqisānī, *Kitāb al-Anwār wal-Marāqib*, III, ed. L. Nemoy, New York 1941, p. 622. It is possible that the argument from the Tent of Congregation and the service in the sanctuary cited by Qirqisānī reflects Anan's argumentation.

rules that people must pray barefoot. From Qirqisānī it would appear that this was the prevalent practice in his day (among Karaites, and perhaps not only among Karaites).²³ Perhaps it may be inferred from Qirqisānī's remarks that this matter was the subject of a Karaite-Rabbanite polemic (see below).

Qirqisānī cites, *inter alia*, the verses regarding Moses and Joshua, who were both ordered: "Remove your shoes from your feet" before entering a holy place (Ex. 3:5; Josh. 5:15). Qirqisānī states: "It is inconceivable that the shoes worn by . . . these two prophets . . . happened to be made from the [skins] of an unclean animal, as the Rabbanites claim. Rather, God commanded them to guard the [sanctity of the] holy places by not wearing shoes."²⁴ It is particularly noteworthy that the claim cited by Qirqisānī in the name of the Rabbanites is extremely widespread already in the early Muslim commentaries on the Qur'ān and in *ḥadīth* literature; Muslim authors used the very same tradition, about Moses wearing shoes made from the skins of unclean animals, as an argument against the Jewish practice of praying barefoot in imitation of Moses' conduct. (see *LT*, n. 63)! Thus, one may wonder whether the Muslim tradition

23 *Ibid.*: "wa-l-dalīl 'alā dhālika bayyinun zāhirun min ijmā'i l-khalqī mina l-ummati 'ala taḥrīmi l-ṣalāti 'alā l-ṭamiyy lam yukhālif fī dhālika wāḥidun minhum, wa-innamā ra'at al-jamā'atu l-ṣalāta ba'da l-ghusli bi-l-ghadāt . . . wa-mithlu dhālika fīmā 'italla bihi min amri l-na'li wa-l-khuff . . ."

24 *Ibid.*, p. 635: "wa-yajibu an takūna l-ṣalātu 'alā l-arḍi min ghayri an yakūna bayna l-qadami wa-bayna jismi l-arḍi shay'un mina l-ajsāmi lā bisāṭun wa-lā mā shabihahu wa-lā shay'un mina l-ḥidhā'i wa-lā khuffun wa-lā na'lun wa-lā mā kāna naẓīran li-dhālika; wa-hādhā ayḍan yuta'allamu min mauḍi'ayni: aḥaduhumā mā amara llāhu 'azza wa-jalla bihi mūsā 'alayhi l-salāmu wa-yehoshu'a (Heb.) min khal'i l-ḥidhā'i fī mawāḍi'i l-quḍsi; wa-muḥāl an yakūna dhālika l-ḥidhā'u lladhī kāna 'alā dhaynika l-waliyyayni l-khayrayni l-fāḍilayni l-nabiyyayn ittafaqā libāsuhumā jamī'an min ḥayawān ṭamiyy 'alā mā idda'ā l-rabbāniyyūn, wa-innamā amarahumā llāhu 'azza wa-jalla bi-ṣiyānati l-aqdās min lubsi l-ḥidhā' . . ."

here did draw upon an ancient Jewish tradition,²⁵ or did the Jews in fact draw upon this Muslim tradition. To be sure, we have no evidence in the Jewish *halakhah* that it was prohibited to enter a holy place wearing shoes made from the leather of unclean animals, but in light of the fact that the Palestinian halakhic passage cited above goes out of its way to affirm that this is permitted,²⁶ it would appear that there were Jews who forbade it (or abstained from it). In Muslim religious law, this prohibition occupies a far more central position.²⁷ However, whatever the source of this tradition may be, it is a striking example for a link between the polemical traditions of the two religions. It seems reasonable to assume that the contentions of the "Rabbanites" cited here owe their existence not merely to study of the verses in Exodus and Joshua, but rather were part of a polemic against the Karaite practice based on these verses. However, in addition to the arguments raised by the two sides,

25 Al-Qurṭubī cites a different reason for rejecting the ruling concerning the removing of shoes, namely, that the words "Remove your shoes from your feet" should be interpreted allegorically: Moses must remove from his heart all thoughts about his wife and children (*min 'amri l-ahl wa-l-wuld*, see *LT*, n. 63). A similar claim is cited in the name of "some authorities" by Theodoretus (fifth century C.E.), *Quaestiones*, PG 80, ad loc.; Moses was told to take off his sandals "so as to dispose of his concern about sustenance (*biḍtikàs mērimnas*), for the leather of the sandals is dead skin." This argument reminds us of the comments found in the *Zohar*, whose author flourished in Spain a generation after al-Qurṭubī (see *Zohar*, III, 148a Cf. also: R. Baḥya 6. Asher, *Commentary on the Torah*, ad. Ex 3:15); there, this verse is interpreted as an injunction that Moses abstain from sexual relations (and see: L. Ginzberg, *Legends of the Jews* V, Philadelphia 1947, p. 420, n. 122). Thus, even this allegorical *midrash* was not an Islāmic innovation.

26 See above, n. 19. Cf. also Qirqisānī, *op. cit.* (n. 22), p. 953.

27 Related to this is the discussion of whether Moses' shoes were made of tanned or untanned leather, because tanning (*dabgh*) relieves the leather of its impurity (see e.g., al-Jaṣṣāṣ, *Aḥkām al-Qur'ān*, Constantinople 1338 H, III, 219–220; see also Ibn Abī Shaiba, *Muṣannaf*, ed. 'Abd al-Khāliq Afghānī, Hyderabad, 1967, II, pp. 258–59). For these sources, too, I am indebted to my father, Professor M.J. Kister.

it is clearly possible that the influence of the Muslim law of removing one's shoes for prayer is manifest here, as this practice was, by that time, already accepted without any objection in Islām.

Perhaps the comment of Rabbenu Ḥananel (Qairawān, end of the eleventh century), who notes that the Talmud implies that it is not necessary to pray barefoot,²⁸ should be understood in light of the tension between the different customs, which apparently obtained even among the Rabbanites. The unique formulation of Maimonides (Egypt, twelfth century) seems to indicate acceptance of the new custom among the Jews: "One should not stand in prayer wearing his money-belt, or while barefoot, or with exposed feet, if the local custom is to appear before distinguished people only while wearing shoes."²⁹ This statement, which bases the *halakhah* on local, secular custom, attests to the existence of variant customs and to Maimonides' lack of desire to reach a clear-cut decision concerning the matter. Maimonides' formulation might also reflect an attempt to compromise between the *halakhah* of the Babylonian Talmud and the new custom, which was gaining increasingly wide acceptance (see also below). It is noteworthy that his son, R. Abraham Maimonides does not express any preference of praying barefoot,³⁰ although he was very much influenced by the Muslim ritual of prayer (see below). R. Petahya of Regensburg (end of the twelfth century) testifies that the Jews of Babylon prayed barefoot in their synagogues.³¹ (It is almost certain that, at least in Babylonia, this custom was the result of Muslim influence). During the thirteenth century, R. Jacob bar Abba Mari bar Simeon Anatoli (born in Provence, lived in Naples) observed that "in those countries where narrow shoes are worn, they are cleaned before coming [to the synagogue--M.K.] . . . in

28 Above, n. 9.

29 *Mishneh Torah, Hilkhot Tefillah* 5:5.

30 Above, n. 11. See also *op. cit.*, p. 110

31 *Travels of Rabbi Petahia*, ed. and tr. A. Benisch, London 1859, p. 44.

those countries where it is customary to wear sandals and the like [= in the East—M.K.], people remove them from their feet."³² R. Jacob associates this practice with the physical cleanliness required in a holy place and with repentance, and his interpretation is based on the verse "Remove your shoes from your feet" (see above). At the beginning of the fourteenth century, R. Ishtori Ha-Parhi, a Provençal Jew who later settled in Palestine, reports "the custom of [the inhabitants of] these countries to leave their shoes at the entrance of the synagogue, outside, unlike the custom of foreign people" [= the Europeans], and he finds support for this custom in the story found in the *Yerushalmi* cited above.³³

In the fifteenth century, a most interesting piece of evidence appears regarding the development of the Jewish custom in the East, and it is especially significant with regard to the relationship between Judaism and Islam. R. Solomon ben Simeon Duran (North Africa) was asked concerning "a congregation which wished to stipulate that no one be permitted to enter a synagogue wearing shoes, because the Ishmaelites will reproach them for so doing. Furthermore, in that city itself, there is another synagogue, and the worshippers do not enter it wearing shoes. A number of individuals rose and objected,

32 *Malmad Ha-Talmidim*, Lyck 1866, 45a-b. R. Jacob associates this practice with repentance, and even sees fit to note in this connection: "Those nations which seek to liken themselves to us [by following] our upright laws [i.e., the Christians] require penitents to avoid wearing shoes and to wear white clothing." Here we have a further example of the interrelationships between Judaism and the surrounding religions. Apparently, there were Jews in Ashkenaz who used to afflict themselves in this manner. R. Yizhak Or Zaru'a (Vienna, thirteenth century) says: "And in France I saw 'gibborim' (devoted pietists) walking barefoot on the Sabbath even (!) in the synagogue and reading the Torah barefoot, but it is not right to walk barefoot" (*Or Zarū'a Hilkhot Shabbat*, no. 84 [12], Zhitomir 1862, I, 20b). Perhaps it was in opposition to such practices that the *Tosafot* stress that one should not pray barefoot (above, n. 11).

33 Above, n. 15.

stating that Maimonides, of blessed memory, permitted one to enter a synagogue wearing shoes." Here, then, we have evidence of variant customs within the same city, as well as of the desire on the part of the leaders of that community to establish the Muslim custom as authoritative in the synagogue. Rabbi Duran's response is quite illuminating: "It is well known that a synagogue should be adorned and exalted . . . however, respect is (defined as) whatever people consider respectful . . . and in Christian countries, where it is not considered disrespectful for someone to enter even the king's presence while wearing shoes, if someone wears shoes in the synagogue, it is not considered disrespectful. But in these countries, where it is considered disrespectful to enter the presence of distinguished people, and certainly the king, in shoes, it is prohibited to enter the local synagogue wearing shoes. Even though [the synagogue] is not a true sanctuary, it is nevertheless holy . . . Also . . . in these countries, where people are careful <not> to enter their own homes wearing shoes, it is prohibited to enter the synagogue in shoes. And concerning this matter, my master and father, our teacher,³⁴ may he be remembered for eternal life, instituted this decree here, which is suitable for every sensible man. And the fact that such a decree was not instituted by the ancients does not prove that this is permitted . . . Even if there were nothing prohibited about this, it would be proper to institute such a decree, [to prevent] the reproach to our people. And so much the more so that this is prohibited, for the reasons which I have cited."³⁵ Rabbi Duran adopts Maimonides' basic formulation and conception and expands upon it. However, from the end of his responsum it is clear that he was not motivated solely by considerations of conventions, but principally by the desire to

34 I.e., R. Solomon ben Zemaḥ Duran. Perhaps it is worth noting in this connection that he wrote a sharp polemic against Islām, based on verses from the Qur'ān and betraying acquaintance with Arabic literature. See *Magen va-Qeset*, ed. A. Berliner, *Ozar Tov, Hebräische Beilage zum Magazin für die Wissenschaft des Judentums*, Berlin 1881.

35 *Teshuvot Rashbash* [Hebrew], Livorno 1742 section 285.

avoid the reproach of the Muslims.³⁶ Ironically enough, the circuit is thus completed: ancient Islām wished to distance itself from the Jewish custom of praying barefoot, but ultimately this practice was adopted by the Muslims, and later, in other places and periods, the Muslim practice affected Jewish custom! In fact, by now it is difficult to determine what is the result of Muslim influence and what is a continuation of ancient Jewish custom.

This custom apparently continued to gain acceptance, and by the sixteenth century, Rabbi Joseph Karo (lived in Safed) remarks that "custom of all Jews in Arab lands is to pray barefoot."³⁷ At least in some of these countries (e.g., Yemen), this practice is followed to this very day.³⁸

If the requirement that shoes be removed before prayer in the synagogue was unique to the Muslim East, the basic sensitivity to the fact that dirt might cling to a person's shoes and thereby blemish his prayer was also present in Europe. The author of the "Book of the Pious" (*Sefer Hasidim*) notes: "When one goes to the synagogue or the house of study, he must check his feet to make sure that there is no excrement on them, for the Torah says, 'Cast off your shoes from your feet,' and similarly [the Bible states] regarding Joshua. But it does not say, 'Remove your shoes,' for what benefit is there to remove one's shoes, if they remain near him? Therefore it says, 'cast off your shoes from your feet' – i.e., from a distance of four cubits."³⁹

36 The desire to prevent humiliation of the Jewish religion on the part of the Muslims (cf. S.M. Stern *JThs* NS 19 [1968], p. 155, n. 2) by adopting Muslim strictures is already attested during the Geonic period. See Wieder's remarks (above, n. 20), and see also S. Lieberman, *Tashlum Tosefta* (second ed.), Jerusalem 1970, p. 66.

37 *Beit Yosef* on *Ṭur, Oraḥ Ḥayyim*, section 91, s.v. וכתב הרמב"ם. In the *Shulḥan 'Arukh*, section 91, Maimonides' formulation is cited verbatim.

38 See above, n. 12. This practice is followed to this very day among the Karaites (see above on their views) and the Samaritans.

39 *Sefer Hasidim*, ed. J. Wistinetzki and J. Freimann, Frankfurt am Main 1924, p. 127.

We have already seen that R. Jacob bar Abba Mari ben Simeon Anatoli associates this custom, which is motivated by a concern for cleanliness, with that followed by Eastern Jews, even though for different reasons. Later on in Germany, too, in the responsa of Maharam Mintz (15th century),⁴⁰ the concern about dirt is emphasized, and for this reason that scholar ruled that it is forbidden to enter the synagogue wearing boots,⁴¹ "for dirt clings to them . . . even before a human king it is not customary to appear wearing something dirty, and so much the more so before the King of all kings, the Holy One, blessed be He . . . and for this reason there are countries in which people pray only barefoot, without shoes. Now in these areas, it is not customary or acceptable to walk barefoot, and therefore we do not remove our shoes . . ." However, Maharam Mintz rules that boots, which ordinarily get extremely dirty, must be removed.⁴² Here, again, in a different society and for different reasons, we find echoes of the *halakhah* prevalent in the East.

From our discussion of the different customs regarding the removal of shoes for prayer and the history of these customs in Judaism and Islām, we can see the complex and often contradictory relationship between these two religions in the course of their development.

Several additional remarks concerning the Jewish customs mentioned in the preceding article are in order.

Sitting and reclining (*LT*, n. 37) during Jewish prayer are well-known phenomena. It is noteworthy that Rabbi Abraham Maimonides ordained that Jews should sit during prayer the

40 *Teshuvot Maharam Mintz*, Saloniki 1802, 38.

41 He refers to them as "*sandalim*," apparently following the (incorrect) interpretation of Rashbam, *Bava Batra* 58a.

42 See also R. David b. Shmuel ha-Kokhavi (Provence, 13th century), *Sefer Ha-Batim*, ed. M. Hershler, III, Jerusalem 1982, p. 55 and note 807, that it was prohibited to enter the synagogue with nail-studded sandals (*sandal ha-mesummar*), apparently for the same reason. [Compare especially: R. Abraham Maimonides above, n. 29a].

same way the Muslims do. The comfortable, disorganized way in which the Jews sat during prayer in his days seemed unacceptable to him.⁴³ Likewise, regarding conversation during prayer among the Jews, a corrupt practice already mentioned in the *ḥadīth* (LT, n. 45), Wieder⁴⁴ has demonstrated that it was the Muslim view which led to the reform introduced by Maimonides in Jewish prayer. As Maimonides states: "Thus shall be removed the profanation of God's name among the gentiles, [after they saw how] the Jews spit and expectorate (or: blow their noses) and speak during prayer."⁴⁵

The Jewish practice of swaying during prayer is mentioned in medieval Jewish literature.⁴⁶ Apparently, the

43 See N. Wieder (above, n. 20), pp. 93-103, and especially p. 101; see also *ibid.*, pp. 117, 120.

44 *Ibid.*, pp. 55-59.

45 " . . . wa-yartafī'u ḥillūl ha-shēm (Heb.) ladhī ḥašala 'inda l-goyyim (Heb.) bi-anna l-yahūd yabšuqū wa-yamkhotū wa-yataḥaddathū fī tayyi ṣalātihim, li-anna l-amra kadhā yashhadūnahu." (*Teshuvot Ha-Rambam*, ed. J. Blau, Jerusalem 1986, 258, p. 484; 256, p. 475: ". . . alladhī yazunnu binā anna l-ṣalāta 'indanā la'bun wahadhūwun".)

46 R. Abraham ben Nathan of Lunel (d. 1215), *Sefer Ha-Manhig*, ed. Y. Raphael, Jerusalem 1978, 1, p. 85, writes: "I found in the Midrash: A person is required to sway during prayer, for it is written: 'All my bones shall proclaim Thee, O Lord, who is like unto you?' This is also the custom of the rabbis of France and the pious men there." The same remarks are cited by R. Zedekiah ben Abraham (Italy, thirteenth century), *Shibbole ha-Leqet*, ed. S.L. Mirsky, New York 1966, p. 183, from "Ma'aseh Merkavah." See also *Maḥzor Vitry*, ed. S. Horovitz, Nürnberg 1923, section 508, p. 630, on swaying among the Jews while studying Torah (= *Commentary of 'Ba'al Ha-Turim'* on the Torah ed. I.K. Reiniz, Bne-Braq 1971, p. 167 (*ad Ex. 20:15*), and R. Judah Ha-Levi, *Kuzari*, II:79-80. On swaying during prayer see also *Zohar*, III, 218b (judging from the style of the last two sources, they seem to be apologetic). It is noteworthy that the explanation for swaying during the Torah reading cited in *Maḥzor Vitry* and by '*Ba'al Ha-Turim*' appears almost verbatim in a late Arab source cited by Goldziher, *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Sprachgelehrsamkeit bei den Arabern*, I, Wien 1871, p. 27. [= *Gesammelte Schriften*, Hildesheim 1967, p. 31]. On

Muslim testimony is the earliest extant source regarding this ancient practice. In the Arabic sources cited in *LT*, n. 39, mention is made of swaying when the Torah was opened. If this claim is accurate (and the Muslim sources are not referring to swaying while the Torah was read), perhaps the reference is to the ancient custom of bowing down as the Torah was opened: "It is obligatory upon all men and women to look at the writing [in the Torah] and bow down."⁴⁷ Perhaps this bowing appeared to the Muslims as if the Jews were swaying. The practice of closing the eyes during Jewish prayer is first mentioned in Jewish literature,⁴⁸ to the best of my knowledge, in the *Zohar*.⁴⁹

swaying during the *qedushah* prayer see: *Sefer ha-Manhig*, p. 88 and the sources cited there; *Shibbole ha-Leqet*, p. 194. The explanation suggested there for swaying during recitation of the *qedushah* (in the name of "Rabbenu Shlomo") is based on Is. 6:4, "the foundations of the doorposts swayed." It is perhaps worthy of note that this verse is also cited as a source for swaying during prayer in order to attain mystical inspiration--in the wake of the *Šūfi dhikr*--in *Pirqē Hašlaḥa*, erroneously attributed to Maimonides, ed. D.H. Baneth and H.S. Davidowitz, Jerusalem 1939, p. 7.

47 *Tractate Soferim*, ed. M. Higger, p. 261. On this custom, see the remarks of S. Lieberman, *Sheki'in*, Jerusalem 1970, p. 9, and add the following sources to the citation from *Midrash Mishle* appearing there: *Tanḥuma*, ed. Buber, Genesis, p. 81, and n. 236; Z.M. Rabinowitz, *Ginze Midrash*, Tel Aviv 1977, p. 57, line 22. Cf. also the remarks of the Samaritan Marqah (fourth century): "You are the great book before which we have come to bow down" (Z. Ben-Hayyim, *The Literal and Oral Tradition of Hebrew and Aramaic According to the Samaritans* [Hebrew], III/2, Jerusalem 1967, p. 247, and see also *ibid.*, p. 256).

48 However, we do find that people covered their eyes with their hands during recitation of the *Shema'* (according to many interpretations, so as to facilitate concentration): *Berakhot* 13b; see Rashi and Rosh, *ibid.*, and *Tur, Oraḥ Ḥayyim*, section 61).

49 *Zohar*, III, 260b: "One must cover his eyes, so as not to behold the Divine Presence . . . one who opens his eyes during prayer, or who does not lower his eyes to the ground, brings the Angel of Death upon himself . . ." The practice of lowering the eyes is already found in the